1	Response to Editor's comments:
2	
3	Associate Editor Decision: Publish subject to minor revisions (further review by editor) (02 Feb
4	2020) by <u>Catherine Mottram</u>
5	Comments to the Author:
6	Editor comments on Roberts et al., 'LA-ICP-MS U-Pb carbonate geochronology: strategies and progress
7	with examples from fracture-fill calcite'
8	
9	Overall this paper represents a useful updated review on in-situ carbonate geochronology that will be
10	valuable contribution to the community and particularly those new to the application. It provides a
11	thorough introduction to the method, applications and most importantly the limitations, potential pitfalls
12	and matters of potential concern that any future analyst should be aware of.
13	
14	The reviewers were largely supportive of this paper, particularly AKC and the authors have mostly
15	addressed the specific corrections proposed by both reviewers and have presented reasonable responses
16	to reviewers. I am mainly satisfied that these corrections have been made with the following exceptions.
17	
18	There are a few points that the authors have not addressed/ might be worth considering before the
19	manuscript is finalised:
20	
21	1. Troy Rasbury commented "This manuscript is sort of a funny mix of a review and new datasets While
22	it is nominally a review of vein dating, it is not a complete review of what is out there." I very much agree
23	with this opinion and I do not think that the authors have made any corrections to address this criticism.
24	The paper is a mix of review and new data and although a lot of what is presented is very useful, it is not
25	really a review of all previous work, instead is a compilation of all the data reported from the BGS lab.
26	Perhaps the authors could make this clear in the abstract/introduction- or include more examples from the
27	published literature (for instance in figures such as figure 14). Troy also commented "my overall take on
28	the manuscript is that it could be more compactly packaged and could do a better job of reviewing all of
29	the U/Pb dating of vein material- perhaps leaving off discussion of speleothems which is well covered by
30	Woodhead and a laundry list of carbonate characterization techniques that aren't tied to examples." Again,
31	I agree with this statement and I do not think that the authors have addressed this- they have made no
32	attempt to make the manuscript any shorter or more compact. I have two suggestions for how you might
33	achieve this:
34	
35	We appreciate the comments from those not involved the manuscript, since they can provide an unbiased
36	opinion of the paper. We also understand the general feeling gained by the reviewers and editor – that this
37	paper presents a mixture of review and new data. We however, do not feel that a paper should conform to
38	a simple 'research article' or a 'review paper', these distinctions are given to us by the publishers, and

39 should not limit how we want to present science and scientific methodology. But, we appreciate that the

a simple 'research article' or a 'review paper', these distinctions are given to us by the publishers, and

- 40 comments may improve the paper, and thus, we have attempted to improve the paper by shortening
- 41 some aspects, merging some sections, and removing some duplication of text.

Although most of our examples draw from vein material, all of our points of discussion are relevant to all
carbonate types, and thus we have reworded any text to make it clear that this paper applies to all
applications.

45

55

46 Specifically, we have completely redrawn the figure with the imaging techniques, which we feel provides a 47 more useful tableau, and which is better linked to the text. We have merged the three 'examples' of 48 image-guided dating into a single figure, and dramatically reduced the text, removing any unnecessary 49 background information about the samples. We have removed one of the three image-based dating 50 examples. We have removed the figure with the mu values compiled (but added it to the supp file). We 51 have removed the discussion section and expanded the conclusions, and added all the limitations into a 52 single 'limitation' section. This still comes towards the end of the paper, but we stand by our opinion that 53 is only natural to discuss 'the ways doing things', some 'examples of doing things', and then some 54 'nuances when doing those things'.

- 56 Why not review the published literature as a whole? - (1) if we were to swap figure 4 (the isochron good, 57 bad and ugly) for published literature only, then this section would essentially be unpicking other peoples 58 work (not ideal); (2) It would be difficult to draw from the literature for the section on image-guided 59 dating, as there is very little information within the published literature on how some dates may have been 60 refined, selected, interpreted etc. Instead, we have chosen to include unpublished data, such that we can 61 better demonstrate the methods behind refining data with imagery/compositional data; (3) We have 62 included image-based dating examples from veins, as these are complementary to those published by 63 Drost et al on sedimentary carbonates, and are a better comparison with the image-guided examples also 64 on veins.
- 65 Hopefully it should be clear where all the data are drawn from, i.e. literature or our own data.
- 66 67
- a. Section 2- Discussion of ID vs in-situ techniques- although this is of course a very important topic for
 discussion in geochronology much of this discussion has already been covered in other publications
 focused on geochronology methods. I therefore think this text could be shortened. Figure 2 for instance is
 very useful and I think if the text could be focused on these carbonate-specific examples would help
 concentrate the discussion.
- We find that many papers cover the basics of ID versus LA, i.e. the difference in spatial resolution and in precision and accuracy of data, but they do not cover the nuances that make LA so beneficial for carbonates, for example, the ability to hit zones with different U/Pb ratios. We have removed a few sentences that were unnecessary, but overall we have maintained this important section.
- 77 78
- b. Section 8- Troy's comment "The modeling of initial disequilibrium is a very important contribution. Why
 is it so late in the paper?" I agree with this- I think that this section is an important and relatively novel
 contribution to the community, however, it is buried at the end of this very long paper and I worry that it
 will be lost due to this. I think that this would make much more impact if this was taken out and made into
 its own separate manuscript. You could then extend to include details of how to make the corrections with

- 84 worked examples. This would help the reader understand how to make the corrections as well as why they 85 are important. It is up to the authors what to do with this section- I realise that you won't want to make it
- 86 into a separate manuscript, but I just wanted you to know that I think it would be much more widely read
- 87 if you did separate it. Perhaps you could consider adding a worked example as a small addition or refer to

88 an example from the literature?

- 89 We have kept this section in this paper. Why? We feel that we should not be drawn into the routine of 90 splitting papers up into smaller parts, it can be good for metrics, but generally doesn't make great papers. 91 This particular discussion of diseq is rather immature, certainly not the full story and any answers. It is 92 clearly important to point out, but how we tackle the uncertainty of activity ratios, and how we incorporate 93 these uncertainties into age uncertainties, is not clear. This in fact requires a community-led approach, for 94 example as the zircon and U-Th working groups have worked in the past. Thus, we feel this section is 95 merely paving the way for new investigation and appreciation of a problem. Could it be moved forward 96 within the paper?, yes it could come before other sections, but we do not feel 13500 words is a particularly 97 lengthy paper such that readers will not make it to the limitations section.
- In addition, Noah McLean, a co-author, is writing up the equations behind integration of U-Pb and U-Th
 data to incorporate activity ratio measurements which hopefully will make it into the same special issue.
 This paper will be more technical, and as such, we feel the broad discussion in the present paper is best
 staying where it is.
- 102
- 103
- Although the methods are clearly presented in the supplementary material, it is not clear whether the
 primary data for any unpublished examples used by the authors is presented in the Supplementary
- 106 material? Perhaps the authors could include a data table for any unpublished data?
- All unpublished data behind the presented isochrons in the image-guided and image-based sections arenow included in the supplementary files.
- 109
- 110
- 111 I have also made a few suggestions on the attached annotated manuscript.
- 112 We have made some of these suggestion in our shortening.
- 113

114	LA-ICP-MS U-Pb carbonate geochronology: strategies , <u>and</u> progress,
115	and and limitations with examples from application to fracture-fill calcite
116	
117	
118	Nick M W Roberts ¹ , Kerstin Drost ² , Matthew S A Horstwood ¹ , Daniel J Condon ¹ , , David
119	Chew ² , Henrik Drake ³ , Antoni E Milodowski ⁴ , Noah M McLean ⁵ , Andrew J Smye ⁶ , Richard J
120	Walker ⁷ , Richard Haslam ⁴ , Keith Hodson ⁸ , Jonathan Imber ⁹ , Nicolas Beaudoin ¹⁰ , Jack K
121	Lee ⁹
122	
123	¹ Geochronology and Tracers Facility, British Geological Survey, Environmental Science
124	Centre, Nottingham, NG12 5GG, UK
125	² Department of Geology, Trinity College Dublin, Dublin 2, Ireland
126	³ Department of Biology and Environmental Science, Linnaeus University, 39231 Kalmar,
127	Sweden
128	⁴ British Geological Survey, Environmental Science Centre, Nottingham, NG12 5GG, UK
129	⁵ Department of Geology, University of Kansas, Lawrence, KS 66045, USA
130	⁶ Department of Geosciences, Pennsylvania State University, University Park, PA 16802,
131	USA
132	⁷ School of Geography, Geology, and the Environment, University of Leicester, Leicester,
133	LE1 7RH, UK
134	⁸ Department of Earth and Space Sciences, University of Washington, Seattle, WA 98195,
135	USA
136	⁹ Department of Earth Sciences, Durham University, Science Labs, Durham, UK
137	¹⁰ Laboratoire des Fluides Complexes et leurs Réservoirs-IPRA, E2SUPPA, Total, CNRS,
138	Université de Pau et des Pays de l'Adour, UMR5150, Pau, France
139	
140	
141	Words: <u>ca. 13500</u> 14434
142	Figures: 1 <u>5</u> 9
143	Tables: 0
144	References: 13540
145	Supplementary files: 2
146	

149 Abstract

150 Laser Ablation Inductively Coupled Plasma Mass Spectrometry (LA-ICP-MS) U-Pb 151 geochronology of carbonate minerals, calcite in particular, is rapidly gaining popularity as 152 an absolute dating method. The technique has proven useful for dating fracture-fill calcite, 53 which provides a powerful record of palaeohydrology, and within certain constraints, can be 54 used to bracket the timing of brittle fracture and fault development. The high spatial 55 resolution of LA-ICP-MS U-Pb carbonate geochronology hasis benefitscial over traditional 156 Isotope Dilution methods, particularly for diagenetic and hydrothermal calcite, because 157 uranium and lead are heterogeneously distributed on the sub-mm scale. At the same time, 158 this can provide limitations to the method, as locating zones of radiogenic lead can be time-159 consuming and 'hit or miss'. Here, we present strategies for dating carbonates with in situ 60 techniques, through imaging and petrographic techniques to data interpretation; our; we 61 focus on examples are drawn from dating of of fracture-filling calcite, but most of our 62 discussion is relevant to all carbonate applications. We demonstrate these strategies 63 through a series of case studies. We review several limitations to the method, including 164 open system behaviour, variable initial lead compositions, and U-daughter disequilibrium. 165 We also discuss two approaches to data collection: traditional spot analyses guided by 166 petrographic and elemental imaging, and image-based dating that utilises LA-ICP-MS 167 elemental and isotopic map data.

- 168
- 169

170 **1. Introduction**

171 Calcite (CaCO₃), along with other carbonate minerals (e.g. aragonite, dolomite, magnesite), 172 forms in a wide variety of geological environments as both a primary and secondary mineral 173 phase, including diagenetic, biogenic, igneous, metamorphic and hydrothermal 174 environments. Calcite can incorporate uranium upon its formation, making it a potentially 175 suitable chronometer for U-Pb and U-Th geochronology. Calcite geochronology therefore 176 has the potential to provide direct timing constraints to a broad suite of geoscience 177 applications. Calcite has been dated in the past by chemical dissolution and isotope dilution 178 (ID) with measurement by either Thermal Ionisation Mass Spectrometry (TIMS) or 179 Inductively Coupled Plasma Mass Spectrometry (ICP-MS) (e.g. Smith and Farquhar, 1989; 180 DeWolf and Halliday, 1991; Brannon et al., 1996; Rasbury et al., 1997; Richards et al., 181 1998; Woodhead et al., 2006; Pickering et al., 2010), collectively referred to here simply as

- 182 Isotope Dilution (ID). More recently, there has been a proliferation in the use of laser
- ablation (LA-) ICP-MS applied to calcite geochronology (Li et al., 2014; Coogan et al., 2016;
- 184 Roberts & Walker, 2016, Ring & Gerdes, 2016; Methner et al., 2016; Goodfellow et al.,
- 185 2017; Burisch et al., 2017, 2018; Drake et al., 2017, <u>2019, 2020;</u> Hansman et al., 2017;
- Hellwig et al., 2018; Godeau et al., 2017; Beaudoin et al., 2018; Drost et al., 2018;
- 187 Mangenot et al., 2018; <u>Nicholson et al., 2020;</u> Nuriel et al., 2017, 2019; Parrish et al., 2018;
- Walter et al., 2018; Yokoyama et al., 2018; Smeraglia et al., 2019; Holdsworth et al., 2019;
- 189 MacDonald et al., 2019; Scardia et al., 2019). Presently, we are not aware of successful
- 190 secondary ion mass spectrometry (SIMS) U-Pb dating of carbonate mineralisation, but this
- 191 presents an alternative microbeam method to LA-ICP-MS.
- 192

193 The first review of the possibilities for carbonate geochronology was published by Jahn & 194 Cuvellier (1984), and this was substantially updated by Rasbury & Cole (2009). The latter 195 provided up-to-date discussion on U-Pb isotope systematics in carbonates, particularly 196 regarding Pb-Pb and U-Pb isochron methods, as well as a review of the applications to 197 date. At that time, both marine- (e.g. limestone, dolomite) and meteoric-water sourced 198 carbonates (e.g. speleothems and tufas) had received the most attention, due to their often-199 favourable uranium contents, and studies of hydrothermal carbonate were scarce (e.g. 200 Brannon et al., 1996; Grandia et al., 2000). U-Pb dating of speleothems has been further 201 reviewed by Woodhead et al. (2006 and 2012), again, focussing on data generated by ID, 202 and more recently Woodhead and Petrus (2020) discuss the use of LA-ICP-MS for 203 speleothem dating.-

204

205 Now that microbeam (i.e. LA-ICP-MS and SIMS) U-Pb geochronology is proving to be a 206 useful method for a range of geoscience applications, it is pertinent to address what can be achieved with the method, what the current limitations are, and where improvements can be 207 208 made in the future. We refer to LA-ICP-MS through the rest of this paper, but acknowledge 209 that nearly all of the points we cover are equally relevant to SIMS methods. The key benefit 210 to LA-ICP-MS dating is that its high spatial resolution can be used to relate U-Pb and other 211 geochemical analyses to imaged textures. This is critical for providing context to the 212 obtained dates. Carbonate materials are heterogeneous in composition elementally, 213 isotopically, and texturally. These factors can all lead to scatter in U-Pb data, and will often 214 hinder the ability to generate high precision (i.e. $<1\% 2\sigma$) U-Pb dates. In fact, after 215 propagation of all relevant uncertainties, final LA-ICP-MS U-Pb dates typically exceed 3%

- precision (2σ). For this reason, LA-ICP-MS carbonate U-Pb geochronology is particularly
 suited for applications in tectonics and crustal fluid-flow, but commonly less suited for
 applications in stratigraphy and palaeoclimate.
- 219

220 Here we present a review of LA-ICP-MS U-Pb carbonate geochronology, focusing on its 221 benefits, and application and limitations. We pay, with particular attention to hydrothermal 222 and diagenetic vein-filling carbonates; these can constrain the ages of mineral systems, 223 crustal deformation and fluid-flow, and represent a significant growth area for this method. 224 Using several case studies, we highlight the utility of image-guided analysis, where various 225 imaging techniques provide critical context for interpreting U-Pb data. We also provide case 226 studies for an age-mapping technique that is an alternative to traditional static spot ablation, 227 and can be used in combination with sample imagery to generate U-Pb age data. Finally, 228 we highlight issues surrounding initial lead compositions, initial disequilibrium in the U-Pb 229 system and open-system behaviour.

230

231 2. LA vs ID strategies

232 Geochronology by ID provides the most accurate assessment of the U-Pb age of a sample, 233 through use of -using calibrated isotopic tracer solutions, but it is time-consuming and 234 requires a clean laboratory facility for sample dissolution and column chemistry. The spatial 235 resolution of ID is typically much lower than that offered by microbeam techniques, although resolution can be increased by using a high precision micro-drill for direct sampling. A major 236 237 limiting factor is that carbonate materials typically have very low U concentrations (ca. 10 238 ppb to 10 ppm U) compared with traditional U-bearing accessory minerals (e.g., often >100 239 ppm U in zircon). This means that samples with low Pb concentrations yield higher 240 blank/sample ratios, hindering the accuracy and precision of the resulting data, and 241 secondly that the : 1) comparatively large volumes of material are needed for ID analyses resulting in an 'averaging' effect and reduction of spread in U/Pb space., and 2) samples 242 243 with lower Pb concentrations yield higher blank/sample ratios, hindering the accuracy and 244 precision of the resulting data.

245

LA-ICP-MS is a much quicker technique than ID, and therefore less expensive per analysis.
Several samples can be run in a single day, meaning the technique is ideal for screening of
large sample sets to find the most suitable material. The effect of blanks <u>sourced from</u>

dissolution and chemical purification is negated, and very low (<100 ppb) Pb contents can
be analysed. However, LA-ICPMS is generally less precise analytically compared to ID
approaches. Another major limitation is the need to normalise to a matrix-matched
reference material. This means that the uncertainty of the reference material becomes a
limiting uncertainty, and matrix effects between materials of different composition will
generate scatter and/or bias in the U-Pb dates that are difficult to correct for.

255

256 The biggest benefit of LA-ICP-MS comes from the spatial resolution (less than ca. 100 μ m) 257 at which data can be obtained, particularly given the length scales of uranium concentration 258 heterogeneity in carbonate. We find that for hydrothermal and diagenetic calcite in 259 particular, uranium is heterogeneously distributed across veins and vein phases, and within 260 individual crystals (see Figure 1). Uranium concentration heterogeneity typically spans 1 to 261 3 orders of magnitude, with the length-scale of this variation being commonly much less 262 than 1 mm. Targeting of high U domains is therefore difficult without a high spatial-263 resolution sampling method. Intracrystalline uranium distributions within calcite define 264 several patterns (see Figure 1): concentrated along cleavage planes (Aa), growth-zone 265 controlled (cC, dD and fE), concentrated towards grain rims (areas of Bb and eE), and with 266 apparent disorder (areas of bB and eE). Laser ablation has the spatial resolution capable of 267 targeting such elemental (and isotopic) zonation, making it easier to avoid distinguishable 268 alteration zones and inclusions at the 10-100 $\mu_{\rm H}$ m scale.



Figure 1. Maps of uranium in vein-filling calcite from a range of geological
settings showing varying styles of distribution, see text for explanation.
<u>Maximum concentration (yellow) is shown below each map;</u> -(brighter = higher
concentration). Maps were generated using LA-ICP-MS trace element analyses
and the lolite data reduction software. Scale bars are is 1 mm.

278

279

280 For minerals such as zircon, U-Pb ID-TIMS is considered the gold standard of 281 geochronological techniques (Renne et al., 1998). It offers significantly greater accuracy 282 than microbeam techniques by virtue of the use of gravimetrically quantified isotopic spikes, 283 and generally higher detection efficiencies. ID-TIMS does, however, consume greater 284 amounts of material. With ID methods, ages are calculated by absolute determination of the 285 number of atoms of each isotope in the sample material. In contrast, microbeam techniques 286 are relative methods, using ratio normalisation against reference minerals of known 287 composition (generally determined by ID methods). 288

289

For common-lead bearing minerals such as calcite, the extreme range in parent/daughter ratios encountered (quoted here as 238 U divided by initial lead as 204 Pb; a ratio known as μ), 292 means that ID does not always lead to an improvement in precision on the regressed age. 293 This is demonstrated by the schematic model in Figure 2. Sampling for ID provides an 294 average of elemental and isotopic zonation within the analytical volume, perhaps >1 mm³, 295 depending on the concentration of U and Pb within the crystal(s). The resulting data should 296 be precise (depending on the sample/blank ratios), but may potentially have a small spread in parent/daughter ratios (i.e. ²³⁸U/²⁰⁶Pb) due to the averaging effect during sampling. In 297 298 contrast, LA sampling has the potential to target and utilise such zonation, better resolving end-member μ compositions, and resulting in analyses with a greater spread in ²³⁸U/²⁰⁶Pb 299 300 ratios. This potentially improves the resolving power of a regression of the measured 301 isotopic ratios allowing definition of, ideally, the high-µ (radiogenic lead) and low-µ (initial 302 lead) end-member compositions of the data array (see Figure 2). Along with the generally 303 high-*n* datasets generated by the LA-ICP-MS approach, these well-constrained regressions 304 can result in similar or even greater precision for ²⁰⁶Pb/²³⁸U ages determinations than those 305 using ID data alone. However, a caveat to this, is that lower precision data points can mask 306 true geological heterogeneity. 307





Figure 2. (Aa) Example Tera-Wasserburg Concordia plot demonstrating the functionality of this plot for common-lead bearing U-Pb data. (bB) Schematic model of a calcite crystal with uranium zonation indicated by the colour-scale. Typical relative sample size for low U (<1 ppm) ID shown by the black squares, and LA-ICP-MS by the circles. ($c \in$) Resultant U-Pb data in Tera-Wasserburg concordia assuming constant Pb concentration across the sample, and varying U concentration, for LA-ICP-MS sampling and analyses versus 'bulk' sampling and ID analyses, as represented by the sampling in B. The uncertaintiesnty on the datapoints areis 24-36% (2s) for LA-ICP-MS and ~0.85-0.7% for ID.

323 When calculating an age and uncertainty from a regression/isochron, it is assumed that: 1) 324 the dataset describes a single age population whose variability or scatter is derived solely 325 from the analytical process, 2) each analysis represents a closed system, and 3) all 326 analyses share the same initial Pb isotope composition. When these assumptions are 327 satisfied, the MSWD should be about 1 (Mean Squared Weighted Deviation; Wendt and 328 Carl, 1991). LA-ICP-MS data-points generally have a lower precision than those derived by 329 ID. These lower precision data-points can mask scatter that exists within the level of the 330 data-point uncertainties. This caveat must be considered when interpreting regressed data 331 (or weighted means).

