



## ***Interactive comment on “The closure temperature(s) of zircon Raman dating” by Birk Härtel et al.***

**Airton Dias (Referee)**

diasanc@ufscar.br

Received and published: 15 March 2021

Authors: Birk Hartel, Raymond Jonckheere, Bastian Wauschkuhn, and Lothar Ratschbacher Ms. Title: THE CLOSURE TEMPERATURE(S) OF ZIRCON RAMAN DATING

GENERAL COMMENTS:

I suggest that the article be ACCEPTED.

I have no serious corrections to the manuscript. It is very well written and the description of the results (content and figures) is excellent.

I make a single suggestion in order to increase the reference base of the manuscript

C1

and a single question on a methodological level. In addition, I make some technical suggestions for improving the text.

SPECIFIC COMMENTS:

There are some points that should be addressed by the authors to improve the quality of the paper.

1) I suggest reading the article by Dias et al., 2020 (doi:10.1166/jnn.2020.17172). It is related to the content of this article. It may be an updated reference.

2) In the METHODS AND MATERIALS (2.2 RAMAN SPECTROMETRY), the laser used in the experiments is presented: 488 nm - line 64. I would like to know why this laser was used instead of laser regularly applied (514 and 633 nm)? What are the advantages of using laser 488 nm? Finally, I would like to receive more information to justify this choice. I even think that such information should be included in the text (even succinctly).

TECHNICAL CORRECTIONS:

• All manuscript: change “fission track” by “fission-track”

• Introduction, line 21: remove the word “of”. It is unnecessary.

• Introduction, line 47: change “Our aim is” by “We aim”.

• Annealing experiments, line 78: change “one hour” by “one-hour”.

• Changes in band position and width, line 84: change “is” by “are”.

• Changes in band position and width, line 89: insert “a” before “slope”.

• Changes in band position and width, line 91: remove the word “the” before “stage”. It is unnecessary.

• Changes in band position and width, line 97: remove the word “the” before “stage”. It is unnecessary.

C2

• Changes in band position and width, line 104: insert “s” after “stage”.

• Changes in band position and width, line 123: remove the word “of” before “the decrease”. It is unnecessary.

• Kinetic modeling and closure temperature, line 154: change “age” by “ages”.

• Kinetic modeling and closure temperature, line 161: remove the word “an” before “activation”. It is unnecessary.

• Kinetic modeling and closure temperature, line 173: change “are” by “is”.

• Kinetic modeling and closure temperature, line 191: remove the word “the” before “faster”. It is unnecessary.

• Kinetic modeling and closure temperature, line 196: remove “,” after “timescales”.

• Kinetic modeling and closure temperature, line 206: remove “a” before “lower”. It is unnecessary.

• Conclusions, line 249: change “for” by “of”.

• Conclusions, line 252: change “for” by “in”.

---

Interactive comment on Geochronology Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/gchron-2020-39>, 2020.