1 The use of ASH-15 flowstone as a matrix-matched reference material for laser-ablation

U-Pb geochronology of calcite

3	Perach Nuriel ¹ , Jörn-Frederik Wotzlaw ² , Maria Ovtcharova ³ , Anton Vaks ¹ , Ciprian Stremtan ⁴ ,
4	Martin Šala ⁵ , Nick M. W. Roberts ⁶ , and Andrew R. C. Kylander-Clark ⁷
5	
6	¹ Geological Survey of Israel, 32 Yeshayahu Leibowitz St. Jerusalem, 9692100, Israel
7	² Institute of Geochemistry and Petrology, ETH Zurich, Clausiusstrasse 25 I CH-8092 Zurich,
8	Switzerland
9	³ Department of Earth Sciences, University of Geneva, Geneva, Switzerland
10	⁴ Teledyne Photon Machines, 384 Gallatin Park Drive, Bozeman, MT 59715, USA
11	⁵ Department of Analytical Chemistry, National Institute of Chemistry, Hajdrihova 19, SI-1000
12	Ljubljana, Slovenia.
13	⁶ Geochronology and Tracers Facility, British Geological Survey, Environmental Science
14	Centre, Nottingham, NG12 5GG, UK
15	⁷ Department of Earth Science, University of California, Santa Barbara, CA 93106, USA.
16	
17	Abstract

Latest advances in laser ablation inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometer (LA-ICPMS) allow for accurate *in-situ* U-Pb dating of carbonate material, with final age uncertainties usually >3% 2σ. Cross-laboratory reference materials (RMs) used for sample-bracketing are currently limited to WC1 calcite with an age of 254.4 ± 6.5 (2 σ). The minimum uncertainty on any age determination with the LA-ICPMS method is therefore $\geq 2.5\%$, and validation by secondary RMs is usually performed on in-house standards. This contribution present a new reference material, ASH-15, a flowstone that is dated here by isotope dilution (ID) TIMS analysis using 37 sub-samples, 1-7 mg each. Age results presented here are slightly younger compared to

previous ID-IRMS U-Pb dates of ASH-15, but within uncertainties and in agreement with in-26 situ analyses using WC1 as the primary RM. We provide new correction parameters to be used 27 as primary or secondary standardization. The suggested ²³⁸U/²⁰⁶Pb apparent age, not corrected 28 for disequilibrium and without common-lead anchoring, is 2.965 ± 0.011 Ma (uncertainties are 29 95% confidence intervals). The new results could improve the propagated uncertainties on the 30 final age with a minimal value of 0.4%, which is approaching the uncertainty of typical ID 31 32 analysis on higher-U materials such as zircon. We show that although LA-ICPMS spot analyses of ASH-15 exhibit significant scatter in their isotopic ratios, the down-hole fractionation of 33 34 ASH-15 is similar to that of other reference materials. This high-U (~1 ppm) and low Pb (<0.01 ppm) calcite is most appropriate as a reference material for other speleothem-type carbonates 35 but requires more-sensitive ICP-MS instruments such as the new generation of single-collector 36 and multi-collector ICP-MS. Reference materials with high Pb and low U or both low U and 37 Pb compositions are still needed to fully cover the compositional range of carbonate material 38 but may introduce analytical challenges. 39

40 Introduction

41 Recent advances in laser ablation techniques applied to multi-phase carbonates allow for accurate dating of a variety of sample types, including calcite cements (Li et al., 2014; Godeau 42 et al., 2018; Anjiang et al., 2019; Holdsworth et al., 2019), hydrothermal veins (Coogan et al., 43 2016; MacDonald et al., 2019; Piccione et al., 2019), fault-related veins, breccia cement, and 44 slickenfibers (Ring and Gerdes, 2016; Roberts and Walker, 2016; Goodfellow et al., 2017; 45 Nuriel et al., 2017; Hansman et al., 2018; Parrish et al., 2018; Nuriel et al., 2019), and 46 47 speleothems (Woodhead and Petrus, 2019). With increasing attention to climatic, seismic, and environmental events in the geological record, there is a growing need for dating techniques 48 that can be accurate and easily implemented for samples at the sub-millimeter scale. This newly 49

emerging technique has the potential to contribute to our understanding of the duration, rate,and extent of these important events in the geological record.

The *in-situ* approach has a great research potential for studying texturally complex samples 52 because it can resolve problems of age mixing of different phases or averaging of continuous 53 growth at the sub-millimeter scale, and thus increase the overall accuracy of the dated material. 54 While the precision of traditional isotope-dilution (ID) U-Pb analyses is still favorable (<1%) 55 2σ) (Woodhead and Petrus, 2019), the increasing analytical development of the LA-ICPMS 56 method indicates the potential for improving the currently reported uncertainties (usually >3%57 2σ). Finding the right matrix-matched reference material (RM) is a major hurdle for LA 58 analyses of carbonates because of the variety of mineralogy (calcite, dolomite, and aragonite), 59 60 textures, composition (e.g. high-magnesium calcite, high common-lead), and ages (e.g. low radiogenic lead in young samples). Textural differences such as microcrystalline, fine- and 61 62 coarse-grained material, between the unknown and RMs can contribute to high uncertainties due to differences in ablation efficiency, down-hole fractionation, and differences in crater 63 morphology (e.g. Guillong et al., 2020 and Elisha et al, 2020, this issue). Observed deviations 64 are potentially up to 20% of the final intercept age depending on the degree of crater geometry 65 mismatch and are related either to downhole fractionation and/or matrix effects (Guillong et 66 67 al., 2020).

68 Currently, the most commonly used procedure for mass-bias correction in the LA method, is 69 by standard-sample bracketing. For this, the ²³⁸U/²⁰⁶Pb LA-age of the RMs is corrected to the 70 true RM's ²³⁸U/²⁰⁶Pb apparent age (not corrected for disequilibrium) as measured 71 independently by an ID-IRMS method (ID-TIMS or ID-MC-ICPMS). The RMs are measured 72 throughout each session along with the unknown samples, and a normalization factor is applied 73 to correct both the RMs and the unknowns. Uncertainty propagation onto the age of the 74 unknowns includes the uncertainties of the 'true' RM age. As a result, the accuracy of the LA analyses can only be as good as the uncertainties on the age of the RMs which is by itself subjected to analytical challenges due to natural heterogeneities, impurities, and textural complexities at the sub-millimetre scale. It is therefore essential that the 'true age' of the reference material will reflect these complexities while maintaining minimal uncertainties.