333 **3.** In other words, age interpretations rely on isochron assumptions that can only be 334 resolved at the level of the data-point uncertainties. More precise ID data, therefore, have 335 better resolution of scatter and better constrain the likelihood that a sample does not 336 comprise a single population. However, sampling for ID can also contribute to this scatter 337 by analysing larger amounts of material, with a greater chance of including altered zones or 338 zones from different generations. - A combination of ID and image-guided LA methods can 339 therefore better elucidate the likely variability in any particular sample. For applications 340 where the best possible precision is needed (e.g. for stratigraphic constraints or 341 charatcterisationcharacterisation of potential U-Pb carbonate reference materials), a 342 workflow involving both LA-ICP-MS dating followed by ID on the most favourable material is 343 likely to be the most effective. For applications where the required precision is on the order 344 of several percent, image-guided LA-ICP-MS without ID is suitable.

345 346

4.

332

347 **5.3.** Identifying suitable carbonate material for dating

348 <u>5.1.3.1</u> µ (²³⁸U/²⁰⁴Pb) in carbonate

An 'ideal' U-Pb chronometer requires incorporation of U (the parent isotopes 238 U and 235 U which decay to 206 Pb and 207 Pb respectively), and zero or low concentrations of initial (or 'common') Pb during its formation; this is typically expressed as the ratio of parent uranium to initial Pb - 238 U/ 204 Pb, or μ . In addition, both the parent and daughter isotopes ideally remain a closed system from formation until present-day. Many chronometers lack these ideal criteria but still provide successful materials for dating: the subset of 'common-lead bearing chronometers' comprise small to large initial lead concentrations that are of uniform

composition (e.g. titanite, apatite). The ideal criteria are generally rare in carbonates, but
many carbonate materials from a range of different geological environments are successful
common-lead bearing chronometers.

359

360 Rasbury and Cole (2009) showed that carbonates of meteoric origin have the highest µ 361 values, and hydrothermal varieties the lowest, with marine varieties in the middle (see 362 Supplementary Figure S1)Figure. 3A-C). However, the recent literaturee on calcite dating 363 demonstrates that with careful characterisation and sampling, high µ domains can be found 364 in a range of hydrothermal and diagenetic calcite. As an example, we plot the range of μ values recorded in very low-U (<200 ppb) and low-Pb (<20 ppb) calcite taken from basalt-365 hosted fractures in the Faroe Islands (Figure. 3D). The range of mean µ values across the 366 367 fifteen samples is very large (ca. 100 to 100,000), and the range within each sample is also 368 commonly two to four orders of magnitude. Of the samples providing successful U-Pb 369 isochron ages (Roberts & Walker, 2016), µ values extend to as low as ~2000.



Figure 3. A-C) Compilation of μ (²³⁸U/²⁰⁴Pb) values taken from Rasbury & Cole (2009).
Each bar is the range exhibited by an individual sample. These data were acquired using
sampling by physical separation, i.e. a dental drill. D) Compilation of μ values from basalthosted vein-filling calcite in the Faroe Islands to highlight the range within crystals and
across a single region; each datapoint represents the median, and the bar represents the
range. These data represent laser ablation sampling.

- 378
- 379

The amount of U needed to generate an age is dependent on two factors: (1) the age of the material and (2) the initial μ ratio of the material. The younger a sample is, the less time there is for the growth of radiogenic daughter Pb from parent U. With a higher μ , the ratio of measured radiogenic Pb to common (initial) Pb will be higher, giving greater confidence and (in general) precision and accuracy to the resulting age determination.

385

386 The effect of these factors is shown in Figure 43. Two Tera-Wasserburg plots are shown, 387 with isochrons for samples of different ages (100 to 10 Ma on the left, 1000 to 100 Ma on 388 the right). The most accurate and precise age determinations, i.e. those that can be 389 interpreted with most confidence, are generated when the sample comprises abundant 390 radiogenic lead, i.e. gets close to the lower part of the concordia curve where the 391 regression intercepts. Each plot shows regressions for individual samples between a 392 common-lead composition (~0.8) and a radiogenic end-member (with the age labelled). The 393 colour-coded points along each regression reflect the amount of radiogenic lead that will be 394 created by decay of ²³⁸U, based upon the given µ value. For example, utilising the left plot, a sample of 15 Ma, with a μ of 10,000, will have a measured ²⁰⁷Pb/²⁰⁶Pb of ~0.4, equalling 395 396 about a 50:50 ratio between radiogenic and initial lead. To get a near concordant 397 measurement of this sample would require a μ value of over 200,000. These plots 398 demonstrate that when simply regarding the abundance of radiogenic lead, how-older 399 samples are more amenable to dating than those young in age, at least when regarding the abundance of radiogenic lead. . The preservation of a closed isotopic system over long time 400 401 periods is what makes dating old samples (i.e. Precambrian materials) potentially difficult. 402





406 Figure 3-4. Tera-Wasserburg plots showing modelled regressions for samples of different 407 age. Colour-coded spots relate to the measured isotope composition a sample would have 408 at a given µ value (legend above). Ages of each regression in Ma are labelled adjacent to 409 the lower intercept with concordia.

410 411

412 When absent of concordant analyses, both high μ and a significant spread in initial μ values 413 are required to generate the most robust ages, as these will pin the isochron at the 414 radiogenic end-member with greater confidence. Some calcite exhibits sufficiently high µ to 415 generate concordant data (e.g. Richards et al., 1998; Roberts & Walker, 2016; Nuriel et al., 416 2017); -these ages do not heavily rely on the composition of the common lead end-417 member, S but such robust ages are rare with a material that so commonly exhibits high 418 initial lead abundances. Ages can be derived from isochrons with low amounts of 419 radiogenic lead, i.e. those with low µ. Such isochrons can be regressed to provide lower 420 intercept ages, but the confidence in these ages is subject to having well-behaved data 421 conforming to a single population, requiring precise data-point uncertainties (e.g. Figure 422 45Gg). Such low µ isochrons can potentially give imprecise and even inaccurate lower 423 intercept ages if the material is very young, and thus confirmation through multiple samples 424 and/or alternative age constraints are favoured.

- 425
- In Figure <u>54</u>, we present a selection of 'real-world' data to highlight the potential complexity
- 427 of carbonate U-Pb data. These data from natural samples broadly range from undesirable
 428 to most desirable from aA to li, with the following notable characteristics:
- 429 (aA) Dominated by common lead with large data-point uncertainties (due to low count-
- rates) that hamper the distinction between open-system behaviour and radiogenic ingrowthof lead.
- 432 (bB) All analyses are ca. 100% common lead, with high count-rates providing a precise
 433 measurement of the composition of this common lead.
- 434 (<u>c</u>C) Mixed and scattered data that do not fall on a single linear isochron. This is likely 435 caused by open system behaviour, potentially involving both addition and subtraction of 436 parent ²³⁸U.
- 437 (dĐ) Majority of data define a linear array with a large spread in U/Pb ratios. Some other
 438 analyses fall on a horizontal array, suggesting they experienced open-system behaviour
 439 (e.g., local ²³⁸U mobility).
- 440 (eE) Data form an apparent single linear array, but large uncertainties (due to low count441 rates) may obscure mixed ages or minor open-system behaviour.
- 442 (<u>(</u>**F**) Dominated by relatively radiogenic isotopic compositions, but with large data point
- 443 uncertainties due to low count-rates. The narrow range in µ leads to a large age uncertainty
- from extrapolating to the lower concordia intercept. The age uncertainty would be improved
 with a common lead composition estimated from contemporaneous low-µ samples of the
 same suite.
- 447 (gG) A short isochron, termed a 'small scale isochron' by (see Ring & Gerdes (, 2016).
- 448 There are no radiogenic isotopic compositions to anchor the extrapolation to a lower
- intercept concordia date, but a tight data array yields a realistic intercept age.
- 450 (<u>h</u>H) Dominated by radiogenic isotopic compositions, and the spread in the array provides a
- 451 precise lower intercept date; small data-point uncertainties improve ability to identify452 potential outliers.
- 453 (ii) A precise regression due to well-behaved closed system behaviour, high count rates
 454 giving small uncertainties, and a large spread in U/Pb ratios providing a precise estimate of
 455 both the age and the common lead isotopic composition.
- 456





- 459

Figure 54. Tera-Wasserburg concordia plots of natural carbonate samples from a variety of 460 461 settings, with no data rejection. Lower intercept dates are guoted without propagation of 462 systematic uncertainties. See text for explanation.

463 464

465 5.2.3.2. U and Pb contents in carbonate

466 At present, there is a lack of predictive criteria that can be used in the field or in the 467 laboratory to screen samples prior to analysis for high µ domains. Radionuclide 468 incorporation in calcite is not well understood despite several decades of interest, primarily 469 driven by the field of nuclear waste storage and characterisation (e.g. Langmuir, 1978; 470 Milton & Brown, 1987; Sturchio et al., 1998; Reeder et al., 2000, 2001; Kelly et al., 2003;

471 Weremeichik et al., 2017; Drake et al., 2018). This is because trace element incorporation

472 in calcite does not rely on thermodynamically determined partition coefficients, but by a 473 large number of phenomenological variables, including: trace element availability, calcite 474 growth rate, temperature, pH, Eh, pCO₂ and the Ca²⁺:CO₃²⁻ ratio in solution, ionic size, and 475 U complexation. Furthermore, different trace elements can be preferentially incorporated 476 into structurally different growth steps and faces of growing calcite crystals (Paquette and 477 Reeder, 1995; Reeder, 1996).

478

479 Rasbury and Cole (2009) provided a geochronology-focused review of U and Pb in calcite, 480 and we note the following salient features: 1) Pb is both particle reactive and relatively 481 insoluble; 2) Pb is found at very low levels in most fluids (ppt-ppb), providing high Ca/Pb 482 ratios; 3) Pb can substitute for Ca in the crystal lattice, although the Pb cation is larger -483 ionic radii of Ca²⁺ and Pb²⁺ in six-fold coordination are 114 and 133 pm, respectively; 4) U 484 exists in multiple oxidation states, and its solubility is strongly affected by Eh and pH; and 5) 485 both U(VI) and U(IV) states have been found in calcite, but not with both states together in 486 the same sample.with the latter being interpreted as the most likely and most stable form.

487

488 Points 4 and 5 above are important for understanding why and when uranium is 489 incorporated into calcite, and whether remobilisation is likely. Sturchio et al. (1998), using a 490 combination of X-ray absorption spectroscopy and X-ray microprobe fluorescence, 491 demonstrated that the uranium in a sample of spar calcite was in the form of U(IV), and that 492 U(VI) was less likely based on size and ionic structure (ionic radii of U(IV) and U(VI) in six-493 fold coordination are 103 and 93 pm, respectively). Given that U(IV) is less mobile than 494 U(VI), this study provided important support for U-daughter geochronology. Kelly et al. 495 (2003) however, found that U(VI) as uranyl (UO_2^{2+}) was the dominant species in a natural 496 sample of vein calcite, which they considered to be more representative of typical low-U 497 material than the Sturchio sample. Drake et al. (2018) found much higher concentrations of 498 uranium in calcite precipitated from deep anoxic groundwater than experimental 499 determinations that were performed in oxic conditions, and interpreted this high uranium 500 uptake as due to incorporation of U(IV) and thus that the partition coefficient for U(IV) in 501 these environmental conditions is orders of magnitude larger than for U(VI). It is evident 502 that more data from natural carbonates in different settings are needed to more fully 503 understand the controls on U and Pb incorporation.

504

505 We have compiled uranium and lead concentration data from carbonates analysed in the 506 BGS laboratory over several years (Figure <u>56</u>). From our data, we see that median U<u>and</u>

507 /Pbtotal concentrations are 1.9 and 0.003 ppm, respectively. Diagenetic carbonate has the 508 second highest median uranium content (0.4 ppm), but also has high Pb content (0.35 509 ppm). Veins in both terrestrial and Mid-Ocean Ridge settings have low U and Pb contents, 510 with median values well below 100 ppb for both. Biogenic samples, although a smaller 511 dataset, have low contents of U and Pb, generally lower than diagenetic material. ratios for 512 speleothems are ~500, whereas median values for Mid-Ocean Ridge (MOR) and 513 continental vein calcite are 8.2 and 2.6, respectively. Note that this compilation 514 presentsthese are total Pb contents, and includes radiogenic Pb as well as initial Pb, which 515 causes the short linear trends that represent individual samples. The Samples in Figure 56 516 are mostly younger than 200 Ma, or < 4 Ma for the speleothems. The concentration data 517 and U/Pb ratios demonstrate that speleothems in general are much more amenable to U-518 Pb geochronology, which is why they have been the main focus for this method until the 519 last few years. Dating diagenetic and vein-fill calcite, with more variable and lower contents 520 of U, and higher contents of Pb, hasve a lower chance of success than speleothems 521 (although it should be noted that the speleothems in general have already been visually 522 pre-screened during sampling). 523



25



\$26

Figure 65. Uranium and total lead contents of various carbonate materials, plotted as 2D
Kernel Density Estimates, -based on a compilation of laser ablation spot data from the
British Geological Survey lab over several years. A) Compilation of biogenic carbonates,
mostly from corals; B) Speleothem carbonates; C) Veins hosted within mid-ocean ridge
oceanic crust; and D) veins hosted within a range of lithologies Median values for high and
low common-lead bearing U-Pb geochronometers, apatite and zircon, are shown for
comparison. from the upper continental crust, from both outcrop and borehole samples.

- 534
- 535

Ideally, a predictive framework could be constructed to aid field sampling and laboratorybased sub-sampling of carbonate material for geochronological analyses. However, given
the large number of variables controlling U and Pb in carbonate, it is unlikely that such a
tool can be developed without measuring a large number of parameters in the
mineralising/diagenetic system. Relevant information might include the redox history of the

541 system. For example, oxidising fluids may mobilise U as U(VI), which is soluble in hydrous 542 fluids, leading to U loss during fluid-mineral interaction. Conversely, U may undergo much 543 higher precipitation into the mineral phase at redox fronts representing reducing conditions, 544 since reduced U(IV) has lower solubility. Other pertinent information for predicting success 545 includes the nature of the host rock and the source of the fluids. For example, if the 546 mineralising fluids transmit through Pb-rich units, then an undesirable enrichment in the 547 fluid Pb/Ca <u>may potentially would</u> take place, leading to lower initial ²³⁸U/²⁰⁴Pb.

548

549 The complex nature of trace element uptake, including Pb and U, in carbonate 550 mineralisation is exemplified by recent studies in hydrothermal settings. Fracture 551 mineralisation in the crystalline basement of southern Sweden has been investigated 552 extensively to evaluate potential geological nuclear waste repository facilities. Several 553 studies have shown that most trace element concentrations vary over an order of 554 magnitude within calcite samples (at the thin section scale), and up to several orders of 555 magnitude across individual fractures (Drake et al., 2012, 2014; Maskenskaya et al., 2014; 556 Milodowski et al., 2018). These authors suggest that: 1) trace element chemistry does not 557 trace the source rock of the metals; 2) the co-variation of most trace elements implies 558 changing metal/Ca ratios in the fracture waters; and 3) in-situ factors affect trace element 559 incorporation, such as microbial activity, metal speciation, crystal habit, water type and co-560 precipitation of other phases such as barite and pyrite.- Our own experience of vein-filling 561 fractures matches these previous studies, as shown for example by the basalt-hosted **5**62 calcite in the Faroe Islands (see Figure 97).

563

564 **6.4.** Sample screening, imaging and petrography

565 As discussed above, it is difficult to predict which carbonate samples are most suitable for 566 U-Pb geochronology. We therefore utilise several methods to screen material, with the aim 567 of limiting the time wasted on unsuitable samples, improving the quality of data that is 568 collected, and enhancing the overall efficacy of LA-ICP-MS U-Pb carbonate geochronology. 569 The purpose of sample imaging is two-fold: it provides important spatial characterisation of 570 U and Pb within the sample and also provides the petrographic and compositional context 571 to assess mineral growth mechanisms and alteration textures that are critical for linking 572 dates to processes.

574 <u>6.1.4.1.</u> Non-destructive techniques

575 A range of non-destructive imaging techniques is are available for sample imaging (see 576 Figure 76), including optical microscopy, cathodoluminescence (CL), back-scattered 577 electron imaging (BSE), charge-contrast imaging (CCI), and etch-track or digital 578 autoradiography techniques. Both reflected light and transmitted light are excellent tools for 579 characterising carbonate minerals; the latter being the mainstay of all petrographic analysis. 580 Features which are usefully distinguished in transmitted light include twinning planes, fluid 581 inclusions and grain boundaries (see Figure 6e). Reflected light is a particularly useful 582 technique for characterising carbonates in polished blocks, when thin sections are not 583 available, and also highlights crystal boundaries, and contrasts between different mineral 584 faces (see Figure 6a and 6b). 585 586 The latter, in particular storage-phosphor imaging plate autoradiography and direct beta-587 imaging autoradiography, have been documented previously and are established

588 techniques for meteoric carbonates such as speleothems (e.g. Cole et al., 2003; Woodhead 589 et al., 2012). In carbonate minerals, CL intensity is related to trace element contents but not 590 specifically U concentration. CL brightness is generally ascribed to a number of emitters, 591 with Mn²⁺ being the most dominant luminescence activator and Fe²⁺ being the dominant luminescence quencher in calcite and dolomite (e.g. Machel, 1985, 2000; Savard et al., 592 1995), although rare earth elements (REE) such as Eu²⁺, Eu³⁺, Dy³⁺, Sm³⁺ and Tb³⁺ along 593 594 with Pb²⁺ may also activate luminescence in some cases (Richter et al., 2003). Despite not 595 being directly related to U, the very high spatial resolution of CL is useful for identifying µm-**5**96 scale calcite crystal growth zonation and alteration (Figure 7a and 7b), and for 597 characterising different mineral generations formed from different fluids (e.g. Barnaby & 598 Rimstidt, 1989; Tullborg et al., 2008; Milodowski et al., 2018).

599

BSE imaging (see Figure 6c and 6d) also does not correlate directly to trace concentrations of <u>uranium</u>, but to the mean atomic number of the mineral. It is useful as an imaging tool for characterising zonation, alteration and growth patterns, although we note that the contrast in zonation largely reflects variations in major element composition, and as such it is typically less sensitive than with-CL. Ukar & Laubach (2016) provide a recent review of high-spatial resolution SEM-based imaging of vein-filling calcite mineralisation.

607 CCI under the SEM directly images differences in dielectric properties, which produce 608 charge or conductivity contrasts in the near-surface of the sample that are detected by the 609 secondary electron emission, and may reflect compositional variations or strain induced by 610 deformation (Watt et al., 2000; Robertson et al., 2005). It is an underutilised method for 611 geological materials, a Although the exact origin of charge-contrast is poorly understood, 612 However, it can provide useful information on crystal growth, compositional zoning and 613 microstructural features (see Figure 6a). It is an underutilised method for geological 614 materials, and has been, and CCI has previously been applied to garnet (Cuthbert & 615 Buckman, 2005), feldspar (Flude et al., 2012), limestone (Buckman et al., 2016) and 616 biogenic calcite (Lee et al., 2008). The technique requires very clean and carefully-prepared 617 and polished sample surfaces because it is sensitive to surface contamination and 618 mechanical defects, and imaging needs to be undertaken on uncoated samples under low-

619

vacuum conditions.

620

621 In addition to the microscopy-based methods listed above, a lower resolution but potentially 622 useful technique is provided by storage-phosphor imaging-plate (IP) autoradiography using 623 a plastic support film coated with a photostimulated phosphor (BaFBr:Eu²⁺) (Hareyama et 624 al., 2000). This technique records an image of the spatial distribution and intensity of total 625 radioactivity (from alpha, beta and gamma emitters) from a flat sample surface. In natural 626 geological materials, IP radiography records radioactivity from U, Th (and their radioactive 627 daughters), ⁸⁷Rb, and ⁴⁰K (Hareyama et al., 2000; Cole et al., 2003). Although U is not 628 specifically discriminated, it has been shown to be a useful screening tool for finding U-629 bearing domains in carbonate materials (Cole et al., 2005; see Figure 6f). The method has 630 been particularly applied to speleothem studies where its large sample-size capabilities (up 631 to at least 40 cm) are beneficial. Spatial resolution is a few tens of micrometres, depending 632 on the pixel size of the laser scanner. However, the detection limit depends on the 633 exposure time of the IP in direct contact with the sample surface: routinely this is around 634 14-28 days giving a detection limit of a few ppm U, which is typically higher than many 635 carbonate samples. Whilst this may be suitable for speleothems, which typically have 636 higher uranium concentrations, we do not regularly adopt the method for very low U 637 contents in vein-filling or diagenetic carbonates.