Currently, several in-house standards are being used as reference materials, including Duff 79 Brown Tank (64 Ma; Hill et al., 2016), and JT (13.797 ± 0.031 Ma; Guillong et al., 2020). The 80 only well-characterized reference material that is distributed across laboratories is the WC1 81 calcite with an age of 254.4 \pm 6.5 2 σ (2.5%) (Roberts et al., 2017). The use of WC1 alone for 82 mass-bias correction has several disadvantages. First, it is highly recommended with all in situ 83 84 U-Th-Pb geochronology to use secondary RMs to validate any correction parameters that are being used, and to appropriately propagate uncertainties. Second, the relatively high 85 uncertainty (2.5%) on the age of WC1 sets a minimal uncertainty on any LA U-Pb age 86 87 determination. Finally, the quantity of the WC1 sample that is currently available for future work is limited and is likely to not fully meet the growing demands of the LA scientific 88 community; although we note here that there is a potential for further sample collection from 89 the original site. 90

This contribution introduces a new carbonate reference material that can be widely used 91 1 for *in-situ* dating of calcite as primary or as cross-reference material with other available 92 standards. We characterise the reference material at various resolutions using a 93 94 combination of (1) laser ablation imaging (20 µm square beam); (2) LA spot analysis, ~80-110 µm in diameter, conducted on both single-collector and multi-collector (MC) 95 inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometer (ICP-MS); and (3) ID-TIMS analyses of 37 96 sub-samples (~1-7 mg aliquots). We discuss several key issues related to the use of ASH-97 15 sample as a RM, including down-hole fractionation, heterogeneities, and previous bulk 98

99

analyses, to provide the best correction parameters and suggested protocols for users of the

100

LA scientific community. The ASH-15 flowstone

The ASH-15 flowstone was found in Ashalim Cave, a karstic cave in the central Negev Desert 101 (30°56'36.2" N, 34°44'22.5" E), southern Israel, which is part of the northern margin of the 102 Saharan–Arabian desert belt. The cave entrance is located at an elevation of 414 m above sea 103 level and 67 km SE from the Mediterranean Sea coast. The cave is a three-dimensional 104 hypogene maze with a total length of 540 m, situated in Turonian limestone rock strata, at 105 depths of 0-31 m below the surface. The cave is richly decorated with vadose speleothems, 106 such as stalagmites, stalactites and flowstone, which are not active today because of the aridity 107 108 of the climate in the area (Vaks et al, 2010, 2018), but periods of their deposition correspond 109 to past episodes of wet climate in present-day desert. The thickness of the speleothems varies from several cm to a few tens of cm. The soil above the cave is silicate loess, originated mainly 110 from aeolian dust (Crouvi et al., 2010) and the present day vegetation is composed of sparse 111 xeric shrubs with <10% vegetation cover. 112

113 The vadose speleothems of Ashalim Cave are composed of low-Mg calcite, and are divided into a relatively thick Pliocene Basal layer, and thinner Pleistocene layers above it. The Basal 114 layer varies from 5 to 25 cm in thickness and comprises c. 90% of the speleothem volume in 115 the cave. It is composed of massive yellow calcite crystals (Fig. 1a-b), often showing 116 continuous growth in stalagmites and flowstone, suggesting deposition from continuously 117 dripping water. In all speleothems the Basal layer is terminated at its top by a <1 mm layer of 118 microcrystalline calcite, evaporite minerals and reddish clays (Fig. 1a), that is interpreted as a 119 hiatus (growth break) separating the Basal Pliocene layer and Quaternary layers above it (Vaks 120 et al., 2013). The thickness of Pleistocene top layers varies from several mm to 17 cm, but 121 usually does not exceed a few cm, comprising about 10% of the speleothem volume in the cave. 122 123 It is composed of alternating layers of brown calcite, with the youngest top layer (where found)

composed of yellow calcite. Several variably colored layers <1 mm thick of microcrystalline
calcite, evaporite minerals and reddish clays are found within the columnar crystalline structure,
suggesting hiatuses in speleothem deposition (Vaks et al., 2013).

The youngest periods of speleothem deposition in several Ashalim Cave speleothems were 127 dated by the ²³⁸U-²³⁰Th method and occurred from 221 ka to 190 ka and from 134 to 114 ka 128 (Vaks et al, 2010). Earlier periods of deposition were dated by the U-Pb method on ASH-15 129 flowstone at 1.272 ± 0.018 Ma (ASH-15-C), and the Basal layer of ASH-15 flowstone (layers 130 D-K) at c. ~3.1 Ma (Fig 1a). These layers have been dated in three different labs following 131 several protocols for ID analysis (Vaks et al., 2013; Mason et al., 2013). The U concentrations 132 in speleothem calcite range between 1.9 and 19.7 μ g/g and the amounts of non-radiogenic Th 133 are negligible (Vaks et al., 2010). 134



135

Figure 1. Sample ASH-15 from Ashalim Cave. (a) ~5 kg block of sample ASH-15 flowstone consisting of the massive Pliocene yellow Basal layer (>2 cm calcite crystals; section D–K) and the brown Quaternary layer (top section, A–C), the thin layer between the two stratigraphic members represents a growth break (hiatus). The main U-Pb ages of Vaks et al., 2013 are indicated; (b) In-situ flowstone within Ashalim Cave from which ASH-15 was sampled, showing the large reservoir of this flowstone.

143 2

Sample ASH-15 textural characterization

The ASH-15 thin-section includes section D and E (see location in Fig.1a). Overall the thin-144 section examination indicates that the original texture is preserved with consistent growth 145 146 direction, no observed hiatus, and no indications for dissolution and recrystallization. A spot analysis array, 85 µm in diameter, targeted along growth zone and along growth direction is 147 visible in Fig. 2a-c. The ASH-15 sample shows no luminescence under cathodoluminescence 148 149 light (Fig. 2c), suggesting formation under oxidising conditions. The slight bright luminescence observed within grain boundaries, discontinuities, and veins (arrows in Fig. 2b-c) may suggest 150 the presence of fluid inclusions, textural differences, or some local replacement within these 151 areas. These areas should be avoided if possible during spot analysis. The relatively 152 homogenous low luminescence may suggest for a single-phase continuous calcite growth, 153 whereby precipitation occurred relatively rapid from the same fluid source (e.g. with consistent 154 Mn²⁺ Fe²⁺ composition) and/or under similar precipitation redox conditions. This 15 cm thick, 155 156 ~3 Ma Pliocene layer (section D-K) is essentially of the same age. For this reason, previous dating of this sample also considered a similar initial ²³⁴U/²³⁸U activity ratio for disequilibrium 157 correction (Mason et al., 2013; Vaks et al., 2013). The ASH-15 reference material consists of 158 the whole Pliocene section that terminates with a sharp transition to the darker Pleistocene 159 layers above it (section A-C; see Fig. 1b). About 3 kg of ASH-15 sample are excavated from 160 the Ashalim Cave (Fig. 1a), and potentially much more can be sampled in the future (we 161 estimate more than 10 kg of sample; Fig. 1b). The ASH-15 flowstone is therefore a good 162 candidate for a reference material because of its large volume, high U concentrations, and 163 potentially homogenous age which will be examine next. 164



Figure 2. ASH-15D-E thin-section. (a) cross-polarized (XPL) scan, 36 mm long, showing
continuous growth (no hiatus), and consistent growth direction (indicated with yellow arrow).
Spot analyses are targeted either sub-parallel to growth zone or sub-parallel to growth direction;
(b) close-up on spot array analyses (location is shown in a) with 85 µm diameter; (c) CL image
showing no luminescence except for some bright luminescence within grains boundaries and
veins (arrows).

172 **3** Methods

165

173 **3.1** Elemental mapping

The sample ASH-15 was cut perpendicular to the growth zone of section D and E (see Fig.1b) 174 in order to examine heterogeneities across growth zone and within. Thin-sections were then 175 176 examined under plane- and cross-polarized light (XPL/PPL), and cathodoluminescence (CL) microscopy (Fig. 2). The central part of the thin-section was also analyzed for elemental 177 distribution of selected elements. The elemental maps were measured via LA-ICPMS, carried 178 out on a 193 nm ArF excimer laser ablation system (Analyte G2 Teledyne Photon Machines 179 180 Inc., Bozeman MT) coupled to an ICP-QMS (Agilent 7900, Agilent Technologies, Santa Clara CA). The laser was equipped with a Photon Machines HelEx II ablation chamber and an 181 Aerosol Rapid Introduction System (ARIS). The experiments were carried out using 182 acquisition parameters (both on the ICP and on the laser) modelled using the approach of van 183

Elteren et al (2019; 2018) to avoid artefacts (e.g., aliasing, smear, blur). All images (500x500 pixels) were acquired using a 20 μ m square beam, fluence of 3.5 Jcm⁻², 294 Hz repetition rate and dosage of 10 (10 overlapping pulses per spot size which amount to a scanning speed of 588 μ ms⁻¹). The masses monitored were ⁸⁸Sr, ¹³⁷Ba, ²⁰⁶Pb, ²⁰⁸Pb, ²³²Th, and ²³⁸U and the images were constructed using Photon Machines' HDIP data reduction software (van Malderen, 2017).

190 **3.2** LA-MC-ICPMS spot analyses

A thin section of ASH-15 was dated by U-Pb laser ablation multi-collector inductively coupled 191 plasma mass spectrometry (LA-MC-ICPMS) following the method described in Nuriel et al. 192 (2017). A Nu Plasma 3D was employed in conjunction with a Photon Machines Excite 193nm 193 Excimer laser equipped with a HelEex two volume cell. The laser was fired for 15 s during 194 analysis, using a repetition rate of 10 Hz, a spot size of 85 µm, and a fluence of approx. 1 J/cm². 195 The Nu Plasma 3D allows for the simultaneous acquisition of ²³⁸U, ²³⁵U, ²³²Th, ²⁰⁸Pb, ²⁰⁷Pb, 196 ²⁰⁶Pb, ²⁰⁴Pb(+Hg), and ²⁰²Hg, where ²³⁸U-²³²Th are measured on Faraday detectors and the low-197 198 side masses are measured on Daly detectors. Instrumental mass-bias was corrected using a two-step approach: both the ²⁰⁷Pb/²⁰⁶Pb and ²⁰⁶Pb/²³⁸U ratios were first corrected to NIST-614 199 glass reference material in *Iolite 3* using the geochronology reduction scheme (Paton et al., 200 2010) to account for both mass-bias (207Pb/206Pb) and instrumental drift (207Pb/206Pb and 201 ²⁰⁶Pb/²³⁸U). The Tera-Wasserburg data, output from *Iolite*, was then plotted and ²⁰⁶Pb/²³⁸U 202 ratios of all RMs and unknowns were adjusted such that the primary calcite reference 203 material—WC-1—yielded an age of 254 Ma (Roberts et al., 2017). This resulted in accurate 204 dates for both our secondary calcite RM: Duff Brown Tank at 66.8 ± 3.4 Ma (previously 205 reported 64 Ma; Hill et al., 2016) and a 207 Pb/ 206 Pb date of zircon RM at 566.0 ± 2.8 Ma 206 (previously reported 564 Ma; Gehrels et al., 2008). Uncertainty propagation of individual ratios 207 208 was assessed by reproducibility of the NIST614 and SL RMs (n=44 in both cases) and added

in quadrature such that the MSWD of each weighted average is ≤ 1 and that the uncertainty is 209 no better than 2% (long-term reproducibility); this resulted in propagated uncertainties of 2.5% 210 and 2% for the ²⁰⁶Pb/²³⁸U and ²⁰⁷Pb/²⁰⁶Pb ratios, respectively. Given that the typical 211 uncertainties of the ²⁰⁶Pb/²³⁸U and ²⁰⁷Pb/²⁰⁶Pb ratios of the unknowns was >10% and >3%, 212 respectively, the uncertainty propagation on individual ratios had little effect on the calculation 213 of the final date of ASH-15. The thin section of ASH-15 was measured both parallel to the 214 215 length of section (303 spots, and perpendicular to it (101 spots). Data are plotted using Isoplot (Ludwig, 1998). 216