638

Fluorescence imaging has long been used in defining and characterising growth fabrics inspeleothems, although it does not specifically identify U-rich regions. This usually involves

641 irradiating a sliced sample with UV-light and observing the excited fluorescence emission at 642 a longer (visible light) wavelength, using either a standard UV microscope or digital 643 scanning with a UV laser system (e.g. Shopov et al., 1994; Baker et al., 1995; 2008; 644 Perrette et al., 2005). Fine growth detail with spatial resolutions of between 50 to 100 µm 645 are achievable. Speleothem fluorescence under UV at excitation wavelengths of 300-420 646 nm is dominated by the intrinsic fluorescence of natural high molecular weight and aromatic 647 organic ("humic" and "fulvic") compounds, with emission between 400-480 nm (Baker et al., 648 2008). However, we have also successfully imaged speleothems (see Figure 67f) and other 649 geological materials (Field et al., 2019) by direct laser-stimulated scanning fluorescence 650 imaging (LSSFI) using 635 nm (red) and 450 nm (blue) wavelength excitation with 650 nm 651 and 520 nm low-pass wavelength filters, respectively. Although, such equipment is 652 principally applied to imaging of biological materials labelled with organic fluorescent dyes 653 (fluorochromes) (e.g. fluorescein), it is able to image variations in fluorescence originating 654 from organic laminae and subtle differences between carbonate minerals (calcite, 655 aragonite), revealing microtextural details with a resolution of about 100 µmmicrometres. 656







Figure 7<u>6</u>. Example imagery from the range of techniques used for sample screening and
characterisation. (a) mudstone-hosted vein calcite; (b) mudstone-hosted vein calcite; (c)
carbonate concretion-hosted calcite vein; (d) individual calcite crystals grown in a fracture
within crystalline bedrock; (e) calcite vein and cement within sediment-fill of an open
<u>fracture; (f) cave speleothem.</u>

665

666

667 <u>6.2.4.2.</u> Destructive techniques

668 Several approaches for destructive sample screening using LA-ICP-MS are available. 669 These can include either systematic or non-systematic (random) spot traverses across 670 carbonate samples, and can include full analyses (i.e. a 30 second ablation following a pre-671 ablation) or a much shorter analysis time (with or without pre-ablation). We commonly adopt 672 systematic traverses across samples utilising shorter ablation times but including a pre-673 ablation, so as to avoid common Pb from the surface. This is a quick way to determine with 674 reasonable precision and accuracy whether a sample is a single age population that 675 represents a closed isotopic system with a suitable range in μ . For some samples, this 676 provides potentially useable age information that does not require any further refinement 677 (e.g. Figure <u>45Hh-45li</u>). Conversely, this may provide a population of data that exhibits no 678 potential, i.e. dominated by common-lead (e.g. Figure 5Aa-5bB), open-system behaviour 679 (e.g. Figure <u>45Dd</u>), or mixed analyses (e.g. Figure <u>45Cc</u>). Screening in this way allows us to 680 analyse several samples or sample-aliquots in a single LA-ICP-MS session, and thus 681 identify the material most likely to provide an accurate and precise age.

682

683 Either as an alternative to spot traverses, or subsequent to spot traverses, we use LA-ICP-684 MS mapping to determine both the location and nature of U and Pb zonation in the carbonate material. Whereas spot traverses provide rapid screening of multiple 685 686 samples/aliquots, mapping provides fairly rapid (5 x 5 mm in < 2 hours) screening across 687 complexly zoned samples. Different approaches can be adopted, a suite of major and trace 688 elements can be analysed alone, a suite of elements for age determination (i.e. Pb to U ± 689 Hg) can be measured, or, depending on ICP-MS instrumentation, these can be combined, 690 i.e. using a guadrupole ICP-MS (Drost et al., 2018) or a split-stream set-up utilising two 691 ICP-MS instruments (e.g. Kylander-Clark et al., 2013). As will be shown by the examples in 692 the subsequent sections, trace element maps are useful for directly comparing U and Pb 693 zonation with other trace and major elements. We have found that in primary vein-filling 694 calcite, U typically correlates with other trace elements, this varies between samples, but 695 can include V, Mn, Y, and the REEs. We can use this information to distinguish primary 696 zones of calcite from those that have been altered (see Section 65). Elements, or elemental 697 ratios such as Ba/Ca, can be used to distinguish alteration zones or secondary material

(e.g. a detrital component). For example, in meteoric carbonates, high Th is commonly
attributed to detrital matter. The production of trace element maps rapidly produces extra
information that can be related to any later age determination, facilitating the relating of the
age to a specific growth event, i.e. the petrochronological approach (i.e. Kylander-Clark et
al., 2013; Engi et al., 2017).

703

704 An alternative approach is to produce maps that generate U-Pb data directly (see Section 705 <u>65.25</u>). These have obvious utility in determining suitable domains of calcite; however, for 706 common-lead bearing minerals they can be difficult to interpret by visual inspection. Pb-Pb 707 or Pb-U isotope maps can be created with ease; however, because of the inherent inclusion 708 of common lead, more useful is a map of common lead-corrected ²⁰⁶Pb/²³⁸U ages or ratios. 709 Common lead-corrected age maps require: 1) precise knowledge of the initial lead 710 composition (or upper intercept in Tera-Wasserburg space); and 2) knowledge that the 711 initial Pb composition is homogeneous across the mapped region, something that is not 712 always the case (see Section 57.2.4). However, with the recent advent of more advanced 713 data processing software, such as the Monocle plug-in for lolite (Petrus et al., 2017), 714 complex age determination from maps is becoming more amenable (see Section 56.52). 715 The caveat with such data processing packages is that non-related domains defining a 716 single age with a good precision can potentially be selected with subjectivity, and without 717 relation to actual geological/mineralogical process. For this reason, we suggest that it is 718 imperative that users relate domains they have selected for U-Pb age determination to 719 specific mineralogical domains that can be identified independently with other means, 720 whether these be entire crystals, domains of crystals, growth bands, or specific veinlets. As 721 suggested by Drost et al. (2018), who demonstrate the method for carbonate sediments, it 722 is also useful to compare conventional spot ablation analyses with the map-generated 723 dates to verify the accuracy of the latter.

724

725 7.5. Analytical Protocol

The LA-ICP-MS method for carbonate follows a typical sample-standard bracketing
approach using a matrix-matched reference material, i.e. as for other silicate or phosphate
minerals (e.g. zircon, monazite, titanite, rutile, apatite, allanite), with only minor
modifications. Similarly, uncertainty propagation and data reporting should follow the
community-based guidelines for zircon of Horstwood et al. (2016). Details on the LA-ICP-

731 MS method for carbonate adopted by three major laboratories taking a similar approach are 732 provided in Roberts & Walker (2016) and Drake et al. (2017) for the British Geological 733 Survey laboratory (Nottingham, UK); Ring & Gerdes (2016) and Methner et al. (2016) for 734 Goethe-Universität (Frankfurt, Germany), and Nuriel et al., (2017, 2019) for University of 735 California Santa Barbara (Santa Barbara, USA). Ablation spot sizes are typically larger than for silicate/phosphate minerals, generally >40 µm and often >100 µm, and fluences are also 736 737 often high (>4 J/cm²). As with all U-(Th)-Pb LA-ICP-MS geochronology, we advocate the 738 use of consistent ablation parameters between samples and reference materials.

739

740 There are two key points of the method we feel are worth highlighting that differ from 741 'standard' methods based on silicate minerals such as zircon. Firstly, the heterogeneous 742 nature of the Pb isotope composition of matrix-matched, i.e. calcite/dolomite, minerals (due 743 to variable common Pb incorporation), means that normalisation of the Pb-Pb isotope ratios 744 is currently achieved using a synthetic glass rather than a carbonate, typically NIST612 or 745 NIST614. At present, there is no evidence to suggest that the Pb/Pb mass bias is variable 746 across different matrices. Secondly, calculation of the reproducibility of the primary and 747 secondary matrix-matched reference materials, which is required for uncertainty 748 propagation (Horstwood et al., 2016) and determination of the true method accuracy and 749 precision, is hindered by the fact that the carbonate reference materials currently employed 750 have U/Pb heterogeneity that is equal to or much larger than the analytical uncertainties 751 (Roberts et al., 2017). This means there will typically be a significant excess variance of the 752 reference material U/Pb isotope measurements in any one session (including after 753 correction for common lead), which does not describe the reproducibility of the analytical 754 system but instead reflects the natural variation in the reference material. If propagated 755 onto the sample data-point uncertainties as a within-session excess variance as 756 recommended for zircon in Horstwood et al (2016), these data point uncertainties will be 757 overestimated, masking any smaller-scale, real geological scatter in the sample isochron 758 and resulting in meaningless ages with erroneously high precision. For this reason, it is 759 suggested that calculation of the session-based reproducibility is best estimated using a 760 more homogenous material such as NIST glass or zircon. However, it should be noted that 761 through this practice results can only be compared in a relative sense within session, or 762 between sessions if validation materials are compiled and used. To compare data in an 763 absolute sense, i.e. to assign an age and total uncertainty to a material for comparison 764 between laboratories and/or with other methods, the uncertainty from the primary reference

- material must be included to reflect the accuracy with which the matrix-matched
 normalisation is known. In this way, the uncertainty of the primary reference material
 constitutes a limiting uncertainty on any sample age. Improved reference materials with less
 scatter around the U/Pb isochron are therefore a pre-requisite for improving this method.
- 769

770 8.6. Generating U-Pb data and interpreting ages

771 Generating ages and relating these to geological processes requires the marriage of 772 spatially-resolved variations in composition (elemental and isotopic) and U-Pb isotopic 773 concentrations. In this section, we present several case studies to highlight how the 774 integration of compositional image-based data with U-Pb data can be used to interpret and 775 refine age data. our approach to dating vein-filling calcite, the potential applications to 776 dating faulting and fluid-flow, and the type of material commonly encountered. First we 777 present the 'standard' approach, which used independent imagery and analysis to target, 778 779 same <u>concept</u> approach as using CL imagery to help interpret zircon dates, and that can be 780 further refined with information such as companion trace element data.. - A second 781 approach (age mapping) is to use mapping tools not just to image the sample and its 782 composition, but to extract age data from the map itself (Petrus et al., 2017; Drost et al., 783 2018).

784

785 8.1. Image-guided dating

786 6.1. Example A - Variscan-related veins in the Northumberland Basin 787 The aim of most dating studies is to constrain the timing of primary calcite formation rather than subsequent secondary alteration. Trace element mapping using LA-ICP-MS is a 788 789 particularly useful tool to assist with identification of growth zoning, particularly on the scale 790 of mm- to cm-sized chips. Figures 7a and 7b show examples of vein-fill calcite where 791 uranium zonation can be compared to other major and trace elements. The trace element 792 mapping reveals large variation in trace element contents across the directions of growth, 793 interpretable as changing metal/Ca ratios in the mineralising fluids (e.g. Drake et al., 2014). 794 The trace element zonation in both of these samples can be traced with the optically visible 795 growth zonation, indicating its primary nature. Sample TJN-0-1 (Figure 7a) was presented 796 in Roberts & Walker (2016), and we have re-dated it here locating spots in three separate 797 areas with different uranium concentration. The dates all overlap (Figure 7a), but the

- precision of the dates is controlled by the amount of radiogenic to common lead, which
- 799 broadly correlates with the U concentration of the sample and where the traverse was
- 800 located. For this sample, the trace elements are low, including the Mn content, meaning the
- 801 <u>entire sample appears dark in cold-stage CL. Therefore, elemental mapping with LA-ICP-</u>
- 802 MS is one of the few techniques that can be used to characterise the elemental zonation in
- 803 <u>such samples.</u>
- 804
- 805 <u>Sample TJN-6-1 (Figure 7b) is a single large crystal, with a rim of zeolite. Trace element</u>
- 806 mapping reveals a strong correlation between most elements, again, representing the
- 807 primary growth zonation. High Mn and V 'fingers' intersect the growth zonation, and are
- 808 visible optically. We interpret these as pathways of secondary alteration. Given that the vein
- 809 <u>exhibits vuggy textures, it is possible that fluids have precipitated or altered the original</u>
- 810 calcite much later than the original period of calcite precipitation. Trace element mapping
- 811 <u>allows us to visualise and fingerprint these alteration zones, and avoid or remove them from</u>
- 812 analyses used for dating. A benefit to this approach is that the maps can then be used to
- 813 estimate the trace metal contents of the mineralising fluids, which in turn provides
- 814 information about rock-water interaction and the redox conditions, for example. These maps
- 815 <u>also demonstrate that no measurable diffusion of trace elements across the calcite crystals</u>
- 816 has occurred over a significant time span, as the distribution is interpreted as a primary
- 817 <u>feature.</u>
- 818
- 819 <u>Alteration zones can sometimes be observed visually, without the need for imaging</u>
- 820 techniques, as demonstrated by the vein sample in Figure 7c. In this particular sample, the
- 821 CL emission was rather dark, limiting its use for distinguishing the altered and non-altered
- 822 parts of the vein. Trace element mapping however, clearly distinguishes a region of
- 823 <u>alteration running across the vein that is characterised by enrichment and depletion on</u>
- 824 trace and major elements (e.g. low Mg, high La, Mn and Pb).
- 825 Figure 8 shows U-Pb calcite data from Howick Bay in the Northumberland Basin, NE
- 826 England. The mudstone succession in the bay is faulted and weakly folded, which is
- 827 postulated to be a result of transpressional stress during the Variscan orogeny (De Paola et
- 828 al., 2005). Syn-kinematic calcite located within fractures has the potential to date this far-
- 829 field intraplate deformation (c.f. Parrish et al., 2018). Screening data from this sample one
- 830 sample, comprising randomly located spot traverses across the veina crystal, are presented
- 831 in Figure <u>7c</u>8C. The data yield a regression with have a large array of common to

832 radiogenic Pb compositions, but with significant scatter (MSWD = 577) including several 833 data with low U/Pb and Pb/Pb ratios. The U-Pb data, indicating are compatible with -some 834 alteration and open-system behaviour and/or mixed age domains. Placing spots away from 835 the altered region, and within a region with high uranium, yields a more robust regression 836 that we interpret as a primary date of calcite formation. 837 838 In the final example (Figure 7d), the only mapped elements were U and Pb, but the sample 839 was also imaged using CCI. Both the elemental maps and CCI image show laminations that 840 are interpreted as growth zonation, and a reflection of the primary distribution of trace 841 elements (U and Pb in this case). Faintly visible on the CCI are thin veinlets that cross-cut 842 the growth bands. On the elemental maps, these are clearly distinguished as regions of Pb 843 enrichment and U depletion, suggesting that Pb-rich fluids have percolated through this 844 fracture-fill calcite. Since the spots that lie on the alteration pathways have high Pb counts, 845 the age data were culled based on Pb concentration (>300 ppb Pb removed). This 846 approach reduced the scatter in the regression, providing a more precise age, presumably 847 through the removal of data that reflect variable common lead compositions. 848


- 850 Figure 7. Photographs, LA-ICP-MS elemental maps, CL and CCI imagery and
- 851 <u>corresponding Tera-Wasserburg plots for four fracture-fill samples. For all maps, brighter =</u>
- 852 <u>higher concentration. (a) Basalt-hosted fracture-fill calcite grown after zeolite, Faroe</u>
- 853 Islands. Three spot traverses for U-Pb data are shown, labelled i, ii and iii. (b) Basalt-hosted
- 854 fracture-fill calcite, with zeolite grown after calcite, Faroe Islands. (c) Mudstone-hosted
- 855 <u>fracture-fill calcite, UK. U-Pb data are compared between a specific region avoiding the</u>
- 856 alteration, and from spot traverses across the sample. (d) Sandstone-hosted fracture-fill

- 857 calcite, UK. CCI image is false-coloured. U-Pb data are shown with and without a rejection criteria based on removal of high Pb counts – corresponding to Pb-rich alteration pathways. 858 859 The crystal was subsequently mapped for its trace element distribution, revealing a zone of 860 low Ca and Mg, and high Mn, REEs and Pb. This zone can be seen optically, and is 861 interpreted as a zone of alteration. Further U-Pb spot analyses were placed in a domain 862 away from this feature that exhibits high U, with the data yielding a more precise regression 863 with an age of 287 ± 14 Ma (MSWD = 2.5). This example highlights the use of trace 864 element mapping to locate regions of highest U, to assist and refine U-Pb analyses, and 865 shows the potential for dating calcite veins into the Palaeozoic.
- 866
- 867



869 *Figure 8. A) Photomicrograph of sample NR1511 showing position of mapped area and*

- 870 ablation spots (in black); B) Trace element maps generated with LA-ICP-MS using line
- 871 rasters, the scales are in ppm and white spots show the ablation locations; C) Tera-
- 872 Wasserburg concordia of U-Pb data from this sample based on screening spot traverses;

873 *D) Tera-Wasserburg concordia of U-Pb spot data placed using constraints from map data,*874 *i.e. over the unaltered high U region.*

875 876

877 Example B Faroe Island vein mineralisation

878 The aim of most studies is to date primary calcite formation rather than subsequent 879 secondary alteration, particularly when dating syn-kinematic calcite for constraining the 880 timing of fault slip (e.g. Roberts & Walker, 2016; Ring & Gerdes, 2016; Goodfellow et al., 881 2017; Hansman et al., 2017; Nuriel et al., 2017, 2019; Parrish et al., 2018; Holdsworth et 882 al., 2019; Smeraglia et al., 2018). Trace element mapping is a useful tool to assist with 883 identification of growth zoning, particularly on the scale of mm- to cm-sized chips. Using 884 standard LA-ICP-MS protocols for trace element determination, with standard-sample 885 bracketing routines, a 5 x 5 mm region can be mapped in less than two hours. As discussed 886 previously, depending on the analytical set-up, this trace element mapping can be 887 conducted alongside U-Pb isotope mapping.

888

889 Figure 9 shows selected results from dating of syn-kinematic crack-seal-slip calcite 890 mineralisation from basalt-hosted faults of the Faroe Islands (Roberts & Walker, 2016). 891 Sample A is from a vein exhibiting a zeolite-calcite-zeolite mineral paragenesis. The calcite 892 exhibits distinct syntaxial growth zoning towards the centre of the vein. Trace element 893 mapping reveals large variation in trace element contents in the direction of growth, 894 interpretable as changing metal/Ca ratios in the mineralising fluid (e.g. Drake et al., 2014). 895 The trace element zonation clearly follows the optically visible growth zonation, indicating 896 its primary nature. Uranium increases steadily to the maximum concentrations observed, 897 then abruptly drops to very low abundances. The U-Pb data define a well-behaved isochron 898 (low scatter with large spread in U/Pb ratios), determined from spots placed on and near 899 the high U region, and yields a lower intercept U-Pb age of 45 ± 2 Ma (MSWD = 1.09).

900

Sample B is from a large dilational jog (up to 1 m wide) that is filled with zeolite-calcite zeolite mineralisation, including calcite crystals up to 10 cm long. The mapped grain is
 composed of calcite with a later rim of zeolite. Trace element mapping reveals a strong
 correlation between most elements, again, representing the primary growth zonation. High
 Mn and V 'fingers' intersect the growth zonation, and are visible optically. We interpret

906 these as pathways of secondary alteration. Given that the vein exhibits vuggy textures, it is 907 possible that fluids have precipitated or altered the original calcite much later than the 908 original fault slip. U-Pb analyses of the primary calcite in this sample reveal fairly radiogenic 909 Pb compositions, although with large datapoint uncertainties owing to the low U 910 concentrations, with a lower intercept U-Pb age of 37 ± 2 Ma (MSWD = 2.4; anchored 911 upper intercept based on other samples on this study at 0.89 ± 0.02). Trace element **912** mapping allows us to visualise and fingerprint these alteration zones, and avoid or remove 913 them from analyses used for dating. A benefit to this approach is that the maps can then be 914 used to estimate the trace metal contents of the mineralising fluids, which in turn provides 915 information about rock-water interaction and the redox conditions for example. These maps 916 also demonstrate that no measurable diffusion of trace elements across the calcite crystals 917 has occurred over a significant time span, as the distribution is interpreted as a primary 918 feature.

919



920 921

Figure 9. A) Sample microphotographs of epoxy-resin mounted zeolite-calcite vein
samples, TJN-0-1 and TJN-6-1, mapped regions shown in black; B) Trace element maps
generated with LA-ICP-MS using line rasters; C) Tera-Wasserburg concordia of U-Pb data
from each sample (from Roberts and Walker, 2016).

928 Example C Sellafield fracture mineralisation

939

929 Figure 10 shows results for fracture mineralisation from Sellafield, NW England. This 930 location was previously investigated (1990-1997) as a potential nuclear waste repository site, and has thus been extensively studied in terms of its structure, stratigraphy, 931 932 geochemistry and palaeo- to present-day hydrogeology (Michie & Bowden, 1994; Akhurst 933 et al., 1997; Baker et al., 1997; Heathcote and Michie, 2004; Bath et al., 2006; Milodowski 934 et al., 1998, 2018). Deep (up to 2 km) site-investigation boreholes revealed a complex 935 sequence of fracture mineralisation within Ordovician greenschist-facies metamorphic 936 basement rocks overlain by Carboniferous Limestone and Permo-Triassic sedimentary 937 strata (Milodowski et al., 1998). Presented here are data from one mineralised zone that 938 show the potential for U-Pb dating of such material.

940 Sample 833 is an example of euhedral calcite crystals lining open fractures and 941 representing the latest mineralisation, and which are very closely-associated with the 942 present-day fracture-controlled groundwater system (generation ME9 of Milodowski et al., 943 1998; 2018). The sample has U and Pb concentrations of 0.3—30 ppm and 0.1—3.6 ppm, 944 respectively. U-Pb LA-ICP-MS spot analyses were placed in a single crystal which was 945 optically continuous; the data yielded an age of 6.98 ± 0.43 Ma (MSWD = 15). The dated 946 crystal was subsequently mapped for its U, Th and Pb elemental distribution using LA-ICP-947 MS. The map shows zoning of U, Th and Pb that is interpreted as growth zoning during 948 primary calcite growth. Pb is distributed similarly, but with high concentrations along narrow 949 veins that are discordant to the primary growth zoning; these are interpreted as alteration 950 pathways where Pb-bearing fluids have invaded the crystals. Crystals were also imaged 951 using charge-contrast imaging (CCI), which highlights structural imperfections in the calcite 952 crystals. The same veinlets that have elevated Pb concentrations are imaged as cracks and 953 disturbances to the growth zoning. Since the spots that lie on the alteration pathways have **9**54 high Pb counts, the age data were culled based on Pb concentration (>500 ppb Pb 955 removed). This approach reduced the scatter in the regression, presumably removing 956 components with slightly different common lead compositions, giving a more precise age of 6.44 ± 0.26 Ma (MSWD = 2.8). These data from Sellafield demonstrate the potential utility 957 958 of imaging techniques such as CCI and trace element mapping to discriminate primary 959 growth domains from those that are altered at the micro-scale (<100 µm), and refinement of 960 scattered analyses into those that are interpretable as a single population.