217

218 3.3 LA-ICPMS spot analyses

Analyses were conducted at the Geochronology and Tracers Facility, British Geological 219 220 Survey (Nottingham, UK). The instrumentation comprised a New Wave Research 193UC excimer laser ablation system fitted with a TV2 cell, coupled to a Nu Instruments Attom single 221 collector ICP-MS. The method follows the protocols described in Roberts and Walker (2016) 222 and Roberts et al. (2017). Laser parameters varied slightly per session, but typically involve a 223 pre-ablation cleaning spot of 150 μ m, fired at 10 Hz with a fluence of ~6 J/cm² for 2 seconds, 224 and ablation conditions of 80-100 μ m spots, fired at 10 Hz with a fluence of ~6-8 J/cm² for 25-225 30 seconds. A 60 second background is taken before every set of standard-bracketed analyses, 226 227 and a 5 second washout is left between each ablation. Normalization of Pb-Pb ratios is achieved using NIST614 glass (values of Woodhead and Hergt, 2001), and WC-1 carbonate for Pb-U 228 ratios (Roberts et al., 2017). Data reduction uses the Time Resolved Analysis function of the 229 Nu Instruments Attolab software, and an excel spreadsheet, with uncertainty propagation 230 231 following the recommendations of Horstwood et al. (2016).

232

233 **3.4 ID-TIMS U-Pb geochronology**

Isotope dilution thermal ionization mass spectrometry (ID-TIMS) U-Pb geochronology was 234 performed at the Institute of Geochemistry and Petrology of ETH Zurich (ETHZ) and at the 235 Department of Earth Sciences of the University of Geneva (UNIGE). Millimetre-sized chips 236 of the ASH-15-D and ASH-15-K calcite were extracted using stainless steel tools. Larger chips 237 were further sub-divided resulting in ~1-7 mg aliquots. Individual chips were transferred into 238 3 ml Savillex beakers and repeatedly ultrasonically cleaned in ultrapure acetone and water. 239 Cleaned sampled were transferred into pre-cleaned 3 ml Savillex beakers, spiked with ~5-10 240 mg EARTHTIME (²⁰²Pb-)²⁰⁵Pb-²³³U-²³⁵U tracer solution (Condon et al., 2015) and dissolved 241 242 in 6N HCl at 120°C on a hotplate for ~30 minutes to assure complete dissolution and samplespike equilibration. Dissolved samples were dried down and redissolved in 1N HBr. Uranium 243 and Pb were separated using a single-column (50 µl, AG1-X8 resin) HBr-HCl anion exchange 244 chemistry. The Pb fraction was dried down with a drop of H₃PO₄ after a single column pass. 245 Uranium was dried down, redissolved in 3N HCl and further purified with a HCl-based second 246 column pass before drying it down with a drop of H₃PO₄. Uranium and Pb were loaded on 247 outgassed single Re filaments with ~1 µl of Si-gel emitter for thermal ionization mass 248 spectrometry. Uranium and Pb isotope ratios were measured on a Thermo TRITON Plus at 249 250 ETHZ and a Thermo TRITON at UNIGE. Lead isotopes were measured on the axial secondary electron multiplier employing dynamic peak-hopping routine collecting masses (202), 204, 205, 251 206, 207 and 208. Measured Pb isotope ratios were corrected for mass fractionation either using 252 253 the double spike (ETHZ) or using a mass fractionation factor of 0.15 ± 0.03 %/amu for single Pb spiked samples (UNIGE). Uranium isotope ratios were measured as uranium-oxide (UO₂) 254 employing a static measurement routine with Faraday cups connected to amplifiers with 10^{13} 255 ohm feedback resistors (von Quadt et al., 2016; Wotzlaw et al., 2017). Isotope ratios were 256 corrected for isobaric interferences from minor UO₂ isotopologues (Wotzlaw et al., 2017) and 257

for mass fractionation using the double spike assuming a $^{238}U/^{235}U$ ratio of 137.818 \pm 0.045 258 (Hiess et al., 2012) for sample and blank. Total procedural Pb blanks for the HBr-based 259 chemistry at ETHZ are consistently between 0.2 and 0.4 pg. We therefore attribute up to 0.4 260 pg to laboratory blank with the remaining common Pb being attributed to initial common Pb. 261 Total procedural blanks measured at UNIGE yielded an average of 1.15 pg that was taken as 262 the laboratory blank contribution. Data reduction and uncertainty propagation was performed 263 264 using Tripoli and an Microsoft Excel-based spreadsheet that uses the algorithms of Schmitz and Schoene (2007). Isochron calculations were performed using IsoplotR (Vermeesch, 2018). 265 266 All uncertainties are reported at 95% confidence ignoring systematic uncertainties associated with the tracer calibration and decay constants unless otherwise stated. 267

268 4 Results

All analyses were performed on ASH-15-D-K yellow Pliocene layer, abbreviated here as
"ASH-15" unless specification of ASH-15-D, E etc. is indicated. The ASH-15-A-C brown
Pleistocene layer is not part of the ASH-15 suggested reference material.

272 4.1 LA elemental mapping

Elemental mapping for ⁸⁸Sr, ¹³⁷Ba, ²⁰⁶Pb, ²⁰⁸Pb, ²³⁸U and ²³⁸U/²⁰⁶Pb ratio shows that the 273 distribution of most elements is relatively homogeneous (Fig.3), and in good accordance with 274 the luminescence data. Higher intensities for ²³⁸U and ⁸⁸Sr were observed along grain 275 boundaries and discontinuities, whereas Pb and the rest of the trace elements are more 276 homogeneously distributed, arguing for steady environmental conditions during the deposition. 277 278 Ten random regions of interest (ROI) were selected throughout the sample to mimic 10 spot analysis carried out at 85-90 microns spot size – just like one would do for U-Pb geochronology. 279 These ROIs were generated by drawing on the map circular regions with the radius of 85 or 90 280 microns in diameter. The pixels comprising each ROI were pooled together as representing the 281

equivalent of a single spot analysis. The statistical data for each cluster (data are given in 282 supplementary file) were compared. The average values for all pixel data are within 2 standard 283 errors and in good agreement, indicating that, at least based on the elemental distribution we 284 measured, the sample is relatively homogeneous for a natural sample. To further investigate 285 the chemical homogeneity of the sample, a random transect through one of the growth zones 286 was drawn and the signal intensities for ²³⁸U were extracted. The transect data also indicate 287 that ²³⁸U variations are within 2 standard errors of the average value (full data is available in 288 Table S1 in the supplement). 289



290

Figure 3. Signal intensity maps of ASH-15. For ²³⁸U/²⁰⁶Pb, ⁸⁸Sr, ¹³⁷Ba, ²⁰⁶Pb, ²⁰⁸Pb, and ²³⁸U
(a-d). The plotted signal was corrected for blank and analytical drift of the instrumentation.
Note that each distribution map has its own signal intensity scale. The position of the regions
of interest and transect is shown in (a). The circles designating the location of the regions of
interest are not at scale (data is available in Table S1 in the supplement).