Figure 10. A) Photograph of sample 833; B) Trace element maps using LA-ICP-MS based
on line rasters; C) Tera-Wasserburg concordia of U-Pb data before and after refining the
data; D) False-colour charge-contrast image of the dated crystal, showing the mapped
region in black.

968 8.2.6.2. Age mapping of vein-fill carbonates

961

967

969 We have demonstrated that elemental mapping data are useful for refining and interpreting 970 U-Pb isotopic data. For example, in Example B above, we manually located the spots in a 971 high U zone, and in Example C, we manually removed the data with high Pb 972 concentrations. An alternative approach to using elementalthe maps to 'manually' locate spots or refine spot data, is to generate a combined elemental and U-Pb isotopic 2D 973 974 dataset (i.e. map); the benefit of this method is that software tools can be used to both 975 discriminate specific isotopic data based upon chosen criteria, and also to show regions 976 within these pooled datasets that have similar compositional characteristics. Iolite (Paton et 977 al., 2011) is one of the most commonly used data reduction tools for both U-Pb isotopic 978 data (Paton et al., 2010), and for generation of elemental 2D maps. Monocle is a software 979 plug-in for lolite that allows the user to generate maps of isotopic and elemental data 980 (Petrus et al., 2017), and to define and extract regions of pooled compositional data, including those used for age calculations. Drost et al. (2018) demonstrated the efficacy of 981 982 the software for dating carbonate sediments, whereby features such as bioclasts and

983 detrital components are removed. For a detailed explanation of the protocol, see Drost et al. 984 (2018). In brief, each pixel of the elemental and isotope ratio maps corresponds to one duty 985 cycle of the ICP-MS. First, pixels are removed, using user-defined selection criteria that are 986 believed to be related to alteration, secondary material, or a younger or older carbonate 987 generation. This is usually conducted after an initial inspection of the mapping data 988 combined with prior imaging and petrography; however, the screening can also employ an 989 iterative approach after generation of initial U-Pb isochrons. After this screening/filtering, the 990 remaining data are pooled into a number of pseudo-analyses (each corresponding to the 991 same number of pixels) based on a suitable isotope ratio, such as ²³⁸U/²⁰⁸Pb or ²³⁵U/²⁰⁷Pb. 992 The pooling is achieved using an empirical cumulative distribution function (ECDF) to 993 maximise the spread in U/Pb ratios, and an appropriate number of pixels to produce a 994 reasonable population of data, for example twenty to forty data-points. Here, we present 995 examples of this approach applied to vein-filling calcite.

996

997 Example D – BH11

998 This example is of a fine-scale vein cross-cutting a sedimentary host rock; the objective is 999 to use Monocle-based criteria to discriminate the vein from the host rock and determine a 1000 robust age. Only two criteria of filtering were needed to distinguish the vein from the host: 1001 Mg of less than 5000 ppm, and Th of less than 0.1 ppm. The remaining data were pooled using ²³⁸U/²⁰⁸Pb [HMS1] ratios into 26 analyses, and yielded a robust lower intercept 1002 ²³⁸U/²⁰⁶Pb date of 53.95 90 ± 0.36 33 Ma, with an MSWD of 1.0 21 (Figure. 11). This 1003 1004 sample was previously dated using conventional spot analyses located within the vein at 1005 53.51 ± 0.39 Ma (MSWD = 2.0; Beaudoin et al., 2018). These dates, quoted without 1006 propagation of systematic uncertainties, show good agreement between two different labs 1007 using different instrumentation and data reduction methods. 1008



1010 Figure 11. Image-based dating (Monocle plug-in for Iolite) of sample BH11. A) Trace
1011 element maps of the analysed region, the final map shows the region of interest selected
1012 for the U-Pb date highlighted in green; B) Photomicrograph of the sample surface showing
1013 the mapped region as a U map; C) Tera-Wasserburg concordia of U-Pb data after pooling
1014 and filtering using the Monocle plug-in (see text for description).

- 1015
- 1016

1017 Example E – BM18

Figure 8 shows an BM18 is another example of a vein cross-cutting a sedimentary hostrock, with. This time, there is clear zonation within of the vein (Figure. 12). Since it is a
syntaxial vein (crystals growing from the wall rock to the centre), this zonation probably
represents changing fluid chemistry as the calcite crystals were precipitating. However, it
could represent multiple generations of calcite precipitation. Criteria were selected for
filtering of the data to highlight the outer regions of the vein; Rb < 0.05 ppm, Th < 0.01 ppm,

- and Sr < 400 ppm. The U-Pb data were then filtered to remove data with low U and Pb
- signals, since no initial rejection of data based on detection limit was conducted using this
- 1026 data reduction method; criteria for acceptance were $^{238}U > 500$ cps, and $^{207}Pb/^{206}Pb < 1.5$.
- 1027 The remaining data produce a robust isochron with a lower intercept date of 61.0 ± 1.7 Ma
- 1 ϕ 28 (MSWD = 1.44<u>12</u>; 21 pooled analyses). This date overlaps that previously obtained using
- 1029 spot analyses that were derived from the entire width of the vein (59.5 \pm 1.7 Ma; Beaudoin
- 1030 et al., 2018).
- 1031





Figure <u>128</u>. Image-based dating (Monocle plug-in for Iolite) of sample BM18. (<u>a</u>A) Trace
element maps of the analysed region; (<u>b</u>B) Photomicrograph of sample surface showing
mapped region as U map; (<u>c</u>C) U map showing the region of interest selected for the U-Pb
date in green; (<u>d</u>P) Tera-Wasserburg concordia of U-Pb data after pooling and filtering
using the Monocle plug-in (see text for description).

- 1039
- 1040
- 1041 Example F NR1511
- 1042 <u>To demonstrate The third example of image-based dating on another is from a complex</u>
- 1043 sample, we re-dated the vein presented in Figure 7c (NR1511). vein already described in
- 1044 section 5.1 above (Example A). This vein features visible textures and chemistry associated
- 1045 with alteration. (Figure. 13). The mapped region (see Figure 9) is entirely within the vein

1046 (no host rock). High concentrations in several elements (e.g. Cu, Ba, Rb, Sr, Ba and Pb) 1047 reflect veinlets that can be seen optically as a yellow altered region. The remaining portion 1048 of the vein varies in U content, which likely represents chemical zonation across the coarse 1049 sparry calcite growth. A fairly robust isochron (MSWD = 1.92.0) was obtained after filtering 1050 of the data for the clearly altered regions, cleaning up the U-Pb data to remove low U and Pb signals, and pooling the data based on ²⁰⁷Pb/²³⁵U. The criteria for acceptance were: Cu 1051 < 0.2 ppm, Ba < 10 ppm, Rb < 0.01 ppm, and $^{238}U < 10000$ cps (for removal of alteration), 1052 and $^{238}U > 500 \text{ cps}$, $^{207}Pb/^{206}Pb > 0.15 < 1.5$, and $^{206}Pb/^{208}Pb > 0.1 < 10$ (for 'cleaning up' 1053 1054 the U-Pb data). These data yielded a date of 283.1 ± 9.74 Ma, which overlaps that obtained 1055 from spot analyses and manual location of the spot data based on prior LA-ICP-MS 1056 mapping (2867 ± 142 Ma; see Figure 8D7c), but with an improvement in the precision (4.9 1057 to 3.4<u>3 %).</u>







Figure <u>139</u>. Image-based dating (Monocle plug-in for Iolite) of sample NR1511. (<u>a</u>A) Trace
element maps of the analysed region; (<u>b</u>B) Photomicrograph of sample surface showing
mapped region as U map; (<u>c</u>C) U map showing the region of interest selected for the U-Pb
date in green; (<u>d</u>P) Tera-Wasserburg concordia of U-Pb data after pooling and filtering
using the Monocle plug-in (see text for description).

1066

1067 <u>7. Limitations</u>

1068 9.7.1. Isotopic composition of common lead

1069 Carbonates nearly always take up some amount of lead during their formation, referred to 1070 as 'common' or initial lead. Contamination during handling (i.e. during cutting and polishing) 1071 or from recent exposure to the environment will have a modern isotopic composition of 1072 common lead, i.e. approximating the Stacey & Kramers (1975) model for terrestrial lead 1073 composition at present-day, roughly 207 Pb/ 206 Pb = 0.84. Distinguishing between such 1074 contamination and the common lead incorporated during formation can be difficult. Well 1075 behaved U-Pb isotopic systematics in a carbonate sample should yield a single mixing line 1076 between the common and radiogenic end-members, and ideally will have enough spread in 1077 U/Pb ratios to yield a precise regression with low uncertainties at both the lower (radiogenic 1078 lead) and upper (common lead) intercepts. However, many samples will exhibit a lack of 1079 spread in U/Pb ratios, or will be dominated by radiogenic compositions (e.g. Figure 4f5F). 1080 Although a best-fit line may be calculated for such data, the slope, and thus age, may be 1081 inaccurate. Thus, it is useful for such samples to have an estimation of the common lead 1082 composition through other means, such as from nearby cogenetic samples formed at the 1083 same age, or from different minerals also believed to have been formed at the same age.

1084

1085 For some mineral chronometers, such as the phosphate mineral monazite, it is common to 1086 use an estimate of the common lead composition based on the Stacey and Kramers (1975) 1087 model (e.g. Palin et al., 2013; Regis et al., 2016). In our experience, this is an acceptable 1088 approach because from a number of different studies, we find that the common lead 1089 composition determined from other minerals (i.e. feldspar, biotite, apatite) overlaps the 1090 Stacey and Kramers (1975) composition (e.g. Stübner et al., 2014; Warren et al., 2014). For 1091 carbonate however, we find this is not always such a suitable approach. Our experience, 1092 particularly from fracture-fill, but also evident in diagenetic and sedimentary carbonates, 1093 from hydrothermal carbonate in particular, is that common lead compositions are often more radiogenic (lower ²⁰⁷Pb/²⁰⁶Pb ratios) than those predicted by the terrestrial lead model 1094 1095 (Stacey and Kramers, 1975) for the age of carbonate crystallisation. This situation can 1096 occur if the carbonate has incorporated unsupported radiogenic lead during its formation. 1097 This most readily occurs by incorporation of radiogenic lead that is derived from an ancient 1098 sources, i.e. lead that has been decaying from produced by uranium decay in a closed 1099 system for a long time, but which is decoupled from its parent uranium before being 1100 incorporated into the measured carbonate. 1101

We have compiled sample data with robust U-Pb regressions from the BGS laboratory 1102

- 1103 (both published and unpublished), and presented these as a Figure 14 shows a
- 1104 compilation of common lead intercepts (²⁰⁷Pb/²⁰⁶Pb). The data are split into fracture-fill and
- 1105 diagenetic samples, and from a number of studies of fracture-filling calcite (compilation of
- 1106 BGS laboratory data). The data represent different host lithologies, different ages
- 1107 (dominated by Cretaceous to Miocene), and different geological regions. It is clear that for

1108 many samples in this compilation, anchoring at a value close to the terrestrial lead model composition for Phanerozoic ages, i.e. ²⁰⁷Pb/²⁰⁶Pb ~ 0.84, will lead to calculated ages older 1109 1110 than the true age due to steepening of the regression. The importance of the common lead 1111 composition in providing constraints on a calculated age will depend on the amount of 1112 measured radiogenic lead in a given sample; samples dominated by common lead and 1113 lacking in radiogenic lead will need a well defined well-defined array to produce a confident 1114 lower intercept. We find that within individual vein samples, the apparent composition of the 1115 common lead end-member can vary, limiting the precision of the regression and derived 1116 age. For speleothems, Woodhead et al. (2012) demonstrate that most samples analysed in 1117 their lab yield common lead compositions overlapping Stacy and Kramers (1975), and thus 1118 their ages are largely insensitive to the common lead compositions. This likely reflects the 1119 fact that they are precipitated from meteoric water that reflects the incorporates modern 1120 lead derived from a regional upper crustal lead Pb composition. Although, they add the caveat that samples with ²³⁸U/²⁰⁶Pb below 1300 (equivalent to $\mu \approx 20,000$), have large 1121 1122 inaccuracies.

1123

1124 The highly radiogenic initial lead values ($^{207}Pb/^{206}Pb < \sim 0.75$) recorded in our compilation 1125 are mostly from two settings, young fractures in Proterozoic crystalline crust of Sweden (n= 1126 10-of 104), and young fractures in the Bighorn Basin that overlies Archaean basement 1127 (n=24-24 of 104). In both cases, lead leached from the bulkwhole-rockk Pb, although 1128 ancient, is not radiogenic enough to produce the measured values. Instead, leaching of 1129 unsupported radiogenic lead from uraniferous minerals (i.e. high μ) is required (-e.g. 1130 titanite, allanite, monazite, xenotime and zircon) as a causative mechanism. Radiogenic 1131 lead is in fact a well-known widespread feature found in ore deposits across Sweden (e.g. 1132 Johansson & Rickard, 1984; Romer & Wright, 1993). 1133



Figure 104. Compilation of upper intercept ²⁰⁷Pb/²⁰⁶Pb compositions from fracture-fill and diagenetic vcarbonatesein-filling calcite, offrom samples dated in the British Geological Survey laboratory (n=12304). The grey curve is a Kernel Density Estimate showing the distribution of mean compositions. The red bars shows the two-stage Stacey and Kramers (1975) compositions of terrestrial lead at present-day. -at 0, 2000, 2000 and 3700 Ma. Samples with very large uncertainties in the ²⁰⁷Pb/²⁰⁶Pb composition are those with very low Pb count-rates.

1145 An additional complexity in interpreting carbonate U-Pb data, is that fine-scale variability in initial lead compositions may exist. This is because the fluids involved in carbonate 1146 precipitation may vary on very short timescales, with varying fluid-rock interaction leading to 1147 different Pb components being leached into the fluids. The time-scale of varying fluid 1148 1149 involvement may be much shorter than the resolution of the U-Pb data, such that data with 1150 variable initial lead compositions may not be resolvably different in age, and hence, will 1151 merely lead to increased scatter on the U-Pb isochron. Heterogeneous initial lead 1152 compositions can be seen in an example of sandstone-hosted vein material from the Moab 1153 fault, southeast Utah (Figure 11). 1154 1155 Example G - Moab fault 1156 Figure 15 shows results from a sample taken from the Moab fault in southeast Utah, USA. 1157 The sample presented here (CHJ15-KH08) is collected from the Courthouse Junction fault 1158 segment intersection. This locality has a complex, multi-phase deformation history (Davatzes et al., 2005; Johansen et al., 2005) associated with multiple episodes of 1159 mineralization and a range of diagenetic fluids (Chan et al., 2000; Eichhubl et al., 2009; 1160 1161 Bergman et al., 2013; Hodson et al., 2016). 1162 1163 U-Pb data were obtained from different sections of the vein material formed along different 1164 orientations. (See Figure 15). The data exhibit a high level of common/initial lead, with 1165 limited spread in radiogenic lead contents, but still forming a scattered regression to a lower 1166 intercept value. Using different colours to discriminate different sections of vein, it is clear 1167 that they have subtly different initial lead compositions, as indicated by the upper intercept (²⁰⁷Pb/²⁰⁶Pb value) of the data arrays. These lead compositions are more radiogenic 1168 1169 different from thatat predicted by the Stacey & Kramers (1975) terrestrial composition, 1170 which we find is a common feature of many vein-filling carbonates. This is likely due to the 1171 hydrothermal fluids that are precipitating the carbonate comprising unsupported radiogenic 1172 lead components derived from leaching of older uraniferous minerals or rocks. 1173 1174 The existence of variable Pb compositions on small length-scales (<1 mm) means that 1175 careful attention is required to interpret complex data. However, the spatial resolution of LA-1176 ICP-MS means that these details can potentially be teased out. This case study also shows 1177 the potential of the method for measuring veinlets that are only ~150 µm wide (see Figure 1178 15), a task that would be difficult for ID analyses.



Figure 151. U-Pb data from a series of calcite veins (sample KH18) along the Moab Fault at
Courthouse Junction, Utah. (Aa) Reflected light image of a region of veining showing the
100 µm spots; (bB) Photomicrograph of the dated sample, with different dated domains of
veining shown by blue, red, black and grey lines; (cC) Tera-Wasserburg plot with U-Pb spot
data colour-coded to match the different domains. The bars on the left show the variable
²⁰⁷Pb/²⁰⁶Pb upper intercept values for each domain.

- 1188
- 1189

1190 In summary, vein-filling, diagenetic and hydrothermal carbonates often do not exhibit Stacy

1191 & Kramers (1975) model Pb compositions for their assumed age, but typically yield more

1192 radiogenic compositions. This means that regressions anchored with assumed common

1193 lead compositions are susceptible to inaccuracy. Mixed common lead compositions in

samples hampers derivation of single age regressions, implying multiple fluid sources.

- 1195 Mixed ages and atypical lead compositions can also make age mapping problematic.
- 1196
- 1197 **10.**<u>7.2.</u> Dating young material dealing with disequilibria

1198 As described in Section 3, the younger the age of the sample analysed, the lower the 1199 potential for precise and accurate age determination due to the lack of radiogenic ingrowth 1200 of lead. However, young carbonates are a high priority in many applications, because they 1201 can date events more relevant to the Earth system at present, and because U-Pb can 1202 extend the age range of sample suites or study areas where U-Th age dating is also 1203 feasible. For example, records of environmental change in deep time require the dating of speleothems that are older than 500 ka (see Woodhead et al., 2012, 2019), and dating of 1204 1205 veins that record seismic cycles extending beyond 500 ka (see Uysal et al., 2011; Williams 1206 et al., 2017) can provide constraints on earthquakes and other hazards associated with 1207 subsurface fractures. These particular applications are likely to require high levels of 1208 precision, i.e. for the Quaternary, of much less than ± 100 ka, and potentially even less than 1209 \pm 10 ka or < 1000 years for the Holocene. Achieving such precision requires very high U to 1210 achieve abundant radiogenic lead and higher u values (see Figure 34).

1211

1212 A major issue for accurate dating of young samples (i.e. <10 Ma) is the potential effect of 1213 initial daughter isotope disequilibrium within the uranium decay chains. The simplest form of 1214 the U-Pb and Pb-Pb age equations, often used for older samples, assume that all long-lived 1215 daughter isotopes in the U decay chain are initially present in secular equilibrium. Both the 1216 U decay series contain long-lived daughter isotopes, including 234 U (t_{1/2} = 245 ka), 230 Th (t_{1/2} = 1217 76 ka), and ²²⁶Ra ($t_{\frac{1}{2}}$ = 1.6 ka) in the ²³⁸U decay chain, and ²³¹Pa ($t_{\frac{1}{2}}$ = 34 ka) in the ²³⁵U 1218 decay chain. Of these, ²³⁴U has the longest half--life and therefore the largest potential 1219 effect on U-Pb dates. The excess initial ²³⁴U often observed in natural waters will lead to 1220 generation of unsupported ²⁰⁶Pb. If uncorrected, excess initial ²³⁴U produces overestimated 1221 ²⁰⁶³⁸PbU/²³⁸⁰⁶PUb and lower intercept dates. An excess of the other intermediate daughter 1222 products, like ²³⁰Th, relative to secular equilibrium will bias the age with a smaller 1223 magnitude but in the same direction, whereas a deficit will result in dates that are too 1224 young.

Carbonates are commonly precipitated from fluids containing ²³⁴U/²³⁸U out of secular 1226 1227 equilibrium. Thus, this initial disequilibrium must be considered in any age determination. 1228 Age corrections for initial U daughter deficits are at maximum ~1.44 times the half--life of 1229 the daughter isotope for zero initial abundance. But for initial excesses, the age difference 1230 can be many times larger. (see Figure 17). For most older samples dated by U-Pb, the 1231 effect of disequilibrium is deemed to be insignificant compared to larger measurement 1232 uncertainties. For this reason, initial disequilibrium has thus far not been mentioned in any 1233 publication concerning LA-ICP-MS U-Pb dating except for those dealing with young 1234 speleothems (e.g. Hopley et al., 2019). However, here we demonstrate that initial 1235 disequilibrium may be a very significant cause of uncertainty for carbonates precipitated 1236 from groundwater and other crustal fluids, and not just for very young (<1 Ma) samples.

1237

1238 In young samples, particularly those within the range of U-Th geochronology (<600 ka), the initial ²³⁴U/²³⁸U ratio (²³⁴U/²³⁸U₀) can be estimated based on the combination of the present-1239 day measured ²³⁴U/²³⁸U (²³⁴U/²³⁸U_{now}), and either the measured ²³⁰Th/²³⁸U or the estimated 1240 1241 date of formation. The robustness of this estimate is highly dependent on the precision and 1242 accuracy at which the isotope ratio(s) can be measured (the atom ratio is very small, 1243 making high precision measurement >1‰ difficult). In addition, if the offset between 234 U/ 238 U_{now} and secular equilibrium is small, then the measurement may overlap secular 1244 1245 equilibrium within uncertainty. For this reason, the highest precision possible is a necessary 1246 target for any disequilibrium correction measurement.