296 4.2 LA-MC-ICPMS spot analyses

Data and calculated ages for the LA-MC-ICPMS transects are shown in Tera-Wasserburg 297 space in Fig. 4 (n = 379 of 412 total spots). Analyses rejected from the age calculation include 298 those with ${}^{207}\text{Pb}/{}^{206}\text{Pb}$ uncertainties larger than 0.1% (n = 2) and those with high common-Pb 299 contents (²⁰⁸Pb cps >5000; n = 17). A further 14 spots plotted below the array; these data 300 represent the first 1–2 mm of spots of the lengthwise transect (lower right in Fig. 2a), and 301 suggest that a small percent of ASH-15 may behave differently during ablation and/or may 302 303 have been subsequently modified after crystallization; upon inspection, this portion of the section contains more pore space and impurities than the majority of the section. The remaining 304 305 379 define a normally distributed array with a lower intercept age of 2.952 ± 0.043 Ma (MSWD) = 2.5), which is well within uncertainty of the new ID-TIMS data presented (full data is 306 available in Table S2 in the supplement). The calculated upper intercept of each transect is 307 equivalent and within 1% of the common Pb composition calculated from the ID-TIMS data. 308 Not surprisingly, the lengthwise transect reveals a larger spread in common/radiogenic Pb 309 ratios; this transect crosses more growth zones and has a higher probability of sampling a 310 variety of concentrations of both Pb and U. Conversely, the more limited spread in 311 common/radiogenic Pb ratios appears to reflect the limited sampling of growth zones, and 312 would suggest that individual growth zones contain a relatively limited range of concentrations 313 in U and Pb. The slightly higher MSWD for the lengthwise transect (2.7) relative to the growth 314 zone transect (2.5) could also reflect these inherited compositional differences during growth 315 316 history, and a resulted "mixing" or "averaging" of different growth phase along calcite continuous growth. 317

Variations of ASH-15 ages during 20 different runs (with 5-30 spot analysis in each) using both single-collector and multi-collector ICP-MS are shown in Fig. 4b (full data is available in Tables S3-S5 in the supplement). The ages are calculated using IsoplotR, not anchored to specific common-lead, and are not corrected for disequilibrium. Although there is a large scatter in the ages of the different runs the average ages (marked with black box) plot close tothe new ID-TIMS ages, or are slightly younger in age.



Figure 4. LA-MC-ICPMS analyses of calcite ASH-15. (a) Tera-Wasserburg concordia space 325 326 plot (n=385) for spots analysis within lengthwise transect (green) and along growth zone transect (red). Calculated age, 2^o error and MSWD are given for both and for all spots together; 327 (full data is available in Table S2 in the supplement); (b) Variations of ASH-15 ages during 328 different runs using both single-collector (at the British Geological Survey) and multi-collector 329 (at University of California Santa Barbara) ICP-MS. Ages are calculated using WC1 as primary 330 RM; the new ID-TIMS age is indicated with a grey line; (full data is available in Table S3-S5 331 in the supplement). 332

333 4.3 Down-hole fractionation

Reference material is important for correction of both laser-induced elemental fractionation (LIEF) and plasma-related ionization efficiency. Ideally, the reference material should resemble the unknown samples as much as possible in terms of its chemistry (e.g. Mg and Fe content), texture (i.e. micritic, crystalline), and age. The WC1 and ASH15 are both low-Mg calcite but they are very different in textures and age. The ASH15 is a ~3 Ma, well-crystallized elongated calcite (up to 1 cm) and WC1 is a 254 Ma recrystallized botryoidal calcite, formed 340 after aragonite. Despite these differences, both WC1 and ASH15 display a very similar downhole fractionation pattern (Fig. 5d). Fig. 5 shows stacked integration plots of the down-hole 341 raw ²⁰⁶Pb/ ²³⁸U ratio of different RMs including, the ASH15, WC-1, and Duff Brown Tank 342 (Black and Gulson, 1978). The ASH15 displays much larger scatter in the raw data (Fig. 5a) in 343 comparison to both WC1 and Duff Brown Tank (Fig. 5b-c), however, the average value vielded 344 identical down-hole fractionation to that of WC-1 (Fig. 5d). Duff Brown Tank is also consistent 345 with the down-hole patterns but less steep in comparison to WC1 and ASH15 (Fig. 5d). This 346 comparison suggests that down-hole fractionation and laser-induced elemental fractionation 347 348 (LIEF) are similar among the different RMs. It is thus suggested that differences in measured and expected ²⁰⁶Pb/²³⁸U ratios in calcite material are likely to be caused mostly by plasma-349 ionization differences between unknown samples and RMs. 350



Figure 5. Stacked integration plots of raw ²⁰⁷Pb-corrected ²⁰⁶Pb/²³⁸U ratios for calcite reference materials ASH-15, WC-1, and Duff Brown Tank. The low Pb concentration in ASH-15 yields more scatter, but average slopes of all RMs are similar, with 1-2% change in age over 10 seconds (100 pulses) of ablation. The results suggest minimal differences in down-hole fractionation of the different RMs.