1247

For older samples (i.e. those older than about four times the half-life of ²³⁴U), and/or those 1248 with only a small degree of initial disequilibrium, ²³⁴U/²³⁸U_{now} is likely to have reached 1249 secular equilibrium. This means that ²³⁴U/²³⁸U₀ cannot be estimated from the measured 1250 1251 data alone. One approach to alleviate this problem is to take known initial ratios from 1252 younger samples (<600 ka) formed in approximately the same geologic setting, and apply 1253 these corrections to the older samples from the same setting (e.g. Woodhead et al., 2006, 1254 2019). This approach is only applicable if the geological environment is well known and the 1255 hydrological system believed to be relatively stable.

1256

1257 There are various causes of 234 U excess in fluid-mineral systems, which have been studied 1258 at length (e.g. Osmond & Cowart, 1992, 2000; Porcelli & Swarzenski, 2003; Suksi et al., 1259 2006). In summary, 234 U is generated from α decay of 238 U, and may preferentially be

1260 increased in the fluid state during mineral-fluid interaction due to oxidation state and 1261 valence differences between the U species (e.g. Suksi et al., 2006). Uranium activity ratios 1262 record information on the redox state of fluids, the source of uranium in the fluids, and 1263 potentially the timing of uranium residence in the fluid; therefore, they have long been a 1264 focus of groundwater studies (e.g. Osmond et al., 1968; Osmond & Cowart, 2000; Porcelli & Swarzenski, 2003). Of general interest here, is whether carbonates precipitated from 1265 1266 different geological settings are likely to have significant ²³⁴U excess such that any 1267 measured ²³⁸U/²⁰⁶Pb dates will be inaccurate.

1268

Cave drip-water that generates speleothem deposits typically has excess ²³⁴U relative to 1269 secular equilibrium, although sometimes ²³⁴U is depleted. Overall, most cave systems have 1270 1271 initial activity ratios that are not grossly offset from secular equilibrium. This means that an 1272 uncertainty limit can be placed on such carbonates with reasonable confidence. 1273 Disequilbrium corrections will significantly affect age estimates with high precision, but not 1274 the low precision estimates that typically characterise LA-ICP-MS dates. For example, Woodhead et al. (2019) used an estimate of 1.0 ± 0.3 for $^{234}U/^{238}U_0$ in their study of 1275 speleothems from the Nullarbor plain, Australia, and this had negligible impact on the 1276 resultant compilation of U-Pb dates. Hopley et al. (2019) estimated a range of $^{234}U/^{238}U_0 =$ 1277 1278 1.26 to 2.99 for the 'Cradle of Humankind' in South Africa, with a mean of 1.9, and 1279 discussed a resulting potential age range of 5.8 to 4.8 Ma. A known excursion from 'typical' 1280 activity ratios is the Transvaal Dolomite Aquifer, also in South Africa. Speleothem deposits 1281 in cave systems that interacted with water from this aquifer have anomalously high U 1282 activity ratios ranging from ca. 2 to 12 (Kronfeld et al., 1994). This well-known occurrence 1283 highlights that speleothem deposits could arise from fluids with variable and anomalous 1284 activity ratios, and thus that attention must be given to accurately estimating the $^{234}U/^{238}U_0$ 1285 when dating such deposits.

1286

Unfortunately, activity ratio data that is relevant to hydrothermal and other vein-filling carbonates is sparse and potentially more variable. Carbonates precipitated in the shallow crust may arise from percolating groundwater, seawater, deep brines, formation waters, or a mixture of these sources. We can use existing data on these fluid sources to make an initial estimate of what range may exist in terrestrial carbonates. Groundwater is well known to have highly variable and significant ²³⁴U excess (e.g. Osmond and Cowart, 1976). Figure 1293 126 shows a compilation of ²³⁴U/²³⁸U activity ratios taken from a range of literature sources

1294 (see supplementary file for sources). The population of data for groundwater (Figure 1295 126Aa), mostly shallow, but including some saline and deeper samples, has a median 1296 activity ratio of 2.25, and is skewed towards higher values, with a significant tail up to ~11. 1297 Data from hydrothermal fluids and deep brines are less abundant in the literature, but can 1298 be estimated from young carbonates precipitated in travertines and hydrothermal veins. 1299 The compilation shown in Figure 12b6B is dominated byskewed towards samples from 1300 Turkey and surrounding regions.- It has a median of 1.41, and is right-skewed with a tail 1301 ranging up to ~8 and only a few higher values.





1308 is dominated by shallow groundwater rather than brines); and <u>(Bb</u>) travertines and calcite 1309 precipitated in veins, commonly but not exclusively associated with travertines – these are 1310 estimated ${}^{234}U/{}^{238}U_0$ values.

- 1311
- 1312

1313 The compilations in Figure 162 are somewhat alarming, as they suggest that vein-filling 1314 carbonates have a high likelihood of having activity ratios have a high likelihood out of of being secular equilibrium (where $^{234}U/^{238}U = of ~1$) in vein-filling carbonates. The 1315 1316 compilations shown are biased by sampling, so uncertainties on the range of activity ratios 1317 should not be based on these compilations. However, a very conservative view would be that shallow groundwater $^{234}U/^{238}U$ activity ratios average closer to ~2 than they do to ~1; 1318 1319 hydrothermal waters average closer to ~1.5; and permissible values may be extremely out 1320 of secular equilibrium at >10. The data reveal that precise age estimates of young 1321 carbonates derived from crustal fluids are going to be severely hampered by a lack of 1322 knowledge of the U activity ratios.

1323

1324 To demonstrate the effect of initial activity ratios out of secular equilibrium, we have 1325 modelled synthetic data in Figure 173. This figure shows curves representing samples of ten different ages, which would range from 500 ka to 9 Ma if ²³⁴U/²³⁸U₀ was in secular 1326 equilibrium (~1) during formation. The true age of the samples get younger as $^{234}U/^{238}U_0$ 1327 1328 increases. The effect does not decrease in significance as we look at older ages, i.e. the 1329 age offset on a sample with a measured age of 8 Ma is similar to that on a sample of 4 Ma. 1330 The curves are shown on a log scale, because in many systems, the variation in activity 1331 ratio is going to vary a small amount, close to secular equilibrium (\sim 1). For example, in the 1332 Nullarbor plain cave systems, the variation is likely to be within 30% of 1 (Woodhead et al., 1333 2019). Systems with large variations in initial activity ratios, for example some hydrothermal 1334 systems, would lead to a large uncertainty on the obtained dates. Ignoring the effect of the 1335 likely ²³⁴U excess in vein-filling carbonates is likely to lead to significant inaccuracy of dates 1336 by 10s of %, in general by overestimating the age. Considering the impact that 1337 unconstrained initial 234 U/ 238 U ratios have on young dates leads to significant (> 10%) 1338 uncertainties.

1339



1361 So far, the discussion has involved the uncertainties surrounding excess/deficient ²³⁴U 1362 during calcite growth. However, there are several other intermediate daughter products in 1363 the uranium decay chains that can pose problems for the accuracy of measured ages; see 1364 Richards et al. (1998) and Woodhead et al. (2006) for previous discussion of these. The isotope ²³⁰Th is a potential consideration in the accuracy of ²³⁸U-²⁰⁶Pb ages. In general, 1365 most speleothem-dating studies assume no initial ²³⁰Th in the system, as Th is very 1366 1367 insoluble in water compared to U. Any excess initial ²³⁰Th during formation would also result 1368 in artificially old measured ages. ²³¹Pa is another daughter product in the decay chain, 1369 which again, is considered very insoluble, and does not form part of the disequilibrium corrections at present. ²²⁶Ra, another intermediate product, may co-precipitate with U, but 1370 1371 its short half-life of 1.6 ka means it is likely to have little impact on U-Pb ages (Richards et 1372 al., 1998). A final concern is the gas ²²²Rn, as this may be lost from the system by diffusive processes. A study into the effect of this showed negligible impact on the ²³⁸U-²⁰⁶Pb ages of 1373 1374 a Quaternary speleothem (Richards et al., 1998).

1375

1376 Although the effects of disequilibrium in these shorter-lived intermediate daughter products 1377 is considered to be minor, and likely within the uncertainty of measured LA-ICP-MS U-Pb 1378 dates, it is worth noting that hydrological systems outside of those concerning speleothems 1379 and meteoric water have not been explored. Most of the issues presented here, particularly the excess ²³⁴U problem, are part of the ²³⁸U decay chain, and thus have implications for 1380 ²³⁸U/²⁰⁶Pb and lower intercept ages. The ²³⁵U decay chain has different intermediate 1381 daughter products, and thus measured ²³⁵U/²⁰⁷Pb and lower intercept ages will be affected 1382 by a different set of processes. The problem of excess ²³⁴U is alleviated if ²³⁵U-²⁰⁷Pb ages 1383 can be used instead of ²³⁸U-²⁰⁶Pb ages. However, there have been few attempts to utilise 1384 ²³⁵U-²⁰⁷Pb dates (e.g. Hopley et al., 2019) because the low abundances of these isotopes in 1385 comparison to ²³⁸U and ²⁰⁶Pb are major limitations on the uncertainty of the measurements. 1386 1387 Engel et al. (2019) have provided a solution that will potentially increase the accuracy of 1388 age estimates for speleothems, utilising the ²³⁵U decay chain, as well as using ²⁰⁸Pb in place of ²⁰⁴Pb as the initial lead composition. This approach is based on ID, and it is unclear 1389 how effective it will be for LA-ICP-MS dating, given that ²⁰⁴Pb is difficult to measure at high 1390 1391 precision.

1392

1393 In summary, initial disequilibrium is clearly a major issue for the accuracy of U-Pb dating of1394 carbonates. The effect is significant for material of any age, but as we get to older

1395 carbonates, the analytical uncertainty contributions will begin to swamp the uncertainties 1396 surrounding disequilibrium. For dating of Neogene-Quaternary carbonates, prior knowledge 1397 of likely activity ratios (e.g. by measuring younger or present-day values of the precipitating 1398 fluid, and inferring no change back in time) is critical for precise and accurate dates. The 1399 variation in hydrothermal systems that mix meteoric water with older brines is likely to be 1400 large in terms of the degree of ²³⁴U excess. More information is needed to further 1401 understand what sort of values can be expected in different systems and different settings. 1402 From our preliminary compilation, it is apparent that ²³⁴U excess is the norm, rather than the 1403 exception. For now, the absolute values and uncertainties on young dates (late Neogene to 1404 Quaternary) with no estimation of the initial disequilibria should be treated with caution.

1405

1406 **11.7.3.** Dating old material – dealing with a potentially open system 1407 Many early carbonate dating studies were attempted on very old material, i.e. Proterozoic 1408 and Archaean (e.g. Moorbath et al., 1987; Jahn, 1998; Taylor and Kalsbeek, 1990; 1409 Whitehouse and Russell, 1997); these mostly utilised Pb-Pb dating. A major issue of the 1410 Pb-Pb method, is that Pb contents of crustal fluids are much higher than that of the primary 1411 carbonates, and therefore, even small amounts of fluid-related alteration can dominate the 1412 measured Pb-Pb composition and lead to an age that is not representative of primary 1413 carbonate precipitation (e.g. Sumner & Bowring, 1996). Although there have been a handful 1414 of studies dating old carbonate material since the 1990s (e.g. Ray et al., 2003; Sarangi et 1415 al., 2004; Babinski et al., 2007; Fairey et al., 2013), Pb-Pb and U-Pb dating of Precambrian 1416 material have become rarely used techniques. This is presumably due to the difficulty in 1417 obtaining meaningful primary ages of old material. The dominant reason for this difficulty 1418 can generally be distilled down to open-system behaviour, i.e. dating material that has 1419 remained a closed isotopic system since its formation is increasingly difficult with 1420 increasingly older material. This is simply because thermal- and/or fluid-induced mobility of 1421 parent and daughter isotopes becomes increasingly likely if the material has been exposed 1422 to multiple deformation-, burial-, uplift-, glaciation-, weathering- or fracture-related events. 1423

Early studies documented various transformative processes and their impact on Pb-Pb/UPb isotope systematics, e.g. fluid infiltration in limestone (Smith et al., 1991), diagenetic
change from aragonite to calcite (Jones et al., 1995), and resetting of Pb isotope signatures
during metamorphism (Russell et al., 1996; Whitehouse and Russell, 1997; Babinski et al.,

1428 1999). In general, the existence of some form of open-system behaviour within a given 1429 dataset has only been recognised through the isotopic data themselves, not through an 1430 independent dataset. This is simply achieved by assessing the robustness of the Pb-Pb or 1431 U-Pb data array with mathematical means, e.g. using the MSWD value, and explaining 1432 analytical scatter outside of a robust array as due to open system behaviour. With in situ 1433 methods, the approaches that we have described in Section 5 may allow for some 1434 independent removal of data that pertains to open-system behaviour, leaving a dataset that 1435 corresponds to a closed system.

1436

A method that has been utilised to screen for altered samples in whole-rock geochemistry, is to test for effects of modern weathering using ²³⁴U/²³⁸U ratios (Albut et al., 2019). Ancient samples should have measured ²³⁴U/²³⁸U activity ratios in-in secular equilibrium, and departure from this in a measured sample would imply a more recent addition or subtraction of ²³⁴U through weathering processes, indicating some modern fluid-rock interaction. This method of sample screening has not been applied to U-Pb dating, but we suggest is worthy of investigation.

1444

1445 In Figure 45 we documented various U-Pb datasets to demonstrate the range of behaviour 1446 that is seen with natural carbonates. Here we provide some additional comments regarding 1447 open-system behaviour, first in terms of U mobility, followed by that of Pb mobility. Uranium 1448 is mobile in oxidising fluids, so U enrichment and depletion relative to Pb is assumed to be 1449 the most common cause of open-system behaviour that will occur in natural carbonates. In Tera-Wasserburg space (²³⁸U/²⁰⁶Pb vs. ²⁰⁷Pb/²⁰⁶Pb), U mobility will be apparent as sub-1450 horizontal trends in the data, with movement to the right reflecting gain of ²³⁸U, and 1451 1452 movement to the left reflecting loss of ²³⁸U (see Figure 148). During a period of mobility, 1453 uranium may move into a fluid-phase, such that the remaining carbonate solid remains 1454 variably depleted in ²³⁸U, or, uranium may partially move from its original location to another 1455 within the measured sample volume. In the former, this can sometimes be detected from 1456 the isotopic data if a distinct departure from a robust regression is defined by a sub-1457 horizontal array (see Figures 45d and 18). In the latter case of uranium mobility, some 1458 domains will be depleted, whereas others will be enriched. This may be difficult to ascertain 1459 from the isotopic data alone if the mobility is pervasive through the material, because the 1460 induced scatter in the U-Pb regression (from both positive and negative movement in

²³⁸U/²⁰⁶Pb) cannot be resolved from other causes of scatter, such as mixing between
different age domains.





1464

Figure 18<u>4</u>. Tera-Wasserburg plots for LA-ICP-MS U-Pb data from two slicken-fibre calcite samples that exhibit potential open system behaviour caused by U mobility. Vectors for U loss and gain are schematic. Evidence for such U mobilisation requires additional lines of evidence that are currently lacking.

1469

1470 Lead can substitute for Ca in the calcite lattice, and is also insoluble in most upper crustal 1471 fluids, for these reasons, U mobility is generally considered in favour of Pb mobility. Fluid-1472 assisted mobility of U is certainly the most likely cause of open system behaviour because 1473 of the solubility of some U species. However, at high temperatures, solid-state diffusion is 1474 also a factor of for consideration. Based on experimental data, Pb diffusion in calcite is 1475 essentially slow enough to be non-existent below 300°C (when considering the composition 1476 of a grain 1 mm in diameter; Cherniak, 1997); however, at higher temperatures (>400°C), 1477 diffusion of lead is possible if encountered for long periods (> 20 Myrs). Empirical 1478 observations of Pb (or U) diffusion in calcite are lacking. Diffusion is unlikely in the low 1479 temperature calcites that have formed the basis of most modern LA-ICP-MS dating studies; 1480 however, carbonates form in a range of higher temperature environments as well, such as 1481 alteration veins within deeply subducted crust. Understanding how the calcite U-Pb system 1482 works at medium to high-metamorphic grades may therefore become very relevant 1483 information, allowing this chronometer to be used to understand dates and rates in deep 1484 crustal environments.

1486	7.4. Analytical	limitations

1487	At present, there is only one reference material in circulation that has been widely used and
1488	documented for the purpose of U-Pb normalisation (WC-1; Roberts et al., 2017). WC-1 has
1489	an uncertainty on its U/Pb ratio of 2.5% 2σ . Using this material for normalisation of U/Pb
1490	ratios, or for validation of the method accuracy, limits the final age uncertainty of any
1491	particular sample to ~2.5%. To improve beyond this range requires the characterisation of
1492	natural (or production and characterisation of U and Pb doped synthetic) materials, with a
1493	final U/Pb precision better than 2.5%. There is also a requirement for additional well
1494	characterised materials (i.e. those with robust U-Pb systematics and well documented ID U-
1495	Pb datasets) that can be used as secondary reference materials (i.e. those run as
1496	unknowns), for assessment of accuracy and long-term reproducibility.
1497	
1498	Another major limitation is the nature of carbonate matrices, and the lack of quantified data
1499	on the matrix effect between different carbonate minerals and structures. Inter-element
1500	fractionation (i.e. U/Pb in this case) is one of the major limitations on the reproducibility and
1501	accuracy of laser ablation U-Pb dating. For this reason, matching matrices of the reference
1502	material with that of the sample has been standard practise in U-bearing accessory mineral
1503	geochronology. Several groups have tried to limit the effect of this issue by utilising
1504	normalisation and data reduction procedures that reduce the effect (e.g. Burn et al., 2017;
1505	Neymark et al., 2018), but regardless of the matrix used for normalisation, validation of the
1506	method should still utilise a similar matrix to the sample. Carbonates clearly have a large
1507	range of structures, even with calcite, for example, sparry to micritic, with wide-ranging
1508	crystal/grain-sizes and porosity. Nuriel et al. (2019) noted differences between the use of
1509	coarse-grained sparry reference materials to fine-grained polycrystalline reference
1510	materials, with the latter being skewed towards older ages by several percent. To move
1511	towards better precision and accuracy of the LA-ICP-MS U-Pb method, it will be necessary
1512	to have a range of well characterised reference materials that cover variable carbonate
1513	mineralogy (e.g. aragonite, dolomite, calcite), as well as internal morphology and texture.
1514	
1515	
1516	12. Discussion
1517	LA-ICP-MS U-Pb carbonate geochronology has been demonstrated by this and previous
1518	studies, to offer a potentially robust technique to date the timing of carbonate mineral
I	

formation. Limitations on the technique arise from several challenges. These include the 1519 typically low U content of carbonates in many settings, the propensity for carbonate to 1520 1521 include significant concentrations of Pb upon formation, and the ease with which fluids can alter or reprecipitate mineral growth. LA-ICP-MS is an in situ technique, with high spatial 1522 1523 resolution compared to physical sampling for bulk dissolution studies, which enables many 1524 of the hurdles in carbonate geochronology to be overcome. Rare and localised high U 1525 domains can be located and sampled, a range of U/Pb ratios can be targeted to generate a spread in isochron regressions, and altered domains, inclusions and secondary 1526 1527 mineralisation can often be avoided.

1528

1529 Accurate and informative U-Pb carbonate geochronology demands careful imaging and 1530 petrographic analysis to establish a link between date and process. Various imaging techniques can be utilised prior to or after dating to aid with mineral characterisation, and 1531 1532 with refinement and interpretation of the resulting age data. We refer to this as image-1533 guided analysis. An alternative technique involves directly determining age data from 1534 image-based data itself, which we refer to as image-based analysis. Both techniques have 1535 their different benefits and applicability, and their efficacy depends on the instrumentation used and the type of material; for example, quadrupole ICP-MS is suited to image-based 1536 analysis, as a large element suite can be measured. Limitations on using guadrupole 1537 instrumentation are the detection limits for U and Pb when counting a large suite of 1538 1539 elements. In contrast, multi-collector instruments can be used for image-based analysis, 1540 and have a very low detection limit, but the mass range is restricted between Hg and U, meaning that additional elements useful for understanding the U and Pb distribution cannot 1541 be measured simultaneously. Overall, image-based analysis is only nascent in 1542 geochronology, and as such has not been fully explored. 1543

1544

1545 12.1. Limitations

There are several limitations to LA-ICP-MS U-Pb carbonate geochronology. The
heterogeneous nature of carbonate materials pose a problem that is difficult to circumvent.
The relatively high spatial resolution of laser ablation already offers the best solution to this
problem, but detection limits and the very low U and Pb contents mean that spots >150 µm
are commonly employed, hampering the full ability of laser ablation to target fine-scale (<
50 µm) zonation. Improvements in efficiency of ICP-MS instrumentation and of the ablation
process are possible solutions to his issue.

- 1554 At present, there is only one reference material in circulation that has been widely used and 1555 documented for the purpose of U-Pb normalisation (WC-1; Roberts et al., 2017). WC-1 has 1556 an uncertainty on its U/Pb ratio of 2.5% 2o. Using this material for normalisation of U/Pb 1557 ratios, or for validation of the method accuracy, limits the final age uncertainty of any 1558 particular sample to ~2.5%. To improve beyond this range requires the characterisation of natural (or production and characterisation of U and Pb doped synthetic) materials, with a 1559 1560 final U/Pb precision better than 2.5%. There is also a requirement for additional well characterised materials (i.e. those with robust U-Pb systematics and well documented ID U-1561 Pb datasets) that can be used as secondary reference materials (i.e. those run as 1562 1563 unknowns), for assessment of accuracy and long-term reproducibility. 1564 1565 Another major limitation is the nature of carbonate matrices, and the lack of quantified data 1566 on the matrix effect between different carbonate minerals and structures. Inter-element 1567 fractionation (i.e. U/Pb in this case) is one of the major limitations on the reproducibility and 1568 accuracy of laser ablation U-Pb dating. For this reason, matching matrices of the reference material with that of the sample has been standard practise in U-bearing accessory mineral 1569 1570 geochronology. Several groups have tried to limit the effect of this issue by utilising 1571 normalisation and date reduction procedures that reduce the effect (e.g. Burn et al., 2017; 1572 Neymark et al., 2018), but regardless of the matrix used for normalisation, validation of the method should still utilise a similar matrix to the sample. Carbonates clearly have a large 1573 1574 range of structures, even with calcite, for example, sparry to micritic, with wide-ranging crystal/grain-sizes and porosity. Nuriel et al. (2019) noted differences between the use of 1575 1576 coarse-grained sparry reference materials to fine-grained polycrystalline reference materials, with the latter being skewed towards older ages by several percent. To move 1577 towards better precision and accuracy of the LA-ICP-MS U-Pb method, it will be necessary 1578
- 1\$79 to have a range of well characterised reference materials that cover variable carbonate
- 1580 mineralogy (e.g. aragonite, dolomite, calcite), as well as internal morphology and texture.
- 1581
- 1582

12.2.8. Applications of carbonate geochronology

1583 To date, LA-ICP-MS U-Pb carbonate geochronology has been <u>utilised for applied to</u> a wide
1584 range of applications. These include the dating of speleothem deposition (Hopley et al.,
1585 2019; Scardia et al., 2019; Nicholson et al., 2020), brittle deformation (Roberts & Walker,

1586 2016; Ring & Gerdes, 2016; Goodfellow et al., 2017; Hansman et al., 2018; Parrish et al., 1587 2018; Beaudoin et al., 2018; Nuriel et al., 2017, 2019; Smeraglia et al., 2019), hydrocarbon 1588 migration (Holdsworth et al., 2019, 2020), hydrothermal ore mineralisation (Burisch et al., 1589 2017, 2019), hydrothermal and deep crustal fluid flow (Drake et al., 2017, 2019, 2020; 1590 Mazurek et al., 2018; Walter et al., 2018; Incerpi et al., 2019; MacDonald et al., 2019), 1591 pedogenesis (Methner et al., 2016; Liivamägi et al., 2019), ocean crust alteration (Coogan 1592 et al., 2016), diagenesis in sedimentary deposits (Li et al., 2014; Pagel et al., 2018; 1593 Mangenot et al., 201 ______8; Godeau et al., 2018; Lawson et al., 2018) and sedimentary 1594 deposition (Drost et al., 2018). Published dates range in age from 0.6 to 548 Ma (see 1595 Figure 195), MSWDs range from 0.2 to 89 (Figure 195a), and quoted uncertainties range 1596 from 0.6 to 143 % (2s; Figure 15b9B). The majority of dated samples so far range from the 1597 Neogene to Jurassic, with ~50% being Oligocene or younger. Across this age range, the 1598 uncertainty is variable and uncorrelated to age or MSWD, demonstrating that the age 1599 uncertainty reflects an interplay of factors, and includes the heterogeneous nature of 1600 carbonate materials. It should be noted however, that many dates with large uncertainties 1601 or mixed results are likely unpublished, biasing this compilation towards successful 1602 samples. For example, it is possible that many unreported and failed attempts at dating 1603 samples that are Palaeozoic and older have been made. We also note that many samples 1604 have reported age uncertainties better than the WC-1 RM, indicating that the systematic 1605 uncertainties have not been fully incorporated for these dates. 1606



1612 MSWD plotted against ²⁰⁶Pb/²³⁸U age; and B) Precision as 2s % plotted against ²⁰⁶Pb/²³⁸U

1613 age. The histograms in the background show the distribution of dates.

1615 A major benefit of carbonate geochronology is that carbonate minerals provide record an 1616 archive of data that can be linked to the age of formation. Fluid inclusions, stable isotopes 1617 (carbon and oxygen), radiogenic isotopes (strontium), and elemental compositions all 1618 reveal insight into the fluid composition that precipitated the mineral. This combination has 1619 long been an approach within the field of palaeohydrology; however, the timing of 1620 mineralisation and hence fluid-flow has generally involved only relative estimates with large 1621 uncertainties, or the dating of phases associated with higher-temperature activity (e.g., Re-1622 Os dating of Molybdenite). The addition of absolute chronological information is a critical 1623 step to understand the timing of fluid-flow through the crust in a range of settings, for 1624 example, within hydrocarbon-bearing basins, within ore-forming mineral systems, and 1625 within upper crustal bedrock that may be used to host anthropogenic waste/outputs (e.g. 1626 radioactive waste, storage and sequestration of CO₂).

1627

1628 A benefit of utilising LA-ICP-MS as a method of dating, is that the same crystals that have 1629 been dated can be measured for various other chemical proxies and signatures. Several 1630 previous studies have combined fluid inclusions and/or stable carbon and oxygen isotope 1631 analysis with LA-ICP-MS dating (e.g. Mangenot et al., 2018; Pagel et al., 2018; Goodfellow 1632 et al., 2016; Walter et al., 2018), but for most of these, it is not clear if the same volume of 1633 material, or simply the same genetic domain has been sub-sampled for both the dating as 1634 well the additional isotope analyses. Use of petrography and imaging allows for the same 1635 genetic domain to be analysed for several methods; however, there are also several 1636 approaches that allow for an overlapping analytical volume to be analysed. Dated material 1637 can be micro-drilled or -milled following laser ablation, with the powder being analysed for 1638 additional chemical information (e.g. Sr, C, O isotopes). Alternatively, thin sections or 1639 polished blocks can be analysed using a combination of in situ techniques, for example, ion 1640 microprobe measurement of stable isotope and/or elemental compositions, and laser 1641 ablation measurement of Sr isotopes, elemental compositions along with U-Pb dating. 1642 Drake et al. (2017, 2019, 2020) demonstrated the utility of combining ion microprobe stable 1643 carbon and oxygen isotope analysis with U-Pb dating to study palaeohydrology and ancient 1644 microbial activity.

1645

1646 In addition to traditional carbon and oxygen isotope measurements (δ^{13} C and δ^{18} O),

1647 clumped isotopes (Δ 47) can provide the temperature of mineral formation (e.g. Eiler, 2007).

1648 Several studies have demonstrated the combination of clumped isotope thermometry with
1649 dating (e.g. Quade et al., 2018; Mangenot et al., 2018; Lawson et al., 2017; MacDonald et

al., 2019). These apply the technique to the dating of paleosols for climatic records,

1651 diagenetic mineralisation for basin histories, and hydrothermal veins to understand crustal

1652 fluid-flow. This combination of techniques is a clear growth area with a range of applications

1653 across earth and environmental science.

1654

Finally, carbonates also comprise a host of major and trace metals that offer further isotopic information that has yet to be fully explored, for example, stable isotopes of Ca, Zn, Fe, and Cu. Linking these with U-Pb dates from the same material could provide high resolution records of natural fractionation processes in subsurface environments.

1659

1660 <u>9.</u> Conclusions

1661 <u>LA-ICP-MS U-Pb carbonate geochronology has been demonstrated by this and previous</u>

1662 <u>studies, to offer a potentially robust technique to date the timing of carbonate mineral</u>

1663 <u>formation.</u> Limitations on the technique arise from several challenges. These include the

1664 <u>typically low U content of carbonates in many settings, the propensity for carbonate to</u>

1665 include significant concentrations of Pb upon formation, and the ease with which fluids can

1666 <u>alter or reprecipitate mineral growth. LA-ICP-MS being an *in situ* technique, with high</u>

1667 <u>spatial resolution compared to physical sampling for bulk dissolution studies, enables many</u>

1668 of the hurdles in carbonate geochronology to be overcome.

1669

1670 Accurate and informative U-Pb carbonate geochronology demands careful imaging and

1671 petrographic analysis to establish a link between date and process. Various imaging

1672 <u>techniques can be utilised prior to or after dating to aid with mineral characterisation, and</u>

1673 with refinement and interpretation of the resulting age data. We refer to this as image-

1674 guided analysis. An alternative technique involves directly determining age data from

1675 image-based data itself, which we refer to as image-based analysis. Both techniques have

1676 their different benefits and applicability, and their efficacy depends on the instrumentation

1677 used and the type of material; for example, quadrupole ICP-MS is suited to image-based

1678 <u>analysis, as a large element suite can be measured. Limitations on using quadrupole</u>

1679 instrumentation are the detection limits for U and Pb when counting a large suite of

1680 elements. In contrast, multi-collector instruments can be used for image-based analysis,

1681 and have a very low detection limit, but the mass range is restricted between Hg and U,

1682	meaning that additional elements useful for understanding the U and Pb distribution cannot
1683	be measured simultaneously. Overall, image-based analysis is only nascent in
1684	geochronology, and as such has not been fully explored.
1685	
1686	Limitations on the accuracy of ages and their interpretation, comes from several sources.
1687	Variability in initial lead composition needs to be acknowledged when interpreting complex
1688	U-Pb data, and carbonates commonly have initial compositions that are different to that
1689	predicted by model estimates, e.g. Stacey & Kramers (1975). Disequilibrium in the U-Pb
1690	<u>decay chains is typically only explored in very young samples (<1 Ma), but can have a</u>
1691	potentially significant effect on the accuracy of ages throughout the Quaternary to Neogene.
1692	The variability in U isotope ratios in natural waters is a cause for concern in dating young
1693	material, and indicates that more work to understand the natural variability that can be
1694	expected in carbonate precipitates is required.
1695	
1696	Limitations on the technique arise from several challenges. These include the typically low
1697	U content of carbonates in many settings, the propensity for carbonate to include significant
1698	concentrations of Pb upon formation, and the ease with which fluids can alter or
1699	reprecipitate mineral growth. LA-ICP-MS is an <i>in situ</i> technique, with high spatial resolution
1700	compared to physical sampling for bulk dissolution studies, which enables many of the
1701	hurdles in carbonate geochronology to be overcome. Rare and localised high U domains
1702	can be located and sampled, a range of U/Pb ratios can be targeted to generate a spread in
1703	isochron regressions, and altered domains, inclusions and secondary mineralisation can
1704	often be avoided.
1705	
1706	13. <u>Accurate and informative U-Pb carbonate geochronology demands careful imaging</u>
1707	and petrographic analysis to establish a link between date and process. Various imaging
1708	techniques can be utilised prior to or after dating to aid with mineral characterisation, and
1709	with refinement and interpretation of the resulting age data. We refer to this as image-
1710	guided analysis. An alternative technique involves directly determining age data from
1711	image-based data itself, which we refer to as image-based analysis. Both techniques have
1712	their different benefits and applicability, and their efficacy depends on the instrumentation
1713	used and the type of material; for example, quadrupole ICP-MS is suited to image-based
1714	analysis, as a large element suite can be measured. Limitations on using quadrupole
1715	instrumentation are the detection limits for U and Pb when counting a large suite of
1	

- 1716 <u>elements. In contrast, multi-collector instruments can be used for image-based analysis,</u>
- 1717 and have a very low detection limit, but the mass range is restricted between Hg and U,
- 1718 meaning that additional elements useful for understanding the U and Pb distribution cannot
- 1719 <u>be measured simultaneously. Overall, image-based analysis is only nascent in</u>
- 1720 geochronology, and as such has not been fully explored.
- 1721 We have demonstrated the heterogeneous nature of carbonate minerals, in terms of U and
- 1722 Pb distribution and isotopic systematics. Although we have focused on vein-filling calcite,
- 1723 most of the issues highlighted in this paper are relevant to other carbonate dating
- 1724 applications. Various imaging techniques can be used to screen material, and to
- 1725 characterise U-Pb heterogeneity; a combination of these techniques is crucial to
- 1726 understand what exactly has been dated. Linking age information to spatial data, imagery
- 1727 or elemental maps, is crucial to understanding heterogeneous isotopic data. Two main
- 1728 approaches to dating have been presented, the traditional approach of static spot ablations
- 1729 guided by independent image data, and an alternative approach of age mapping using
- 1730 software analysis of 2D isotopic map data. Each of these approaches have benefits and
- 1731 drawbacks, and the choice between them will partly be governed by the instrumentation
- available. The applications of carbonate U-Pb geochronology are vast, with a key benefit to
 the laser ablation approach being that specific volumes of material can be analysed for
- several isotopic and elemental proxies and signatures, whilst also providing absolutechronological information. The LA-ICP-MS method is limited by factors that include the
- 1736 uncertainties on reference material isotope ratios, matrix effects and long-term
- 1737 reproducibility; taking these into consideration, the method is best applied to applications
- 1738 where age uncertainties of greater than 3-4% are of benefit. For applications where high
- 1739 precision (i.e. <1%) is required, such as calibration of palaeoclimate records or of
- evolutionary change, then follow-up analysis with ID is the only method that can potentiallyachieve the necessary precision. The future of the method in terms of accuracy and
- precision requires well characterised (by Isotope Dilution methods) reference materials
 covering a range of carbonate matrices. The range of studies published over the last five
 years (2014 to 2019) have revealed a wide array of geoscience applications that are both

amenable to, and benefit from, LA-ICP-MS U-Pb carbonate geochronology.

1745 1746

1747	14.10. Acknowledgements
1748	The authors acknowledge the Natural Environment Research Council for National
1749	Capability funding of the National Environmental Isotope Facility. N Roberts, D Condon, M
1750	Horstwood, A Milodowski and R Haslam publish with the permission of the Executive
1751	Director of the British Geological Survey. D Chew and K Drost acknowledge a Science
1752	Foundation Ireland grant (15/IA/3024) that is partly funded by the Geological Survey of
1753	Ireland and the Environmental Protection Agency, Ireland. HD acknowledges Swedish
1754	Research Council grant (2017-05186) and Formas grant (2017-00766). NR thanks Jeremy
1755	Rushton for continued support and interest in sample petrography, Joe Emmings for help
1756	with R, and Troy Rasbury, Randy Parrish and Chris Smith for discussion and
1757	encouragement during the 'early years' of carbonate dating at the BGS.
1758	
1759	
1760	
1761	15.11. Appendix
1762	15.1.11.1. Implications of age data
1763	The focus of this paper is not on the meaning of the age data presented, or its implications
1764	for faulting or fluid-flow; however, we provide brief information for interested readers.
1765	
1766	11.1. Figure 7a and 7b - Faroe Island brittle faults
1767	The significance of the Eocene ages has been discussed by Roberts & Walker (2016). This
1768	paper was the first to demonstrate the applicability of LA-ICP-MS U-Pb carbonate
1769	geochronology to dating brittle structures in the upper crust.
1770	
1771	15.2.11.2.Figure 7cExample_and 9 A and D - Variscan-related veins in the
 1772	Northumberland Basin
1773	The age of ca. 287 Ma for the dated calcite crystal can be linked to deformation of the host
1774	rock based on the vein structure. The calcite is taken from a planar fracture forming on the
1775	axial plane of a small fold that has accommodated bedding-plane sliding (Fig. 8). The
1776	fracture is filled with calcite mineralisation of the stretched vein type (Bons et al., 2012), and
1777	that is interpreted to have formed soon after opening of the vein, and synchronous with
1778	deformation. The age of ca. 287 Ma broadly overlaps with the intrusion of the Whin Sill (ca.
1779	297 Ma; Heaman pers. comm. within De Paola et al., 2005), and is therefore compatible

- with the model of partitioned transpression of De Paola et al. (2005), who suggest thatdeformation was synchronous with the Whin Sill intrusion.
- 1782
- 1783
 - 15.3. Example B Faroe Island brittle faults
- 1784 The significant of the Eocene ages has been discussed by Roberts & Walker (2016). This
- 1785 paper was the first to demonstrate the applicability of LA-ICP-MS U-Pb carbonate
- 1786 geochronology to dating brittle structures in the upper crust.
- 1787

1788

15.4.11.3. Figure 7d Example C - Sellafield fracture mineralisation

1789 Sample 877 was collected from the modern-day saline transition zone between the upper 1790 fresh groundwater system and the deeper saline basinal-basement groundwater system, at 1791 a depth of -635 m OD within the St Bees Sandstone Group (Triassic) in Sellafield borehole 1792 BH10A (equivalent to sample B697 and D750: Appendix Table S2, Milodowski et al., 2018). 1793 Externally, this calcite exhibits a "nailhead" (i.e. c-axis flattened) crystal habit (Figure 10). 1794 However, detailed petrographic analysis reveals it has a complex growth history: 1795 comprising of cores of c-axis-elongated calcite characteristic of the deeper saline 1796 groundwater that are syntaxially-overgrown by later equant and c-axis flattened calcite 1797 characteristic of the overlying fresh groundwater zone (Milodowski et al., 2018). The U-Pb 1798 analyses all come from within the saline groundwater zone type calcite core region (rather 1799 than the later freshwater-type overgrowth that has extremely low U).

1800

1801 Late-stage (generation "ME9") calcite is a characteristic feature of the present-day fracture-1802 controlled deep groundwater system in the Sellafield area of the west Cumbrian coastal 1803 plain (Milodowski et al., 2018). The resulting age suggests that ME9 calcite growth in the 1804 sampled fracture was initiated in the late Miocene, and has been preserved (or at least 1805 partially preserved until the present-day). The implication is that the modern groundwater 1806 system was developed following regional Miocene uplift and younger groundwater recharge 1807 relating to glaciations and/or uplift of the region, have not led to complete re-precipitation of 1808 fracture-filling calcite, with calcite precipitation continuing to the present-day. Taken 1809 together with other petrographic, stable isotope, strontium isotope, fluid inclusion, 1810 microchemical analyses and whole-crystal U-Th age dating, the age data support the 1811 interpretation that despite evidence for glacial recharge, the geochemical conditions (e.g.

pH, Eh) have remained stable over this period at potential repository depths (cf. Milodowskiet al., 2018).

1814

1815 <u>15.5.11.4. Figure 8 Example E and F</u> – Vein sets of the Bighorn Basin, Wyoming
1816 Thisese samples is are from a vein sets in the sedimentary cover of the Bighorn Basin, and
1817 is. These samples are part of a larger study that analysed the timing of deformation in the
1818 foreland of the Sevier and Laramide orogenies, and how this deformation propagated in
1819 time and space (Beaudoin et al., 2018). Sample BH11 is related to Laramide deformation,
1820 whereas sample BM18 is related to Sevier deformation.

1821

1822 <u>15.6.11.5.Figure 1Example 1</u>G - Moab fault

1823 This sample comprises multiple thin (1 to 5 mm wide) veins collected from the footwall 1824 damage zone of the Moab Fault in southeast Utah. Regional deformation is primarily driven 1825 by salt tectonics (Gutierrez, 2004), and salt dissolution has produced up to one km of offset 1826 within the sedimentary rocks along the Moab Fault (Foxford et al., 1996). Fault zone 1827 deformation was closely associated with fluid flow and carbonate cementation (Eichhubl et 1828 al., 2009; Hodson et al., 2016). Ar-Ar ages from clay fault gauge range from 63 to 43 Ma 1829 and are interpreted to record the final episodes of faulting and fracture generation (Pevear 1830 et al., 1997; Solum et al., 2005). Our new lower intercept age of 22 Ma is imprecise, but 1831 clearly younger than the early-Tertiary ages. This suggests that circulating fluids continued 1832 to move along the fault zone long after the cessation of fault related deformation.