357 4.4 ID-TIMS results

Twelve aliquots of ASH-15D analyzed at ETHZ yielded ²³⁸U/²⁰⁶Pb ratios between 1096 and 358 2084 and ²⁰⁷Pb/²⁰⁶Pb ratios between 0.0825 and 0.4403 (full data is available in Table S6 in the 359 supplement). Plotted in Tera-Wasserburg space, these data yield a single isochron with an 360 initial 207 Pb/ 206 Pb of 0.832 ± 0.015 (uncertainties are 95% confidence intervals) and a concordia 361 intercept age of 2.967 ± 0.022 Ma (Fig. 6a). The elevated mean square weighted deviation 362 (MSWD) of 12 is attributed to minor heterogeneities, most likely in the initial ²⁰⁷Pb/²⁰⁶Pb ratio 363 of the speleothem calcite. Twelve aliquots of ASH-15K analyzed at ETHZ returned ²³⁸U/²⁰⁶Pb 364 ratios between 723 and 2094 and ²⁰⁷Pb/²⁰⁶Pb ratios between 0.0720 and 0.5677. In Tera-365 Wasserburg space, eleven out of twelve aliquots define a isochron with an initial ²⁰⁷Pb/²⁰⁶Pb of 366 0.8314 ± 0.0040 and a concordia intercept age of 2.964 ± 0.016 Ma (Fig. 6b). A single aliquot 367 (#5.4) plots significantly below the isochron defined by the other aliquots. The elevated MSWD 368 of 34 together with the single outlier suggest some heterogeneities in the initial ²⁰⁷Pb/²⁰⁶Pb of 369 the ASH-15K calcite. Thirteen aliquots of ASH-15K analyzed at UNIGE (pink color, Fig. 6b) 370 yielded ²³⁸U/²⁰⁶Pb ratios between 433 and 1853 and and ²⁰⁷Pb/²⁰⁶Pb ratios ranging from 0.1856 371 to 0.6660. Twelve of the thirteen analyses yield best-fit line with an initial ²⁰⁷Pb/²⁰⁶Pb of 0.814 372 \pm 0.019 and a Concordia intercept age of 2.947 \pm 0.065 Ma. The elevated MSWD of 36 373 confirms the minor heterogeneity of the initial ²⁰⁷Pb/²⁰⁶Pb. 374

The excellent agreement between the ASH-15D and ASH-15K datasets indicates that the entire speleothem growth layer between these two growth zones is of equivalent age with minor heterogeneities in the initial 207 Pb/ 206 Pb ratio and justifies combining the data into a single isochron regression. The combined isochron, using 35 of 37 analyzed aliquots, yields an initial 207 Pb/ 206 Pb of 0.8306 ± 0.0033 and a concordia intercept age of 2.965 ± 0.011 Ma with a MSWD of 35 (Fig. 6c). We consider the results of the combined regression as the best reference value for using ASH-15 as a primary reference material.

The new TIMS data provide the most extended bulk investigation of the ASH-15 sample, with 382 a total of 37 sub-samples that are separated from bottom (K, n=25) to top (D, n=12). The high 383 MSWD of 35 is suggested to reflect true heterogeneities of the dated material, possibly related 384 to impurities that are concentrated within grain boundaries (as suggested by CL and elemental 385 mapping). We re-calculated previously determined isochron ages of Vaks et al. (2013) and 386 Mason et al. (2013; Fig. 7). We obtained concordia intercept ages of 3.0088 ± 0.053 Ma for 387 ASH-15-D (MSWD=11; n=5) and 3.0153 ± 0.042 Ma for ASH-15-K (MSWD=14; n=5) of 388 Vaks et al. (2013) and 3.0015 ± 0.029 for ASH-15-D (MSWD=2; n=5) of Mason et al. (2013). 389 390 These ages are largely overlapping within uncertainty with our new ID-TIMS age of $2.965 \pm$ 0.011 Ma (Fig. 7; and data in Table S7 in the supplements). The apparent minor systematic 391 offset towards slightly older ages is attributed to the lower number of aliquots in the MC-392 393 ICPMS datasets combined with the heterogeneous initial Pb isotope composition. For laser ablation U-Pb work, we recommend the use of the new ID-TIMS age because of the large 394 number of sub-samples (n=37), and the small aliquots (1-7 mg) that are more representative of 395 laser-ablation spot analysis. In addition, the use of the precisely and accurately calibrated 396 EARTHTIME tracer solutions (Condon et al., 2015) and the online mass fractionation 397 correction provided by the double Pb and double U tracer are an important advantage of this 398 method. The excellent interlaboratory reproducibility gives us additional confidences that our 399 ID-TIMS data provide the most accurate characterization of the U-Pb systematics of the ASH-400 401 15 calcite for use as a primary reference material.



Figure 6. ID-TIMS U-Pb results for ASH-15D, ASH-15K, and for both ASH-15D+K
displayed in Tera-Wasserburg concordia space. Uncertainties on the initial ²⁰⁷Pb/²⁰⁶Pb ratios
and the intercept ages are reported at 95% confidence including overdispersion (Vermeesch,
2018).



Figure 7. Previous (re-calculated) and new ages of ASH-15 from isotope-dilution U-Pb
analysis. All ages are calculated using IsoplotR (Vermeesch, 2018), are not corrected for
disequilibrium and are not anchored to common-lead specific value (see data in Table S7 in
the supplements).

412 4.5 Calcite reference material

The U and Pb concentrations of carbonate materials vary greatly. Data compilation by Roberts et al. (2020; this issue) combined hundreds of carbonate samples from different origin such as diagenetic, biogenic, speleothem, and vein-fill. This compilation indicates several orders of magnitude differences in U and Pb concentrations of the different types of carbonate and the heterogeneity of spot analysis within each type or even a single sample. A modified representation of their data, excluding calcite vein-fill, which vary throughout the entire

compositional range, is shown together with the currently available calcite reference materials 419 (Fig. 8; and full data in Table S8 in the supplement). Note that both ASH15 and JT, display 420 much larger heterogeneity when measured by LA-ICPMS (small symbols) relative to ID-TIMS 421 (large symbols). Despite the high compositional heterogeneity of each of the reference material, 422 they show minimal overlap and together they cover most of the compositional range of the 423 presented carbonate material. WC1 (Roberts et al., 2017) with relatively high U and Pb 424 425 concentrations can easily be measured on less-sensitive ICP-MS such as quadrupole instruments, and is most appropriate to be used for dating vein-fill and diagenetic carbonates. 426 427 In contrast, the ASH15 flowstone, with relatively low Pb and high U concentration that are better measured on more-sensitive ICP-MS (e.g. new generation of single-collector and multi-428 collector ICP-MS), and is most appropriate for dating speleothem type carbonates. Finally the 429 JT (Guillong et al., 2020), with moderate U and Pb concentration can be used can be used for 430 most single- collector and multi-collector sector-field ICP-MS instrument as well as the newer 431 generation of quadrupole ICP-MS. Reference material with high Pb and low U or both low U 432 and Pb concentrations will further help to cover the full compositional range of carbonate 433 material but may introduce analytical challenges. 434

435



Figure 8. U and Pb concentrations of different carbonate samples and available reference materials. Large and small symbols for the reference materials indicate ID-TIMS and LA-ICPMS analyses, respectively. Note the minimal compositional overlap of the three reference materials (ASH15, WC1, and JT). Data for diagenetic, biogenic, and speleothem carbonates are from Roberts et al. (2020, this issue). Data for JT standard are from Guillong et al. (2020).

442

436

443 5 Conclusions

The ASH-15 speleothem calcite is characterized as a matrix matched reference material for LA-ICPMS U-Pb geochronology of calcite. ID-TIMS analyses of small 1-7 mg aliquots of two growth zones suggest sufficient homogeneity with a combined intercept age of 2.965 ± 0.011 Ma and an initial ²⁰⁷Pb/²⁰⁶Pb of 0.8315 ± 0.0026 . These data are recommended as the reference values for the ASH-15 calcite reference material. The excellent agreement between the two growth zones suggest that the entire interval between the two dated layers can be used with the same reference age. Compared to other calcite reference material (e.g. WC1), ASH-15 is more homogeneous but has lower radiogenic Pb content and therefore requires more sensitive
instruments (i.e. sector field rather than quadrupole mass spectrometers) to be used as a
reference material.

454

455 Author's contribution

456 PN: data processing and writing, JFW: ID-TIMS analysis and writing, MO: ID-TIMS

457 analysis, AV: sample collection and writing, CS: LA mapping analysis and writing, MS: LA

458 mapping analysis. NR: LA-ICPMS, data analysis and writing. AKC: LA-MC-ICPMS, data

459 analysis and writing.

460

461 **Competing interests**

462 The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.

463

464 Acknowledgements

We thank reviewers Fernando Corfu and Jon Woodhead as well as editor Axel Gerdes for constructive comments and suggestions. We thank Bar Elisha for thin-section preparation and Andrew Mason for constructive discussion. This study was funded by the Israel Science Foundation, Grant ISF-727/16.

469 Appendices







Figure A1. Photographs of ASH15 flowstone with layers D (light) and C (brown). Sampling localities of aliquots sampled for ID-TIMS analyses are indicated by numbers matching the aliquots in the data table. Larger pieces were chipped off using a stainless steel needle and subdivided into smaller aliquots for analysis.

470





Figure A2. Photographs of ASH15 flowstone with layers K (bottom) to D (top). Sampling localities of aliquots samples for ID-TIMS analyses within layer K are indicated with numbers (n=12) and are matching the aliquots in the data table.

471

472 **References:**

Anjiang, S., Anping, H., Cheng, T., Liang, F., Wenqing, P., Yuexing, F., and Zhao, J.: Laser ablation
in situ U-Pb dating and its application to diagenesis-porosity evolution of carbonate reservoirs, 46,
1127-1140, 2019.

- Condon, D., Schoene, B., McLean, N., Bowring, S., and Parrish, R.: Metrology and traceability of U–
 Pb isotope dilution geochronology (EARTHTIME Tracer Calibration Part I), Geochimica et
 Cosmochimica Acta, 164, 464-480, 2015.
- 479 Coogan, L. A., Parrish, R. R., and Roberts, N. M.: Early hydrothermal carbon uptake by the upper oceanic crust: Insight from in situ U-Pb dating, Geology, 44, 147-150, 2016.
- 481 Crouvi, O., Amit, R., Enzel, Y., and Gillespie, A. R.: Active sand seas and the formation of desert loess,
 482 Quaternary Science Reviews, 29, 2087-2098, 2010.
- 483 Godeau, N., Deschamps, P., Guihou, A., Leonide, P., Tendil, A., Gerdes, A., Hamelin, B., and Girard,
- 484 J.-P. J. G.: U-Pb dating of calcite cement and diagenetic history in microporous carbonate reservoirs:
- 485 Case of the Urgonian Limestone, France, 46, 247-250, 2018.
- Goodfellow, B. W., Viola, G., Bingen, B., Nuriel, P., and Kylander-Clark, A. R. C.: Palaeocene faulting
 in SE Sweden from U–Pb dating of slickenfibre calcite, Terra Nova, n/a-n/a, 10.1111/ter.12280, 2017.
- Guillong, M., Wotzlaw, J. F., Looser, N., and Laurent, O.: New analytical and data evaluation protocols
 to improve the reliability of U-Pb LA-ICP-MS carbonate dating, Geochronology Discuss., 2020, 1-17,
 10.5194/gchron-2019-20, 2020.
- Hansman, R. J., Albert, R., Gerdes, A., and Ring, U.: Absolute ages of multiple generations of brittle
 structures by U-Pb dating of calcite, Geology, 46, 207-210, 2018.
- Hiess, J., Condon, D. J., McLean, N., and Noble, S. R.: 238U/235U systematics in terrestrial uraniumbearing minerals, Science, 335, 1610-1614, 2012.
- Holdsworth, R., McCaffrey, K., Dempsey, E., Roberts, N., Hardman, K., Morton, A., Feely, M., Hunt,
- J., Conway, A., and Robertson, A.: Natural fracture propping and earthquake-induced oil migration in
 fractured basement reservoirs, Geology, 47, 700-704, 2019.
- Horstwood, M. S., Košler, J., Gehrels, G., Jackson, S. E., McLean, N. M., Paton, C., Pearson, N. J.,
 Sircombe, K., Sylvester, P., and Vermeesch, P.: Community-derived standards for LA-ICP-MS U-(Th-)
 Pb geochronology–Uncertainty propagation, age interpretation and data reporting, Geostandards and
 Geoanalytical Research, 40, 311-332, 2016.
- Li, Q., Parrish, R., Horstwood, M., and McArthur, J.: U–Pb dating of cements in Mesozoic ammonites,
 Chemical Geology, 376, 76-83, 2014.
- MacDonald, J., Faithfull, J., Roberts, N., Davies, A., Holdsworth, C., Newton, M., Williamson, S.,
 Boyce, A., John, C. J. C. t. M., and Petrology: Clumped-isotope palaeothermometry and LA-ICP-MS
 U–Pb dating of lava-pile hydrothermal calcite veins, 174, 63, 2019.
- Mason, A. J., Henderson, G. M., and Vaks, A.: An Acetic Acid-Based Extraction Protocol for the
 Recovery of U, Th and Pb from Calcium Carbonates for U-(Th)-Pb Geochronology, Geostandards and
 Geoanalytical Research, 37, 261-275, 10.1111/j.1751-908X.2013.00219.x, 2013.