1833

1834 **16.12.** References

- 1835 1. Akhurst, M.C., Chadwick, R.A., Holliday, D.W., McCormac, M., McMillan, A.A., 1836 Millward, D., Young, B., Ambrose, K., Auton, C.A., Barclay, W.J., Barnes, R.P., Beddoe-Stephens, B., James, J.W.C., Johnson, H., Jones, N.S., Glover, B.W., 1837 1838 Hawkins, M.P., Kimberll, G.S., MacPherson, K.A.T., Merrit, J.W., Milodowski, A.E., 1839 Riley, N.J., Robins, N.S., Stone, P. and Wingfield, R.T.R.: The geology of the west 1840 Cumbria district: Memoir of the British Geological Survey, Sheets 28, 37 and 47, 1841 British Geological Survey, Keyworth, UK, 1997 2.1. Albut, G., Kamber, B.S., Brüske, A., Beukes, N.J., Smith, A.J. and 1842 1843 Schoenberg, R.: Modern weathering in outcrop samples versus ancient paleoredox
- 1844 information in drill core samples from a Mesoarchaean marine oxygen oasis in

- 1845 Pongola Supergroup, South Africa. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta*, 265, 330-1846 353, 2019.
- Babinski, M., Van Schmus, W.R. and Chemale Jr, F.: Pb–Pb dating and Pb
 isotope geochemistry of Neoproterozoic carbonate rocks from the São Francisco
 basin, Brazil: implications for the mobility of Pb isotopes during tectonism and
 metamorphism. *Chemical Geology*, *160*, 175-199, 1999.
- 4.3. Babinski, M., Vieira, L.C. and Trindade, R.I.: Direct dating of the Sete Lagoas
 cap carbonate (Bambuí Group, Brazil) and implications for the Neoproterozoic glacial
 events. *Terra Nova*, *19*, 401-406, 2007.
- 1854 <u>5. Baker, A.J., Lever, M.C., Thorne, M.C., Tweed, C.J., Wikramaratna, R.S.,</u>
- 1855 Chambers, A.V., Fitzgerald, P.L., Ghabaee, K., Goodfield, M., Harris, A.W. and
 1856 Haworth, A.: NIREX 97: an assessment of the post-closure performance of a deep
 1857 waste repository at Sellafield, NIREX, UK, 1997.
- 1858 6.4. Baker, A., Smart, P.L., Barnes, W.L., Edwards, R.L. and Farrant, A.: The
 1859 Hekla 3 volcanic eruption recorded in a Scottish speleothem?. *The Holocene*, *5*, 3361860 342, 1995.
- 1861 7.5. Baker, A., Smith, C.L., Jex, C., Fairchild, I.J., Genty, D. and Fuller, L.:
 1862 Annually laminated speleothems: a review. *International Journal of Speleology*, *37*,
 1863 193-206, 2008.
- 1864 8.6. Barnaby, R.J. and Rimstidt, J.D.: Redox conditions of calcite cementation
 1865 interpreted from Mn and Fe contents of authigenic calcites. *GSA Bulletin*, *101*, 7951866 804, 1989.
- 1867 9. Bath, A., Richards, H., Metcalfe, R., McCartney, R., Degnan, P. and Littleboy, A.:
 1868 Geochemical indicators of deep groundwater movements at Sellafield, UK. *Journal* 1869 of Geochemical Exploration, 90, 24-44, 2006.
- 1870 <u>10.7.</u> Beaudoin, N., Lacombe, O., Roberts, N.M. and Koehn, D.: U-Pb dating of
 1871 calcite veins reveals complex stress evolution and thrust sequence in the Bighorn
 1872 Basin, Wyoming, USA. Geology, 46, 1015-1018, 2018.
- 1873 11. Bergman, S.C., Huntington, K.W. and Crider, J.G.: Tracing paleofluid sources using
 1874 clumped isotope thermometry of diagenetic cements along the Moab Fault,
 1875 Utah. American Journal of Science, 313, 490-515, 2013.
- 1876 <u>12.8.</u> Bertok, C., Barale, L., d'Atri, A., Martire, L., Piana, F., Rossetti, P. and
 1877 Gerdes, A., 2019. Unusual marbles in a non-metamorphic succession of the SW

- 1878 Alps (Valdieri, Italy) due to early Oligocene hydrothermal flow. International Journal1879 of Earth Sciences, 1-20, 2019.
- 1880 <u>13.9.</u> Bons, P.D., Elburg, M.A. and Gomez-Rivas, E.: A review of the formation of
 1881 tectonic veins and their microstructures. *Journal of Structural Geology*, *43*, 33-62,
 1882 2012.
- 1883 <u>14.10.</u> Brannon, J.C., Cole, S.C., Podosek, F.A., Ragan, V.M., Coveney, R.M.,
 1884 Wallace, M.W. and Bradley, A.J.: Th-Pb and U-Pb dating of ore-stage calcite and
 1885 Paleozoic fluid flow. *Science*, *271*, 491-493, 1996.
- 1886 <u>15.11.</u> Buckman, J.O., Corbett, P.W. and Mitchell, L.: Charge contrast imaging (CCI):
 1887 revealing enhanced diagenetic features of a coquina limestone. *Journal of* 1888 *Sedimentary Research*, *86*, 734-748, 2016.
- 1889 <u>16.12.</u> Burisch, M., Gerdes, A., Walter, B.F., Neumann, U., Fettel, M. and Markl, G.:
 1890 Methane and the origin of five-element veins: mineralogy, age, fluid inclusion
 1891 chemistry and ore forming processes in the Odenwald, SW Germany. Ore Geology
 1892 Reviews, 81, 42-61, 2017.
- 1893 <u>17.13.</u> Burisch, M., Walter, B.F., Gerdes, A., Lanz, M. and Markl, G.: Late-stage
 1894 anhydrite-gypsum-siderite-dolomite-calcite assemblages record the transition from a
 1895 deep to a shallow hydrothermal system in the Schwarzwald mining district, SW
 1896 Germany. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 223, 259-278, 2018.
- 1897 <u>18.14.</u> Burn, M., Lanari, P., Pettke, T. and Engi, M.: Non-matrix-matched
 1898 standardisation in LA-ICP-MS analysis: general approach, and application to allanite
 1899 Th–U–Pb dating. *Journal of analytical atomic spectrometry*, *32*, 1359-1377, 2017.
- 1900 19. Chan, M.A., Parry, W.T. and Bowman, J.R.: Diagenetic hematite and manganese
 1901 oxides and fault-related fluid flow in Jurassic sandstones, southeastern Utah. *AAPG* 1902 *bulletin*, *84*, 1281-1310, 2000.
- 1903 <u>20.15.</u> Cherniak, D.J.: An experimental study of strontium and lead diffusion in
 1904 calcite, and implications for carbonate diagenesis and metamorphism. *Geochimica et* 1905 *Cosmochimica Acta*, *61*, 4173-4179, 1997.
- 1906 24.<u>16.</u> Cole, J.M., Nienstedt, J., Spataro, G., Rasbury, E.T., Lanzirotti, A., Celestian,
 1907 A.J., Nilsson, M. and Hanson, G.N.: Phosphor imaging as a tool for in situ mapping
 1908 of ppm levels of uranium and thorium in rocks and minerals. *Chemical Geology*, *193*,
 1909 127-136, 2003.

80

- 1910 22.17. Cole, J.M., Rasbury, E.T., Hanson, G.N., Montañez, I.P. and Pedone, V.A.:
 1911 Using U-Pb ages of Miocene tufa for correlation in a terrestrial succession, Barstow
 1912 Formation, California. *Geological Society of America Bulletin*, *117*, 276-287, 2005.
- 1913 23.18. Coogan, L.A., Parrish, R.R. and Roberts, N.M.: Early hydrothermal carbon
 1914 uptake by the upper oceanic crust: Insight from in situ U-Pb dating. Geology, 44,
 1915 147-150, 2016.
- 1916 24.<u>19.</u> Cuthbert, S.J. and Buckman, J.O.: Charge contrast imaging of fine-scale
 1917 microstructure and compositional variation in garnet using the environmental
 1918 scanning electron microscope. *American Mineralogist*, *90*, 701-707, 2005.
- 1919 25. Davatzes, N.C., Eichhubl, P. and Aydin, A.: Structural evolution of fault zones in
 1920 sandstone by multiple deformation mechanisms: Moab fault, southeast
 1921 Utah. Geological Society of America Bulletin, 117, 135-148, 2005.
- 1922 <u>26.20.</u> De Paola, N., Holdsworth, R.E., McCaffrey, K.J. and Barchi, M.R.: Partitioned
- 1923transtension: an alternative to basin inversion models. Journal of Structural1924Geology, 27, 607-625, 2005.
- 192527.21.DeWolf, C.P. and Halliday, A.N.: U-Pb dating of a remagnetized Paleozoic1926limestone. Geophysical Research Letters, 18, 1445-1448, 1991.
- 1927 <u>28.22.</u> Drake, H., Heim, C., Hogmalm, K.J. and Hansen, B.T.: Fracture zone-scale
 1928 variation of trace elements and stable isotopes in calcite in a crystalline rock
 1929 setting. *Applied Geochemistry*, *40*, 11-24, 2014.
- 1930 29.23. Drake, H., Heim, C., Roberts, N.M.W., Zack, T., Tillberg, M., Broman, C.,
 1931 Ivarsson, M., Whitehouse, M.J. and Åström, M.E.: Isotopic evidence for microbial
 1932 production and consumption of methane in the upper continental crust throughout
 the Phanerozoic eon. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 470, 108-118, 2017.
- 1934 <u>24.</u>Drake, H., Mathurin, F.A., Zack, T., Schäfer, T., Roberts, N.M.W., Whitehouse, M.,
 1935 Karlsson, A., Broman, C. and Åström, M.E.: Incorporation of metals into calcite in a
 1936 deep anoxic granite aquifer. *Environmental science & technology*, *52*, 493-502,
 1937 2018.
- 1938 <u>30.25.</u> Drake, H., Roberts, N.M.W., Heim, C., Whitehouse, M.J., Siljeström, S.,
 1939 Kooijman, E., Broman, C., Ivarsson, M. and Åström, M.E., 2019. Timing and origin of
 1940 natural gas accumulation in the Siljan impact structure, Sweden. *Nature* 1941 communications, 10, 1-14.
- 194231.26.Drake, H., Tullborg, E.L., Hogmalm, K.J. and Åström, M.E.: Trace metal1943distribution and isotope variations in low-temperature calcite and groundwater in

- 1944 granitoid fractures down to 1 km depth. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta*, *84*, 217-1945 238, 2012.
- 1946 <u>32.27.</u> Drost, K., Chew, D., Petrus, J.A., Scholze, F., Woodhead, J.D., Schneider,
 1947 J.W. and Harper, D.A.: An Image Mapping Approach to U-Pb LA-ICP-MS Carbonate
 1948 Dating, and Applications to Direct Dating of Carbonate
- 1949 Sedimentation. Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems, 19, 4631-4648,
- 1950 DOI:10.1029/2018GC007850, 2018.
- 1951 <u>33.28.</u> Eichhubl, P., Davatz, N.C. and Becker, S.P.: Structural and diagenetic control
 1952 of fluid migration and cementation along the Moab fault, Utah. *AAPG bulletin*, *93*,
 1953 653-681, 2009.
- 1954 <u>34.29.</u> Eiler, J.M.: "Clumped-isotope" geochemistry—The study of naturally1955 occurring, multiply-substituted isotopologues. *Earth and planetary science*1956 *letters*, *26*2, 309-327, 2007.
- 1957 <u>35.30.</u> Engel, J., Woodhead, J., Hellstrom, J., Maas, R., Drysdale, R. and Ford, D.:
 1958 Corrections for initial isotopic disequilibrium in the speleothem U-Pb dating
 1959 method. *Quaternary Geochronology*, *54*, 101009, 2019.
- 196036.31.Engi, M., Lanari, P. and Kohn, M.J.: Significant ages—An introduction to1961petrochronology. *Reviews in Mineralogy and Geochemistry*, 83, 1-12, 2017.
- 1962 <u>37.32.</u> Fairey, B., Tsikos, H., Corfu, F. and Polteau, S.: U–Pb systematics in
 1963 carbonates of the Postmasburg Group, Transvaal Supergroup, South Africa: primary
 1964 versus metasomatic controls. *Precambrian Research*, *231*, 194-205, 2013.
- 1965 38.33. Field, L.P., Milodowski, A.E., Evans, D., Palumbo-Roe, B., Hall, M.R.,
 1966 Marriott, A.L., Barlow, T. and Devez, A.: Determining constraints imposed by salt
 1967 fabrics on the morphology of solution-mined energy storage cavities, through
 1968 dissolution experiments using brine and seawater in halite. *Quarterly Journal of*1969 *Engineering Geology and Hydrogeology*, *52*, 240-254, 2019.
- 1970 39.34. Flude, S., Lee, M.R., Sherlock, S.C. and Kelley, S.P.: Cryptic microtextures
 1971 and geological histories of K-rich alkali feldspars revealed by charge contrast
 1972 imaging. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology*, *163*, 983-994, 2012.
- 197340.35.Foxford, K.A., Garden, I.R., Guscott, S.C., Burley, S.D., Lewis, J.J.M., Walsh,1974J.J. and Watterson, J.: The field geology of the Moab fault, in: Geology and1975Description of the Description of the
- 1975 Resources of the Paradox Basin, Utah Geological Association, 25, 265-283, 1996.
- 1976 <u>41.36.</u> Godeau, N., Deschamps, P., Guihou, A., Leonide, P., Tendil, A., Gerdes, A.,
 1977 Hamelin, B. and Girard, J.P.: U-Pb dating of calcite cement and diagenetic history in

- 1978 microporous carbonate reservoirs: Case of the Urgonian Limestone,
- 1979 France. Geology, 46, 247-250, 2018.
- 42.37. Goodfellow, B.W., Viola, G., Bingen, B., Nuriel, P. and Kylander-Clark, A.R.:
 Palaeocene faulting in SE Sweden from U–Pb dating of slickenfibre calcite. Terra
 Nova, 29, 321-328, 2017.
- 1983 43.38. Grandia, F., Asmerom, Y., Getty, S., Cardellach, E. and Canals, A.: U–Pb
 1984 dating of MVT ore-stage calcite: implications for fluid flow in a Mesozoic extensional
 1985 basin from Iberian Peninsula. *Journal of Geochemical Exploration*, *69*, 377-380,
 1986 2000.
- 1987 <u>44.39.</u> Hansman, R.J., Albert, R., Gerdes, A. and Ring, U.: Absolute ages of multiple
 1988 generations of brittle structures by U-Pb dating of calcite. Geology, 46, 207-210,
 1989 2018.
- 1990 <u>45.40.</u> Hareyama, M., Tsuchiya, N., Takebe, M. and Chida, T.: Two dimensional
 1991 measurement of natural radioactivity of granitic rocks by photostimulated
 1992 luminescence technique. *Geochemical Journal*, *34*, 1-9, 2000.
- 1993 46. Heathcote, J.A. and Michie, U.M.: Estimating hydrogeological conditions over the
 1994 last 120 ka: an example from the Sellafield area, UK. *Journal of the Geological*1995 Society, 161, 995-1008, 2004.
- 1996 47.41. Hellwig, A., Voigt, S., Mulch, A., Frisch, K., Bartenstein, A., Pross, J., Gerdes,
 1997 A. and Voigt, T.: Late Oligocene to early Miocene humidity change recorded in
 1998 terrestrial sequences in the Ili Basin (south-eastern Kazakhstan, Central
 1999 Asia). Sedimentology, 65, 517-539, 2018.
- 48.42. Hodson, K.R., Crider, J.G. and Huntington, K.W.: Temperature and
 composition of carbonate cements record early structural control on cementation in a
 nascent deformation band fault zone: Moab Fault, Utah, USA. *Tectonophysics*, 690,
 240-252, 2016.
- 49.43. Holdsworth, R.E., McCaffrey, K.J.W., Dempsey, E., Roberts, N.M.W.,
 Hardman, K., Morton, A., Feely, M., Hunt, J., Conway, A. and Robertson, A.: Natural
 fracture propping and earthquake-induced oil migration in fractured basement
 reservoirs. Geology, in press, <u>DOI:10.1130/G46280.1</u>, 2019.
- 50.44. Hopley, P.J., Reade, H., Parrish, R., De Kock, M. and Adams, J.W.:
 Speleothem evidence for C3 dominated vegetation during the Late Miocene
 (Messinian) of South Africa. *Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology*, *264*, 75-89,
 2019.

- 2012 <u>51.45.</u> Horstwood, M.S.A., Košler, J., Gehrels, G., Jackson, S.E., McLean, N.M.,
- 2013 Paton, C., Pearson, N.J., Sircombe, K., Sylvester, P., Vermeesch, P. and Bowring,
- 2014 J.F.: Community-derived standards for LA-ICP-MS U-(Th-) Pb geochronology–
- 2015 Uncertainty propagation, age interpretation and data reporting. *Geostandards and* 2016 *Geoanalytical Research*, *40*, 311-332, 2016.
- 2017 <u>52.46.</u> Incerpi, N., Martire, L., Manatschal, G., Bernasconi, S.M., Gerdes, A.,
 2018 Czuppon, G., Palcsu, L., Karner, G.D., Johnson, C.A. and Figueredo, P.H.:
 2019 Hydrothermal fluid flow associated to the extensional evolution of the Adriatic rifted
 2020 margin: Insights from the pre-to post-rift sedimentary sequence (SE Switzerland, N
 2021 ITALY). Basin Research, in press, DOI:10.1111/bre.12370, 2019.
- 2022 <u>53.47.</u> Jahn, B.M.: Pb–Pb dating of young marbles from Taiwan. *Nature*, 332, 429,
 2023 1988.
- 202454.48.Jahn, B.M. and Cuvellier, H.: Pb-Pb and U-Pb geochronology of carbonate2025rocks: an assessment. *Chemical Geology*, *115*, 125-151, 1994.
- 2026 <u>55.49.</u> Johansen, T.E.S., Fossen, H. and Kluge, R.: The impact of syn-faulting
 2027 porosity reduction on damage zone architecture in porous sandstone: an outcrop
 2028 example from the Moab Fault, Utah. *Journal of Structural Geology*, *27*, 1469-1485,
 2029 <u>2005</u>. Johansson, Å. and Rickard, D., 1984. Isotopic composition of Phanerozoic ore
 2030 leads from the Swedish segment of the Fennoscandian Shield. *Mineralium*2031 *Deposita*, *19*(4), pp.249-255.
- 2032 <u>56.50.</u> Jones, C.E., Halliday, A.N. and Lohmann, K.C.: The impact of diagenesis on
 2033 high-precision U-Pb dating of ancient carbonates: An example from the Late
 2034 Permian of New Mexico. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, *134*, 409-423, 1995.
- 2035 <u>57.51.</u> Kelly, S.D., Newville, M.G., Cheng, L., Kemner, K.M., Sutton, S.R., Fenter, P.,
 2036 Sturchio, N.C. and Spötl, C.: Uranyl incorporation in natural calcite. *Environmental*2037 *Science & Technology*, *37*, 1284-1287, 2003.
- 2038 <u>58.52.</u> Kreissl, S., Gerdes, A., Walter, B.F., Neumann, U., Wenzel, T., Markl, G.:
 2039 Reconstruction of a >200 Ma multi-stage "five element" Bi-Co-Ni-Fe-As-S system in
 2040 the Penninic Alps, Switzerland. Ore Geology Reviews 95, 746-788, 2018.
- 2041 59.53. Kronfeld, J., Vogel, J.C. and Talma, A.S.: A new explanation for extreme
 2042 ²³⁴U/²³⁸U disequilibria in a dolomitic aquifer. *Earth and Planetary Science* 2043 *Letters*, 123, 81-93, 1994.
- 2044 <u>60.54.</u> Kylander-Clark, A.R., Hacker, B.R. and Cottle, J.M.: Laser-ablation split-2045 stream ICP petrochronology. *Chemical Geology*, *345*, 99-112, 2013.

- 2046 <u>61.55.</u> Langmuir, D.: Uranium solution-mineral equilibria at low temperatures with
 2047 applications to sedimentary ore deposits. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta*, *4*2,
 2048 547-569, 1978.
- 2049 62.56. Lawson, M., Shenton, B.J., Stolper, D.A., Eiler, J.M., Rasbury, E.T., Becker,
 2050 T.P., Phillips-Lander, C.M., Buono, A.S., Becker, S.P., Pottorf, R. and Gray, G.G.:
 2051 Deciphering the diagenetic history of the El Abra Formation of eastern Mexico using
 2052 reordered clumped isotope temperatures and U-Pb dating. GSA Bulletin, 130, 6172053 629, 2018.
- 205463.57.Lee, M.R., Hodson, M.E. and Langworthy, G.: Earthworms produce granules2055of intricately zoned calcite. *Geology*, *36*, 943-946, 2008.
- 2056 <u>64.58.</u> Li, Q., Parrish, R.R., Horstwood, M.S.A. and McArthur, J.M.: U–Pb dating of 2057 cements in Mesozoic ammonites. Chemical Geology, 376, 76-83, 2014.
- 2058 <u>65.59.</u> Liivamägi S, Šrodon J, Bojanowski M, Gerdes A, Stanek JJ, Williams L,
 2059 Szczerba M.: Paleosols on the Ediacaran basalts of the East European Craton: a
 2060 unique record of paleoweathering with minimum diagenetic overprint. Precambrian
 2061 Research, 316, 66-82, 2018.
- 2062 <u>66.60.</u> MacDonald, J.M., Faithfull, J.W., Roberts, N.M.W., Davies, A.J., Holdsworth,
 2063 C.M., Newton, M., Williamson, S., Boyce, A. and John, C.M.: Clumped-isotope
 2064 palaeothermometry and LA-ICP-MS U–Pb dating of lava-pile hydrothermal calcite
 2065 veins. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology*, *174*, 63, 2019.
- 2066 <u>67.61.</u> Machel, H.G.: Cathodoluminescence in calcite and dolomite and its chemical 2067 interpretation. *Geoscience Canada*, *12*, 139-147, 1985.
- 206868.62.Machel, H.G.: Application of cathodoluminescence to carbonate diagenesis,2069in: Cathodoluminescence in geosciences, edited by Pagel M., Barbin V., Blanc P.
- and Ohnenstetter D., Springer, Berlin, Heidelberg, Germany, 271-301, 2000.
- 2071 <u>69.63.</u> Mangenot, X., Gasparrini, M., Gerdes, A., Bonifacie, M. and Rouchon, V.: An
 2072 emerging thermochronometer for carbonate-bearing rocks: △47/(U-Pb). Geology, 46,
 2073 1067-1070, 2018.
- 207470.64.Maskenskaya, O.M., Drake, H., Broman, C., Hogmalm, J.K., Czuppon, G. and2075Åström, M.E.: Source and character of syntaxial hydrothermal calcite veins in2076Paleoproterozoic crystalline rocks revealed by fine-scale
- 2077 investigations. *Geofluids*, *14*, 495-511, 2014.
- 207871.65.Mazurek, M., Davis, D.W., Madritsch, H., Rufer, D., Villa, I.M., Sutcliffe, C.N.,2079De Haller, A. and Traber, D.: Veins in clay-rich aquitards as records of deformation

- and fluid-flow events in northern Switzerland. Applied Geochemistry, 95, 57-70,2081 2018.
- 2082 72.<u>66.</u> Methner, K., Mulch, A., Fiebig, J., Wacker, U., Gerdes, A., Graham, S.A. and
 2083 Chamberlain, C.P.: Rapid middle Eocene temperature change in western North
 2084 America. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 450, 132-139, 2016.
- 2085 <u>73.67.</u> Michie, U.M. and Bowden, R.A.: UK NIREX geological investigations at 2086 Sellafield. *Proceedings of the Yorkshire Geological Society*, *50*, 5-9, 1994.
- 2087 74.<u>68.</u> Milodowski, A.E., Bath, A. and Norris, S.: Palaeohydrogeology using
 2088 geochemical, isotopic and mineralogical analyses: Salinity and redox evolution in a
 2089 deep groundwater system through Quaternary glacial cycles. *Applied*2090 *geochemistry*, 97, 40-60, 2018.
- 2091 75. Milodowski, A.E., Gillespie, M.R., Naden, J., Fortey, N.J., Shepherd, T.J., Pearce,
 2092 J.M. and Metcalfe, R.: The petrology and paragenesis of fracture mineralization in
 2093 the Sellafield area, west Cumbria. *Proceedings of the Yorkshire Geological* 2094 Society, 52, 215-241, 1998.
- 2095 <u>76.69.</u> Milton, G.M. and Brown, R.M.: Adsorption of uranium from groundwater by
 2096 common fracture secondary minerals. *Canadian Journal of Earth Sciences*, *24*,
 2097 1321-1328, 1987.
- 2098 <u>70.</u>Moorbath, S., Taylor, P.N., Orpen, J.L., Treloar, P. and Wilson, J.F.: First direct
 2099 radiometric dating of Archaean stromatolitic limestone. *Nature*, *326*, 865-867, 1987.
- 2100 <u>71. Neymark, L.A., Holm-Denoma, C.S. and Moscati, R.J.: In situ LA-ICPMS U–Pb</u>
 2101 <u>dating of cassiterite without a known-age matrix-matched reference material:</u>
 2102 <u>Examples from worldwide tin deposits spanning the Proterozoic to the</u>
 2103 Tertiary. *Chemical Geology*, 483, 410-425, 2018.
- 2104 <u>72. Nicholson, S.L., Pike, A.W., Hosfield, R., Roberts, N.M.W., Sahy, D., Woodhead, J.,</u>
 2105 <u>Cheng, H., Edwards, R.L., Affolter, S., Leuenberger, M. and Burns, S.J., 2020.</u>
 2106 <u>Pluvial periods in Southern Arabia over the last 1.1 million-years. *Quaternary* 2107 *Science Reviews*, 229, DOI:10.1016/j.quascirev.2019.106112.
 </u>
- 2108 <u>73. Nuriel, P., Craddock, J., Kylander-Clark, A.R., Uysal, T., Karabacak, V., Dirik, R.K.,</u>
 2109 <u>Hacker, B.R. and Weinberger, R.: Reactivation history of the North Anatolian fault</u>
 2110 <u>zone based on calcite age-strain analyses. Geology, 47, 465-469, 2019.</u>
- 2111 77.74. Nuriel, P., Weinberger, R., Kylander-Clark, A.R.C., Hacker, B.R. and
 2112 Craddock, J.P.: The onset of the Dead Sea transform based on calcite age-strain
 2113 analyses. Geology, 45, 587-590, 2017.