- 510 Nuriel, P., Weinberger, R., Kylander-Clark, A. R. C., Hacker, B. R., and Craddock, J. P.: The onset of
- the Dead Sea transform based on calcite age-strain analyses, Geology, 45, 587-590, 10.1130/g38903.1, 511
- 512 2017.
- Nuriel, P., Craddock, J., Kylander-Clark, A. R., Uysal, I. T., Karabacak, V., Dirik, R. K., Hacker, B. R., 513 and Weinberger, R. J. G.: Reactivation history of the North Anatolian fault zone based on calcite age-514
- 515 strain analyses, 47, 465-469, 2019.
- Parrish, R. R., Parrish, C. M., and Lasalle, S.: Vein calcite dating reveals Pyrenean orogen as cause of 516
- 517 Paleogene deformation in southern England, Journal of the Geological Society, 10.1144/jgs2017-107, 2018. 518
- Piccione, G., Rasbury, E. T., Elliott, B. A., Kyle, J. R., Jaret, S. J., Acerbo, A. S., Lanzirotti, A., 519
- Northrup, P., Wooton, K., and Parrish, R. R.: Vein fluorite U-Pb dating demonstrates post-6.2 Ma rare-520
- 521 earth element mobilization associated with Rio Grande rifting, Geosphere, 15, 1958-1972, 2019.
- 522 Ring, U., and Gerdes, A.: Kinematics of the Alpenrhein-Bodensee graben system in the Central Alps: Oligocene/Miocene transtension due to formation of the Western Alps arc, Tectonics, 35, 1367-1391, 523 524 10.1002/2015TC004085/abstract, 2016.
- Roberts, N. M., and Walker, R. J.: U-Pb geochronology of calcite-mineralized faults: Absolute timing 525 of rift-related fault events on the northeast Atlantic margin, Geology, 44, 531-534, 2016. 526
- Roberts, N. M., Rasbury, E. T., Parrish, R. R., Smith, C. J., Horstwood, M. S., and Condon, D. J.: A 527 calcite reference material for LA-ICP-MS U-Pb geochronology, Geochemistry, Geophysics, 528 529 Geosystems, 2017.
- 530 Roberts, N. M. W., Drost, K., Horstwood, M. S. A., Condon, D. J., Chew, D., Drake, H., Milodowski,
- A. E., McLean, N. M., Smye, A. J., Walker, R. J., Haslam, R., Hodson, K., Imber, J., Beaudoin, N., and 531
- 532 Lee, J. K.: Laser ablation inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometry (LA-ICP-MS) U-Pb carbonate geochronology: strategies, progress, and limitations, Geochronology, 2, 33-61, 10.5194/gchron-2-33-533
- 534 2020, 2020.
- 535 Schmitz, M. D., and Schoene, B.: Derivation of isotope ratios, errors, and error correlations for U-Pb geochronology using 205Pb-235U-(233U)-spiked isotope dilution thermal ionization mass 536 537 spectrometric data, Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems, 8, 2007.
- Vaks, A., Bar-Matthews, M., Matthews, A., Ayalon, A., and Frumkin, A.: Middle-Late Quaternary 538 539 paleoclimate of northern margins of the Saharan-Arabian Desert: reconstruction from speleothems of 540 Negev Desert, Israel, Quaternary Science Reviews, 29, 2647-2662, 2010.
- Vaks, A., Woodhead, J., Bar-Matthews, M., Ayalon, A., Cliff, R. A., Zilberman, T., Matthews, A., and 541
- 542 Frumkin, A.: Pliocene-Pleistocene climate of the northern margin of Saharan-Arabian Desert recorded 543 in speleothems from the Negev Desert, Israel, Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 368, 88-100,
- http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2013.02.027, 2013. 544
- van Elteren, J. T., Šelih, V. S., Šala, M., Van Malderen, S. J., and Vanhaecke, F.: Imaging artifacts in 545 continuous scanning 2D LA-ICPMS imaging due to nonsynchronization issues, Analytical chemistry, 546 547 90, 2896-2901, 2018.
- van Elteren, J. T., Šelih, V. S., and Šala, M.: Insights into the selection of 2D LA-ICP-MS (multi) 548 elemental mapping conditions, Journal of Analytical Atomic Spectrometry, 34, 1919-1931, 2019. 549
- 550 van Malderen, S.: Optimization of methods based on laser ablation-ICP-mass spectrometry (LA-ICP-551
 - MS) for 2-D and 3-D elemental mapping, Ghent University, 2017.

552 Vermeesch, P.: IsoplotR: A free and open toolbox for geochronology, Geoscience Frontiers, 2018.

von Quadt, A., Wotzlaw, J.-F., Buret, Y., Large, S. J., Peytcheva, I., and Trinquier, A.: High-precision
 zircon U/Pb geochronology by ID-TIMS using new 10 13 ohm resistors, Journal of Analytical Atomic
 Spectrometry, 31, 658-665, 2016.

Woodhead, J., and Petrus, J. J. G.: Exploring the advantages and limitations of in situ U–Pb carbonate
 geochronology using speleothems, 1, 69-84, 2019.

558 Woodhead, J. D., and Hergt, J. M.: Strontium, neodymium and lead isotope analyses of NIST glass 559 certified reference materials: SRM 610, 612, 614, Geostandards Newsletter, 25, 261-266, 2001.

560 Wotzlaw, J.-F., Buret, Y., Large, S. J., Szymanowski, D., and von Quadt, A.: ID-TIMS U–Pb 561 geochronology at the 0.1‰ level using 10 13 Ω resistors and simultaneous U and 18 O/16 O isotope 562 ratio determination for accurate UO 2 interference correction, Journal of Analytical Atomic 563 Spectrometry, 32, 579-586, 2017.

564