- 2114 78.75. Osmond, J.K. and Cowart, J.B.: Ground water, in: Uranium-series
 2115 Disequilibrium: Applications to Earth, Marine, and Environmental Sciences, Second
 2116 Edition, edited by: Ivanovich, M. and Harmon, R.S., Clarendon Press, Oxford, UK,
 2117 290-330.
- 2118 <u>79.76.</u> Osmond, J.K. and Cowart, J.B.: The theory and uses of natural uranium 2119 isotopic variations in hydrology. *Atomic Energy Review*, *14*, 621-679, 1976.
- 2120 80.77. Osmond, J.K. and Cowart, J.B.: U-series nuclides as tracers in groundwater
 2121 hydrology, in: *Environmental tracers in subsurface hydrology, edited by* Cook P.G.,
 2122 and Herczeg A.L., Springer, Boston, MA, USA, 145-173, 2000.
- 81.78. Osmond, J.K., Rydell, H.S. and Kaufman, M.I.: Uranium disequilibrium in
 groundwater: an isotope dilution approach in hydrologic investigations. *Science*, *162*,
 997-999, 1968.
- 2126 82. Neymark, L.A., Holm-Denoma, C.S. and Moscati, R.J.: In situ LA-ICPMS U-Pb
 2127 dating of cassiterite without a known-age matrix-matched reference material:
 2128 Examples from worldwide tin deposits spanning the Proterozoic to the
 2129 Tertiary. Chemical Geology, 483, 410-425, 2018.
- 2130 83. Nuriel, P., Craddock, J., Kylander-Clark, A.R., Uysal, T., Karabacak, V., Dirik, R.K.,
 2131 Hacker, B.R. and Weinberger, R.: Reactivation history of the North Anatolian fault
 2132 zone based on calcite age-strain analyses. Geology, 47, 465-469, 2019.
- 2133 84.Nuriel, P., Weinberger, R., Kylander-Clark, A.R.C., Hacker, B.R. and Craddock, J.P.:
 2134 The onset of the Dead Sea transform based on calcite age-strain
 2135 analyses. Geology, 45, 587-590, 2017.
- Palin, R.M., Searle, M.P., Waters, D.J., Parrish, R.R., Roberts, N.M.W.,
 Horstwood, M.S.A., Yeh, M.W., Chung, S.L. and Anh, T.T.: A geochronological and
 petrological study of anatectic paragneiss and associated granite dykes from the Day
 Nui C on Voi metamorphic core complex, North Vietnam: constraints on the timing of
 metamorphism within the Red River shear zone. *Journal of Metamorphic Geology*, *31*, 359-387, 2013.
- 2142 86.80. Pagel, M., Bonifacie, M., Schneider, D.A., Gautheron, C., Brigaud, B.,
- Calmels, D., Cros, A., Saint-Bezar, B., Landrein, P., Sutcliffe, C. and Davis, D.:
 Improving paleohydrological and diagenetic reconstructions in calcite veins and
 breccia of a sedimentary basin by combining Δ47 temperature, δ¹⁸O_{water} and U-Pb
- 2146 age. Chemical Geology, 481, 1-17, 2018.

- 2147 <u>87.81.</u> Paquette, J. and Reeder, R.J.: Relationship between surface structure, growth
 2148 mechanism, and trace element incorporation in calcite. *Geochimica et*2149 *Cosmochimica Acta*, *59*, 735-749, 1995.
- 2150 <u>88.82.</u> Parrish, R.R., Parrish, C.M. and Lasalle, S.: Vein calcite dating reveals
 2151 Pyrenean orogen as cause of Paleogene deformation in southern England. Journal
 2152 of the Geological Society, 175, 425-442, 2018.
- 2153 <u>89.83.</u> Paton, C., Hellstrom, J., Paul, B., Woodhead, J. and Hergt, J.: lolite: Freeware
 2154 for the visualisation and processing of mass spectrometric data. *Journal of Analytical*2155 *Atomic Spectrometry*, *26*, 2508-2518, 2011.
- 2156 90.84. Paton, C., Woodhead, J.D., Hellstrom, J.C., Hergt, J.M., Greig, A. and Maas,
 2157 R.: Improved laser ablation U-Pb zircon geochronology through robust downhole
 2158 fractionation correction. *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems, 11*, Q0AA06,
 2159 DOI:10.1029/2009GC002618, 2010.
- 91.85. Perrette, Y., Delannoy, J.J., Desmet, M., Lignier, V. and Destombes, J.L.:
 Speleothem organic matter content imaging. The use of a Fluorescence Index to
 characterise the maximum emission wavelength. *Chemical Geology*, *214*, 193-208,
 2005.
- 2164 <u>92.86.</u> Petrus, J.A., Chew, D.M., Leybourne, M.I. and Kamber, B.S.: A new approach
 2165 to laser-ablation inductively-coupled-plasma mass-spectrometry (LA-ICP-MS) using
 2166 the flexible map interrogation tool 'Monocle'. *Chemical Geology*, *463*, 76-93, 2017.
- 93.87. Pevear, D.R., Vrolijk, P.J., Longstaffe, F.J., Hendry, J., Carey, P., Parnell, J.,
 Ruffell, A. and Worden, R.: Timing of Moab fault displacement and fluid movement
 integrated with burial history using radiogenic and stable isotopes. *Geofluids II*, *97*,
 42-45, 1997.
- 94.<u>88.</u> Pickering, R., Kramers, J.D., Partridge, T., Kodolanyi, J. and Pettke, T.: U–Pb
 dating of calcite–aragonite layers in speleothems from hominin sites in South Africa
 by MC-ICP-MS. *Quaternary Geochronology*, *5*, 544-558, 2010.
- 2174 <u>95.89.</u> Porcelli, D. and Swarzenski, P.W.: The behavior of U-and Th-series nuclides
 2175 in groundwater. *Reviews in Mineralogy and Geochemistry*, *52*, 317-361, 2003.
- 2176 <u>96.90.</u> Quade, J., Rasbury, E.T., Huntington, K.W., Hudson, A.M., Vonhof, H.,
 2177 Anchukaitis, K., Betancourt, J., Latorre, C. and Pepper, M.: Isotopic characterization
 2178 of late Neogene travertine deposits at Barrancas Blancas in the eastern Atacama
 2179 Desert, Chile. *Chemical Geology*, *466*, 41-56, 2017.
 - 88

- 2180 <u>97.91.</u> Rasbury, E.T. and Cole, J.M.: Directly dating geologic events: U-Pb dating of
 2181 carbonates. *Reviews of Geophysics*, *47*, 2009.
- 2182 <u>98.92.</u> Rasbury, E.T., Hanson, G.N., Meyers, W.J. and Saller, A.H.: Dating of the
 2183 time of sedimentation using U-Pb ages for paleosol calcite. *Geochimica et* 2184 *Cosmochimica Acta*, *61*, 1525-1529, 1997.
- 2185 <u>99.93.</u> Ray, J.S., Veizer, J. and Davis, W.J.: C, O, Sr and Pb isotope systematics of
 2186 carbonate sequences of the Vindhyan Supergroup, India: age, diagenesis,
 2187 correlations and implications for global events. *Precambrian Research*, *121*, 1032188 140, 2003.
- 2189 <u>100.94.</u> Reeder, R.J.: Interaction of divalent cobalt, zinc, cadmium, and barium with
 2190 the calcite surface during layer growth. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta*, *60*,
 2191 1543-1552, 1996.
- 2192 <u>101.95.</u> Reeder, R.J., Nugent, M., Lamble, G.M., Tait, C.D. and Morris, D.E.: Uranyl
 2193 incorporation into calcite and aragonite: XAFS and luminescence
 2194 studies. *Environmental Science & Technology*, *34*, 638-644, 2000.
- 2195 <u>102.96.</u> Reeder, R.J., Nugent, M., Tait, C.D., Morris, D.E., Heald, S.M., Beck, K.M.,
 2196 Hess, W.P. and Lanzirotti, A.: Coprecipitation of uranium (VI) with calcite: XAFS,
 2197 micro-XAS, and luminescence characterization. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica*2198 Acta, 65, 3491-3503, 2001.
- 2199 <u>103.97.</u> Regis, D., Warren, C.J., Mottram, C.M. and Roberts, N.M.W.: Using monazite
 2200 and zircon petrochronology to constrain the P–T–t evolution of the middle crust in
 2201 the Bhutan Himalaya. *Journal of Metamorphic Geology*, *34*, 617-639, 2016.
- 2202 104. Renne, P.R., Karner, D.B. and Ludwig, K.R.: Absolute ages aren't
 2203 exactly. *Science*, *282*, 1840-1841, 1998.
- 2204 <u>105.98.</u> Richards, D.A., Bottrell, S.H., Cliff, R.A., Ströhle, K. and Rowe, P.J.: U-Pb
 2205 dating of a speleothem of Quaternary age. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta*, *62*,
 2206 3683-3688, 1998.
- 2207 <u>106.99.</u> Richter, D.K., Götte, T., Götze, J. and Neuser, R.D.: Progress in application of
 2208 cathodoluminescence (CL) in sedimentary petrology. *Mineralogy and Petrology*, *79*,
 2209 127-166, 2003.
- 2210 <u>107.100.</u> Ring, U. and Gerdes, A.: Kinematics of the Alpenrhein-Bodensee graben
 2211 system in the Central Alps: Oligocene/Miocene transtension due to formation of the
 2212 Western Alps arc. Tectonics, 35, 1367-1391, 2016.

- 108.101. Roberts, N.M.W., Rasbury, E.T., Parrish, R.R., Smith, C.J., Horstwood,
 M.S.A. and Condon, D.J.: A calcite reference material for LA-ICP-MS U-Pb
 geochronology. Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems, 18, 2807-2814, 2017.
- 2216 109.102. Roberts, N.M.W. and Walker, R.J.: U-Pb geochronology of calcite-mineralized
 2217 faults: Absolute timing of rift-related fault events on the northeast Atlantic
- 2218 margin. Geology, 44, 531-534, 2016.
- 110.103. Robertson, K., Gauvin, R. and Finch, J.: Application of charge contrast
 imaging in mineral characterization. *Minerals Engineering*, *18*, 343-352, 2005.
- <u>104. Romer, R.L. and Wright, J.E., 1993. Lead mobilization during tectonic reactivation</u>
 <u>of the western Baltic Shield. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta*, *57*, 2555-2570.
 </u>
- 111.105. Russell, J., Chadwick, B., Rao, B.K. and Vasudev, V.N.: Whole-rock PbPb
 isotopic ages of Late Archaean limestones, Karnataka, India. *Precambrian Research*, 78, 261-272, 1996.
- 2226 <u>112.106.</u> Sarangi, S., Gopalan, K. and Kumar, S.: Pb–Pb age of earliest megascopic,
 2227 eukaryotic alga bearing Rohtas Formation, Vindhyan Supergroup, India:
 2228 implications for Precambrian atmospheric oxygen evolution. *Precambrian*2229 *Research*, *132*, 107-121, 2004.
- 2230 <u>113.107.</u> Savard, M.M., Veizer, J. and Hinton, R.: Cathodoluminescene at low Fe and
 2231 Mn concentrations; a SIMS study of zones in natural calcites. *Journal of*2232 *Sedimentary Research*, *65*, 208-213, 1995.
- 2233 <u>114.108.</u> Scardia, G., Parenti, F., Miggins, D.P., Gerdes, A., Araujo, A.G. and Neves,
 2234 W.A.: Chronologic constraints on hominin dispersal outside Africa since 2.48 Ma
 2235 from the Zarqa Valley, Jordan. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, *219*, 1-19, 2019.
- 2236 <u>115-109.</u> Shopov, Y.Y., Ford, D.C. and Schwarcz, H.P.: Luminescent microbanding in
 2237 speleothems: high-resolution chronology and paleoclimate. *Geology*, *22*, 407-410,
 2238 1994.
- 2239 <u>116.110.</u> Smeraglia, L., Aldega, L., Billi, A., Carminati, E., Di Fiore, F., Gerdes, A.,
 2240 Albert, R., Rossetti, F. and Vignaroli, G.: Development of an intra-wedge tectonic
 2241 mélange by out-of-sequence thrusting, buttressing, and intraformational rheological
 2242 contrast, Mt. Massico ridge, Apennines, Italy. Tectonics, 38, 1223-1249, 2019.
- 2243 <u>117.111.</u> Smith, P.E. and Farquhar, R.M.: Direct dating of Phanerozoic sediments by
 2244 the 238U–206Pb method. *Nature*, *341*, 518, 1989.

- 2245 <u>118.112.</u> Smith, P.E., Farquhar, R.M. and Hancock, R.G.: Direct radiometric age
 2246 determination of carbonate diagenesis using U-Pb in secondary calcite. *Earth and* 2247 *Planetary science letters*, *105*, 474-491, 1991.
- 119.113. Solum, J.G., van der Pluijm, B.A. and Peacor, D.R.: Neocrystallization, fabrics
 and age of clay minerals from an exposure of the Moab Fault, Utah. *Journal of Structural Geology*, 27, 1563-1576, 2005.
- 2251 <u>120.114.</u> Stacey, J.T. and Kramers, J.: Approximation of terrestrial lead isotope
 2252 evolution by a two-stage model. *Earth and planetary science letters*, *26*, 207-221,
 2253 1975.
- 2254 <u>121.115.</u> Stübner, K., Grujic, D., Parrish, R.R., Roberts, N.M., Kronz, A., Wooden, J.
 2255 and Ahmad, T.: Monazite geochronology unravels the timing of crustal thickening in
 2256 NW Himalaya. *Lithos*, *210*, 111-128, 2014.
- 2257 <u>122.116.</u> Sturchio, N.C., Antonio, M.R., Soderholm, L., Sutton, S.R. and Brannon, J.C.:
 2258 Tetravalent uranium in calcite. *Science*, *281*, 971-973, 1998.
- 2259 <u>123.117.</u> Suksi, J., Rasilainen, K. and Pitkänen, P.: Variations in 234U/238U activity
 2260 ratios in groundwater—A key to flow system characterisation?. *Physics and*2261 *Chemistry of the Earth, Parts A/B/C, 31,* 556-571, 2006.
- 2262 <u>124.118.</u> Sumner, D.Y. and Bowring, S.A.: U-Pb geochronologic constraints on
 2263 deposition of the Campbellrand Subgroup, Transvaal Supergroup, South
 2264 Africa. *Precambrian Research*, *79*, 25-35, 1996.
- 125.119. Taylor, P.N. and Kalsbeek, F.: Dating the metamorphism of Precambrian
 marbles: Examples from Proterozoic mobile belts in Greenland. *Chemical Geology: Isotope Geoscience Section*, *86*, 21-28, 1990.
- 126.120. Trudgill, B.D.: Evolution of salt structures in the northern Paradox Basin:
 Controls on evaporite deposition, salt wall growth and supra-salt stratigraphic
 architecture. *Basin Research*, 23, 208-238, 2011.
- 427.121. Tullborg, E.L., Drake, H. and Sandström, B.: Palaeohydrogeology: a
 methodology based on fracture mineral studies. *Applied Geochemistry*, 23, 1881 1897, 2008.
- 128.122. Ukar, E. and Laubach, S.E.: Syn-and postkinematic cement textures in
 fractured carbonate rocks: Insights from advanced cathodoluminescence
 imaging. *Tectonophysics*, *690*, 190-205, 2016.
- 2277 429.123. Uysal, I.T., Feng, Y.X., Zhao, J.X., Bolhar, R., Işik, V., Baublys, K.A., Yago, A.
 2278 and Golding, S.D.: Seismic cycles recorded in late Quaternary calcite veins:

- geochronological, geochemical and microstructural evidence. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 303, 84-96, 2011.
- 130.124. Walter, B.F., Gerdes, A., Kleinhanns, I.C., Dunkl, I., von Eynatten, H., Kreissl,
 S. and Markl, G.: The connection between hydrothermal fluids, mineralization,
 tectonics and magmatism in a continental rift setting: Fluorite Sm-Nd and hematite
 and carbonates U-Pb geochronology from the Rhinegraben in SW
- 2285 Germany. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 240, 11-42, 2018.
- 2286 <u>131.125.</u> Warren, C.J., Singh, A.K., Roberts, N.M.W., Regis, D., Halton, A.M. and
 2287 Singh, R.B.: Timing and conditions of peak metamorphism and cooling across the
 2288 Zimithang Thrust, Arunachal Pradesh, India. *Lithos*, 200, 94-110, 2014.
- 132.126. Watt, G.R., Griffin, B.J. and Kinny, P.D.: Charge contrast imaging of
 geological materials in the environmental scanning electron microscope. *American Mineralogist*, *85*, 1784-1794, 2000.
- 2292 <u>133.127.</u> Weremeichik, J.M., Gabitov, R.I., Thien, B.M. and Sadekov, A.: The effect of
 2293 growth rate on uranium partitioning between individual calcite crystals and
 2294 fluid. *Chemical Geology*, *450*, 145-153, 2017.
- 2295 <u>134.128.</u> Wendt, I. and Carl, C.: The statistical distribution of the mean squared
 2296 weighted deviation. *Chemical Geology: Isotope Geoscience Section*, *86*, 275-285,
 2297 1991.
- 2298 <u>135.129.</u> Whitehouse, M.J. and Russell, J.: Isotope systematics of Precambrian
 2299 marbles from the Lewisian complex of northwest Scotland: implications for Pb Pb
 2300 dating of metamorphosed carbonates. *Chemical Geology*, *136*, 295-307, 1997.
- 436.130. Williams, R.T., Goodwin, L.B., Sharp, W.D. and Mozley, P.S.: Reading a
 400,000-year record of earthquake frequency for an intraplate fault. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, *114*, 4893-4898, 2017.
- 2304 <u>137.131.</u> Woodhead, J., Hellstrom, J., Maas, R., Drysdale, R., Zanchetta, G., Devine,
 2305 P. and Taylor, E.: U–Pb geochronology of speleothems by MC-ICPMS. *Quaternary*2306 *Geochronology*, 1, 208-221, 2006.
- 2307 <u>132.</u>Woodhead, J., Hellstrom, J., Pickering, R., Drysdale, R., Paul, B. and Bajo, P.: U
 2308 and Pb variability in older speleothems and strategies for their
- chronology. *Quaternary Geochronology*, *14*, 105-113, 2012.
- 2310 138.133. Woodhead, J. and Petrus, J., 2019. Exploring the advantages and limitations
 2311 of in situ U–Pb carbonate geochronology using speleothems. *Geochronology*, 1,
 2312 69-84.

- 2313 <u>139.134.</u> Woodhead, J.D., Sniderman, J.K., Hellstrom, J., Drysdale, R.N., Maas, R.,
 2314 White, N., White, S. and Devine, P.: The antiquity of Nullarbor speleothems and
 2315 implications for karst palaeoclimate archives. *Scientific reports*, *9*, 603, 2019.
- 2316 <u>140.135.</u> Yokoyama, T., Kimura, J.I., Mitsuguchi, T., Danhara, T., Hirata, T., Sakata, S.,
- 2317 Iwano, H., Maruyama, S., Chang, Q., Miyazaki, T. and Murakami, H.: U-Pb dating
- 2318 of calcite using LA-ICP-MS: Instrumental setup for non-matrix-matched age dating
 - and determination of analytical areas using elemental imaging. GeochemicalJournal, 52, 531-540, 2018.